Ural Federal University

Volume 3 No.3 2019

Online ISSN: 2587-8964
Print ISSN: 2587-6104

Changing Societies & Personalities

Changing Societies & Personalities

Online ISSN 2587-8964
Print ISSN 2587-6104

2019, Vol. 3, No. 3

Published **quarterly**
Founded in **2016**

Founder and Publisher:

Ural Federal University named after the first President of Russia Boris N. Yeltsin.
Address: 19 Mira street, Yekaterinburg, Russia, 620002

Journal contact information:

51 Lenin Avenue, room 240, Yekaterinburg, Russia, 620000
Phone: +7 (343) 389-9412
E-mail: editor@changing-sp.com
Web: https://changing-sp.com

The Journal is registered by the Federal Agency for Supervision in the Sphere of Telecomunication, Information Technologies and Mass Communication, Certificate of Registration: ПИ № ФС77–65509 from May 4, 2016

Aims and Scope:

Changing Societies & Personalities is an international, peer-reviewed quarterly journal, published in English by the Ural Federal University. *CS&P* examines how rapid societallevel changes are reshaping individual-level beliefs, motivations and values – and how these individual-level changes in turn are reshaping societies. The interplay of personality traits and sociocultural factors in defining motivation, deliberation, action and reflection of individuals requires a combination of theoretical and empirical knowledge. Since an interdisciplinary approach is needed to understand the causes and consequences of the contemporary world's changing socio-political institutions, moral values, and religious beliefs, the journal welcomes theoretical and empirical contributions from a wide range of perspectives in the context of value pluralism and social heterogeneity of (post)modern society.

Topics of interest include, but are not limited to

- value implications of interactions between socio-political transformations and personal self-identity;
- changes in value orientations, materialist and post-materialist values;
- moral reasoning and behavior;
- variability and continuity in the election of styles of moral regime and/or religious identity;
- the moral bases of political preferences and their elimination;
- social exclusion and inclusion;
- post-secular religious individualism;
- tolerance and merely "tolerating": their meanings, varieties and fundamental bases;
- ideologies of gender and age as variables in political, moral, religious and social change;
- educational strategies as training for specific social competences;
- social and existential security.

The journal publishes original research articles, forum discussions, review articles and book reviews.

https://changing-sp.com/ojs/index.php/csp/index

Changing Societies & Personalities, 2019
Vol. 3, No. 3

CONTENTS

Changing Societies & Personalities, 2019
Vol. 3, No. 3, pp. 186–188
http://dx.doi.org/10.15826/csp.2019.3.3.070

EDITORIAL

Editor's Note

The present issue of *Changing Societies & Personalities* is devoted to such significant topics as changing values of higher education in various social contexts; a symbolic dialogue between the past and the present on the example of socialist urban spaces; novel museum practices; and popular media myths.

In his article *The Anatomy of a Moral Panic: Western Mainstream Media's Russia Scapegoat,* Greg Simons reflects upon a phenomenon defined as "moral panic" in covering the news about Russia in Western mainstream media. The author intends to separate myths from reality in journalism, mainly the myth of the "fourth estate", in which journalism is widely defined as "a defender of public interests and a watchdog on the workings of government" possessing power over people, political actors and institutions. Instead, the social role of journalism is viewed through ethical terms. Using the concept of "moral panic" as a means of social and political control, Simons reviews dozens of media texts that interpret the news from Russia as the evidence of "threat", as well as those that "are pushing back against the moral panic of the Russia threat narrative through deconstructing its logic, argumentation and evidence". In general, Simons considers the "moral panic" concept to be part of a multi-levelled crisis of liberal democracy in the contemporary world.

In their article *Religion in Public Life: Rethinking the Visibility and Role of Religion as an Ethical Resource in the Transformation of the Higher Education Landscape in Post-1990 Zambia,* Nelly Mwale and Melvin Simuchimba explore the growing public role of religion in post-1990 Zambia by analysing the recent engagement of the Roman Catholic Church in Zambia university education. Prior to gaining independence in 1964, Zambia featured neither public, nor private universities. In the 1990s, changes in the legislation provided new possibilities for various entities, including religious bodies, to establish educational institutions. Therefore, Catholic Universities and seminary are a relatively new enterprise in the country. According to the authors, despite the present visibility of religion both in public life and higher education, the case of Zambia attracts little scholarly interest in comparison with other African contexts, e.g. Nigeria or South Africa. The

Received 22 September 2019
Published online 5 October 2019

stepanova.elena.a@gmail.com

authors express hope that the insights gained during their research could be useful for "providing a window through which religion's visibility in public life could be understood in post-1990 Zambia". The study is based on interviews with representatives of the Catholic Church and Zambia Catholic University education. The impact of Christian higher education on students' knowledge acquisition and moral formation is analysed, along with its role in building the nation.

Marina Volkova, Jol Stoffers, Dmitry Kochetkov, in their article *Education Projects for Sustainable Development: Evidence from Ural Federal University,* argue that the concept of sustainable development should be part of mentality developed starting from a child's early age; therefore, the role of school as a way of improving the general culture of people in the sphere of sustainable development should not be underestimated. Unfortunately, the topic of sustainable development is yet to be properly developed in Russia. According to the authors, "sustainable development requires not only skills and competencies but formation of stable patterns of thinking. It is the point where secondary education comes to the forefront since the establishment of mental models at an early age is much more effective". Using the case study methodology as a research basis, the authors analyse the experience of the Ural Federal University in creating partnership with secondary schools in Yekaterinburg and demonstrate the potential of schoolchildren's and college students' teamwork aimed at developing the skills of proactive thinking in solving environmental problems.

Mikhail Ilchenko's article *Discourse of Modernist Heritage and New Ways of Thinking about Socialist Urban Areas in Eastern Europe,* addresses the issue of controversial attitudes towards socialist urban heritage. Ilchenko finds such attitudes both in today's Russia and some East European cities in some East European cities alarming, because socialist buildings and neighbourhoods remain to be essential elements of the urban space. Ilchenko observes an increasing scholarly interest to the urban modernist heritage of the former Soviet republics and former East European socialist countries, and concludes that the modernist architecture is viewed as "an embodiment of critical historical periods – periods of social experimentation and radical cultural change, which still largely determine the appearance and identity of post-socialist cities", thus involved into a symbolic dialogue with the past. The article provides valuable information about the construction of so-called *sotsgorod* (socialist city) and its former meaning in the context of global trends in town-planning and art, using the examples of the Uralmash district in Yekaterinburg (Russia), sotsgorod(s) in Kharkiv (Ukraine), Katowice, and Krakow (Poland). Ilchenko concludes that the discourse of modernist heritage offers a renewed vision for socialist urban legacy, and thus "stimulates symbolic re-discovering of the socialist urban areas in public mind and allows them to acquire new ways of representation as well as the new possible functional roles in the urban space".

Elena Kochukhova investigates new museum practices, such as art mediation, in her article *Transformation of Museum Communication through Art Mediation: The Case of the 4th Ural Industrial Biennial of Contemporary Art.* She views art mediation as a practice, which radically changes forms and methods of museum

communication. As Kochuhova points out, “traditional museum communication formats are hierarchical while new formats, on the contrary, should be horizontal. The basic principle of art mediation is to make the viewers’ voices be heard”; thus, new understanding of museum communication enables the visitors to get involved in the work of museums as equal partners. Art mediation is widely discussed not only among the professional museum community, but also among academic circles in Russia and other European countries. Kochuhova explores the experience of the 4th Ural Industrial Biennial of Contemporary Art, which took place in the fall of 2017 in the city of Yekaterinburg. She analyses several interviews with art mediators and make conclusions on the factors that define the process of transformation of museum practices from being a description of art objects towards their interpretation, thus producing new meanings.

In the Book Review on *J. W. Scott, Sex and Secularism (Princeton University Press, 2018)* Andrey Menshikov stresses that the book could be useful for those who are interested in the origins of secularist discourse, particularly in the sphere of gender.

Discussions around the topics raised in the present issue will be continued in the subsequent issues of our journal. In planning to introduce new interesting themes, we welcome suggestions from our readers and prospective authors for thematic issues, debate sections or book reviews.

For more information, please visit our journal web-site: https://changing-sp.com/

Elena A. Stepanova,
Editor-in-Chief

Changing Societies & Personalities, 2019
Vol. 3, No. 3, pp. 189–206
http://dx.doi.org/10.15826/csp.2019.3.3.071

ARTICLE

The Anatomy of a Moral Panic: Western Mainstream Media's Russia Scapegoat

Greg Simons
Uppsala University, Sweden
Turiba University, Latvia
Ural Federal University, Yekaterinburg, Russia

ABSTRACT
Since 2014, there has been a very concerted campaign launched by the neo-liberal Western mainstream mass media against Russia. The format and content suggest that this is an attempt to induce a moral panic among the Western publics. It seems to be intended to create a sense of fear and to switch the logic to a series of emotionally-based reactions to assertion propaganda. Russia has been variously blamed for many different events and trends around the world, such as the "destroying" of Western "democracy", and democratic values. In many regards, Russia is projected as being an existential threat in both the physical and intangible realms. This paper traces the strategic messages and narratives of the "Russia threat" as it is presented in Western mainstream media. Russia is connoted as a scapegoat for the failings of the neo-liberal democratic political order to maintain its global hegemony; therefore, Russia is viewed as the "menacing" other and a desperate measure to halt this gradual decline and loss of power and influence. This ultimately means that this type of journalism fails in its supposed fourth estate role, by directly aiding the hegemonic political power.

KEYWORDS
moral panic, Western mainstream media, Russia, propaganda, scapegoating, fourth estate

Received 28 July 2019
Accepted 13 September 2019
Published online 5 October 2019

gregmons@yahoo.com

Introduction

Moral panic has been developed as a concept within sociology and came to greater attention after Stanley Cohen's 1972 book on *Folk Devils and Moral Panic*. This detailed the often irrational, but widespread fear that something or someone was a threat to the values, safety and security of society. It is something that is often exploited by politicians and journalists, where public panic can be operationalised as a means of social and political control.

Moral panics tend to have a tendency to serve the interests of the hegemonic political and economic order (Welch, Price, & Yankey, 2002). In this regard, Zollmann (2017, p. 1) notes that "with the ascendance of liberal democracy, propaganda activities have vastly increased. […] Because of its societal importance for public opinion formation, the news media constitutes an obvious channel for the dissemination of propaganda". The mainstream media tends to be very supportive of the hegemonic global liberal democracy[1] narratives and its intention to retain its power, rather than acting as an independent mechanism to check and balance that centre of power.

A lot of research is from a sociological perspective, involving cases at a tactical or operational level of analysis. The present study intends to look at the issue and practice of moral panic from a strategic overview and through the lens of mass communication in order to understand the political why and how of the current moral panic concerning mainstream news media coverage of the Russian "threat". What is the logic of the Russian "threat", and are there any "cures" suggested in mainstream media coverage?

The first step in the paper is to deal with the issue of identifying the myths that are projected as reality, and separating fiction from fact in mainstream journalism. One of the key brand myths is the concept of the fourth estate, where mass media and journalism serve public interest by challenging political interests. The following section seeks to define and clarify the theoretical motivations and considerations involved in moral panic. In the third section, the mainstream mass media content involving the coverage of Russia is analysed in order to reveal the nature of the "logic" of the reporting in order to understand whether it fits the conceptual criterion to be worthy of being labelled as a moral panic.

Mainstream Journalism and News: Between Myth and Reality

Branding is a standard philosophy and practice in the contemporary business and political environments. It is considered to be an indispensable aspect of organisational activity, depending on the conceptual underpinnings and the execution of the practical approach, it can be the difference between success and failure in attaining organisational goals and objectives. In way of a basic definition of the term and its implications, the following provides an overview:

[1] Liberal democracy here is understood and defined as being those who favour the values found in multiculturalism and globalisation.

> Branding is the process by which companies differentiate their products from their competition. In developing a unique identity, which may include a name, packaging and design, a brand is developed. In developing and managing this unique identity, the branding process allows organisations to develop strong emotional and psychological connections with a product, goods or service. This in turn, eases the purchasing decision. Branding affects stakeholder perceptions and the marketing task is to ensure these perceptions are positive (Franklin, Hogan, Langley, Mosdell, & Pill, 2009, p. 33).

The above fits with Brown's (2016, pp. 13–14) understanding that branding helps to simplify and distinguish a product or service from all of the other offers in existence and competing for attention and consumption, it reduces confusion through initiating expectations and creating associations among the customer/user base. A brand is a significant step in the road to creating and maintaining an enduring mutually reciprocal political relationship between the messenger and the audience. Newman (2016, p. 92) understands brand, from the point of view of political application, as a mechanism that connects via the policies and issues represented as well as through the personality traits possessed. A series of steps are used by marketers in order to embark on establishing a brand. The first step is to *build awareness* through communication concerning a particular product or service on offer, which is likely to increase engagement and interaction. Step two concerns *positioning* of the product or service, once the consumer is aware of it. This is an attempt to differentiate it from its competition. The third step is about *establishing a brand* after awareness and positioning are implemented. Then automatic associations and assumptions are connected to the brand of a particular product or service (Newman, 2016, p. 112). When a brand is established, when can a particular brand stand out from its competition?

There are three different aspects to be examined when evaluating the strength of brand value. *Differentiation* is used by a communicator to distinguish a product, service or organisation from competing brands, and thereby be able to position itself more ideally to enable better reach and connection with the target audience. A brand's visual identity is a key aspect in helping an audience to better identify the difference and believe in it. *Credibility* of a brand is an icon of trust, with the intention of helping to develop a loyal following. An organisation's credibility is achieved by its ability to live up to its promise(s). *Authenticity* is gained by matching words and deeds.

The current approach to branding is a very pre-meditated exercise in seeking to project the positive aspects and strengths of what is being branded and communicated. The established brand of journalism carries with its connotations and expectations associated with the notion of the fourth estate. Myth-making is managed in an idealised and utopian understanding of journalism as a profession and what its priorities should be mixes idealised ethical concepts and ideal pragmatic practice. McNair (1998, pp. 19–20) defines the function of the fourth estate as being "an independent institutional source of political and cultural power which monitors and scrutinises the actions of the powerful in other spheres". This is tied to classical liberal theory that postulates the press as a defender of public

interests and a watchdog on the workings of government. The term was credited as originally being coined by Edmund Burke in the late 18th century, and subsequently gained ground from the 19th century (Franklin, Hogan, Langley, Mosdell, & Pill, 2009, p. 84). This sets the tone for the idealised notion of journalism's role. One of the popular myths of journalism is its supposed power: "For all of this tumultuous history, we hold fast to a vision of the powerful impact of the press, for good and bad. It is an old story, already a common theme in the 19th century" (Shaya, 2012). However, the presumed power is increasingly being called into question with some saying journalism is merely a public record of events as they unfold (Ibid.). Simultaneously, it is impossible to deny that if journalism affects the audience, though, then it does it not from the calculating viewpoint but following moral sentiments; thus, it is hard to determine the level of premeditation involved.

Obviously, at its most basic function, journalism is the process of uncovering information and disseminating that information via media of mass communication (TV, radio, newspapers and the Internet). It is also conceived as a form of monologic communication (Franklin et al., 2011, p. 124), although this understanding is questionable, due to the fact that it cannot exist without the involvement of the mass audience into the media content. There is also a great deal of myth and symbolic power associated with journalism through it be associated with the nation; the brand of the fourth estate as such relates to the ideal functioning of journalism as a critical social institution. The elements of journalism as defined by Kovach and Rosenstiel (2007) include: journalism's first obligation is to the truth; its first loyalty is to citizens; its essence is a discipline of verification; its practitioners must maintain an independence from those they cover; it must serve as an independent monitor of power; it must provide a forum for public criticism and compromise; it must strive to make the significant interesting and relevant; it must keep the news comprehensive and in proportion; its practitioners have an obligation to exercise their personal conscience; citizens, too, have rights and responsibilities when it comes to the news. A contradiction of the current news environment has been noted, in the age of the 24-hour news cycle, where the population is constantly bombarded with information. Yet in spite of this, the public remains quite uninformed of events, trends and processes in their environment (Kovach & Rosenstiel, 2011). Following this, what is the connection between the ideal of the fourth estate and mass communication?

The act of communication is vital to not only being human, but also for guiding social interaction. As such, it generates a number of dilemmas, such as the morality of the act of communication. This implies the pursuit of ethical practice insofar as doing the "right thing", and an adherence to a certain social duty and moral responsibility (Bivins, 2010, pp. 2–3). Currently, though there is an increase split of perception on how journalism explains its public duty and how the public interprets their actions. Rhetorically, it is still held as being a "sacred" value of journalism, but public belief and trust is on the wane. Why is this seemingly the case? To be understood, this needs to be explained by the contemporary challenges and changes faced by contemporary journalism and journalists, not to mention the public. Often journalism and media are

deemed as being an essential element of a healthy democracy. These arguments, however, are often misleading and definitely missing context to be meaningful. But the "relationship between media and democracy also depends on the existing state of the media and of the market, and indeed on the state of actually existing democracy in each individual context – where context is likely to be state-led because of the prevailing dominance of state legislatures but not state-bound due to globalisation" (Fenton, 2014, p. 31).

One of the global trends observed has been the incremental concentration worldwide of mass media ownership into fewer and fewer hands. As such, the trend of concentration of mass media outlets into fewer hands has a potentially negative effect on level of transparency and accountability in a political system. Baker (2007, pp. 6–37) argues strongly for maintaining diversity and plurality with regards to the media ownership. The three main reasons given are: 1) to maintain a more democratic distribution of communicative power; 2) democratic safeguards – by preventing a monopoly of communicative power to mask abuses of political power; and 3) the availability of evidence should never be the sole determinant of the content of investigations, which refers to the use and abuse of information dominance, and the subjectively selective use of information. When mass media concentration does occur, then the results can be stark.

Schisms in wider society are also being mirrored in the mass media and journalism. The schism of the contemporary media and information environment is symptomatic of the wider splits and fractures in global politics and society that is formed along value and norm-based projected realities. In turn, this negatively influences the professional standards of journalism, and manifests in a number of tangible ways within media content and behaviour. One of these aspects is found in the ethics of activism, where journalists as activists are likely to continue to proliferate. The crucial question is raised, when are journalists agenda-driven activists, and when are they investigative journalists with a valid cause? In turn, this leads to the next ethical question of interpretation and opinion. "The era of news objectivity as 'just the facts' is dead and gone. Interpretative journalism grows" (Ward, 2014, p. 51). This necessitates understanding the separation and implications of commentary, opinion, analysis, and facts.

What is mentioned above has caused moments for reflection on the future of journalism in the academic community. It has been pointed out that traditionally journalism was studied from the point of view of a technological, government, corporate or educational perspective. But what is really needed is to look at it from the point of view of journalists, because there is no journalism without journalists (Mosco, 2009). There has been a long history of future predictions on "crises", trends, and developments in the mass media, and as some academics have pointed out, these are often wrong (Curran, 2010). Among the warnings of the gradual death of professional journalism (McChesney, 2003, pp. 3–10), some academics argue that journalism is not heading for extinction, but rather evolution (McNair, 1998). Namely that the dominant model of journalism that existed in the 20th century, which concerned a trained professional communicating objective and validated content to the audience, is undergoing change.

This fits with the views of other academics that speak of a decline and renewal in news media with the emergence of "neo-journalism", which speaks of journalism adapting to the changing environment as "non-professionals" begin to take over and are assisted by progress in mobile communication technologies and newly created news media outlets carrying the content produced (Giles, 2010). The changes that are taking place within contemporary journalism are sometimes referred to as being a "crisis" (McChesney, 2003; Young, 2010), where a crisis is understood as being an extra-ordinary situation that is potentially harmful. This in turn often causes moments to pause and ponder ethical (Ward, 2005) and normative (Schudson, 2001) issues as an underlying cause, but also a possible cure (Woodstock, 2002). At times, there is a tendency to look back to perceived "golden" periods in history as a guiding force to overcome the "crisis", and thus prevent any transformation.

But these transformations do not really account for why the changes are currently occurring. Journalist and author Andrew Fowler attributes the "decline in journalism" to the following reasons: 1) mainstream media disconnect (in terms of quality/relevance of information product and declining public confidence); 2) the loss of money and power by news media; 3) failing business models; 4) acting as echo chambers for powerful interests (Tapp, 2015). Academic Howard Tumber (2001, p. 95) explained that journalism was coming under "attack" from two distinct sources/areas: 1) pressure from owners and media conglomerates, which has exacerbated traditional problems with professional news output; and 2) new forms of political and government communication with the public. In meeting these challenges, different media outlets have attempted different solutions to overcoming the challenges and obstacles, which some observers describe as a "splintering" of the fourth estate from a model that was viewed as being homogenous (Rusbridger, 2010). Given the reasons for the decline of journalism as we know it, how does this impact upon the quality of contemporary journalism? Contemporary journalism is much less critical of the "official" state line that is encapsulated within the practice of news management (Esser & Spanier, 2005), and is prone to exaggeration for economic gain and publicity. One avenue that can achieve both goals simultaneously is through the creation of a moral panic.

Moral Panic

"Moral panic" was developed as a sub-discipline within the field of sociology, it has come to have a very profound effect upon the language and culture of debate through the practice of journalists and politicians (Garland, 2008, p. 9). The idea of a moral panic is that it is a mechanism of creating change through manipulating perception and opinion. Its origin as "a concept" was first used by Cohen (1972) to describe orchestrated and mass mediated public campaigns aimed at generating fear of visibly identified "folk devils" (Franklin et al., 2011, p. 152). This is not to say that a moral panic is necessarily something that is tangible, but rather the promise of a risk or threat. Moral panics are intended to serve as a means to enable a change in law, policy or current practices, which is justified as being necessary to "protect" the public and

the common good (Franklin et al., 2011, p. 152; Krinsky, 2013, pp. 1–2). There is an observable process when a moral panic is manufactured:

- an individual, a group or something is identified as being a threat to safety (the "enemy"), values or interests;
- that threat is simplified and distilled to an easily understandable form in the mass media. Distortion of reality allows for symbolisation and "prediction";
- a construction and exaggeration of public concern primary and secondary definers of panic, much emphasis on what may or could happen;
- elevation of public panic and an accompanying demand to do "something";
- government or legal authorities have a freer hand to implement policy to address the "threat";
- panic results in some form of tangible or intangible social or political change and then goes into "remission" (Franklin et al., 2011, pp. 152–153).

The above aspects of the process of creating a moral panic illustrate the role of concern, generating hostility, forming consensus, fomenting disproportionality, and creating volatility (Krinsky, 2013, p. 7). Marsh and Melville (2011) argue that the central idea of a moral panic is based upon the presence of a disproportionate reaction to a particular behaviour or event. From a sociological perspective, Critcher (2008), argues that the analysis of moral panic requires the connections to the themes of discourse, risk, and moral regulation. Critcher goes on to suggest that moral panics should be conceptualised as being forms of discourse as the discursive formations dictate "who has the right to speak, on what terms and to which ends" (Critcher, 2008, p. 1139). The result of joining Critcher's three elements is "redefining moral panics as extreme forms of risks discourses as integral to the process of moral regulation" (Critcher, 2008, p. 1140). Garland (2008, p. 9) notes that we live "in an age of exaggeration, where the mass media regularly converge on a single anxiety-creating issue and exploit it for all its worth, the utility of negating, deflationary riposte is perfectly apparent".

Moral panics also need to be visualised by the target audience in order to create a sense of fear in that group, which are quite often used as a distraction by the dominant hegemony during periods of socio-economic hardship. "In sum, social interventions that ignore the roots of violence while creating coercive forms of control and scapegoating unpopular people are the legacies of a moral panic, becoming embedded in the social order long after the initial wave of public anxiety has subsided" (Welch et al., 2002, p. 23). It is a matter of creating a "folk devil" in order to justify a "cure":

> Crucially, the theory [of moral panic] has, over the years, drawn attention to the importance of empowering folk devils so that they or their representatives can challenge the cycle of sanctions and social control. Pressure groups, lobbies, self-help and interest groups have sprung up across the country and effectively positioned themselves as authoritative sources of comment and criticism. They now contribute to the shape of public debate, playing a major role in contesting what they perceive as dangerous stereotypes and popular misconceptions (McRobbie & Thornton, 1995, p. 572).

The above text relates to the positive role of moral panics in being able to contest the power of the hegemonic status quo. However, this can be reverse engineered too. Instead of being a tool to contest the hegemonic power, it can also be a tool of the hegemonic power to crush any possible challenge to its position and consolidate specific political interests by using the moral panic (Burns & Crawford, 1999). This is done by invoking dangerous stereotypes and popular misconceptions in order to enforce and bolster sanctions and social control. The hegemonic power also places itself as the monopoly of commentary, and therefore to control the shape of the public debate by the creation of a threatening "folk devil" as a means of political and social control. This can often take place during some form of socio-economic crisis and public discontent with the system. Critcher (2009) equates the role of moral panic with the desire to compel moral regulation. However, moral panic may also be used as a catalyst for other tasks, such as political regulation. This is to be understood as creating an environment of fear and caution, in which the inhabitants are compliant to the will and the needs of the hegemonic political power.

Contemporary Mainstream News Coverage of Russia: The Ultimate Moral Panic?

To make sense of something it is necessary to be able to identify and scrutinise the individual components. There are a number of different tools for the analysis and sense making of examples of text. One of the tools is through *Content Analysis*, which involves the quantification of different elements in text. It seeks frequencies of certain words in certain genres, and can track these over times in order to identify change. *Argumentation Analysis* focuses upon the structure of argumentation used, which is linked to the wider approach of rhetoric. *Narrative Analysis* involves seeking to explain a "common-sense" understanding of how the world works through a study of the components that make up a narrative. *Discourse Analysis* has a purpose to study issues related to power and how they are linguistically constructed in order to understand actions (Boréus & Bergström, 2017, pp. 7–8).

The tool chosen for the analysis of the text in this paper after considering the above-mentioned alternatives is *Qualitative analysis of ideas and ideological content* – an approach that focuses upon intentional action. In this regard, ideologies are understood and analysed as consisting of ideas that guide the actions and interactions that constitute a society with its institutions, social relations, and power relations. The aim is to identify, interpret, describe, and classify the ideological content in thought and language (Boréus & Bergström, 2017, p. 7). The texts for analysis in this paper have been collected over a long period (some four years since the *Euromaidan* events in Ukraine) and have been manually narrowed down to some 40 pieces of work. This includes mainstream media articles, media monitoring articles, and policy papers by think tanks.

Information and knowledge production are key components, which influence the nature of public debates through managing public opinion and perception of events and processes in the physical environment. One of the key components in shaping the information environment are media outlets and journalists, which can be associated with the mythical brand of being a fourth estate. However, some former members of this group

are much more critical of their role. Former BBC news producer Kenneth Payne went as far as to characterise contemporary media as "indisputably an instrument of war". This is because military (and political) conflicts are heavily dependent upon carrying domestic and international public opinion (Payne, 2005, p. 81), which is very evident in the quality of media reporting of the current tensions, real and imagined, between Russia and the West. The environment has been captured well in a satirical blog – *A Media Primer on the Art of Writing Russian Scare Stories*. Ten new "rules" of journalism were suggested: 1) there is no need to apply the standards of journalism, such as credible and verifiable sources; 2) truth and credibility are not necessary; 3) make any claim, not matter how outlandish; 4) add submarines to the story to give it more "Soviet-era" creepiness; 5) play on peoples' fears; 6) use the word Kremlin as much as possible in the story; 7) use Russian military aircraft in the story, and make sure the context is left out; 8) minimise or withhold certain facts from the story; 9) be very selective on what you report, least there be confusion on who the good and bad guys are; 10) create your very own reality (Slane, 2015).

Although the main focus of the paper is from events in 2014, such as those on Crimea, which were taken as a low point in relations between Russia and the West, there is plenty of evidence to suggest that relations were already in the process of plummeting before this milestone. From 2014, there has been a plethora of material published by think tanks and other organisations that promote the idea of a political, cultural and/or Russian military threat, which is often used as a pretext and justification for the act of "self-defence" through increasing the defence budget and enacting extra-ordinary measures (Darczewska, 2014; Berzins, 2014; Lucas, 2015; Shirreff & Olex-Szczytowski, 2016). The period of see-saw warm and cool relations has seen periodic and recurring bouts of optimism followed by despair. President George W. Bush famously saw something he liked in President Putin's eyes in 2001. Then in 2008, the world was apparently shocked by the outbreak of the Russia-Georgia War. Although, the signs were already there, and the likely direction of those relations was to worsen between the West and Russia given their very different political and policy trajectories (Sakwa, 2008). There was an attempt to "hit the reset button" in 2009. What are the headlines and media content telling the public about the current Russia "threat"?

A lot of speculation, assertion and assumption exists in the mainstream media's reporting of the Russia "threat", which was noticeably increased in "quality" and quantity during the 2016 US Presidential Elections, and their aftermath. An opinion article compared and asserted what the Russians allegedly did was every bit as bad as the Japanese sneak attack on the Pearl Harbour base on 7 December 1941, as "an act of war nonetheless, a sneak attack using 21st century methods". Then the author finished her article with the assumption that "Russia must indeed be laughing" (Tumulty, 2018). This ending is designed as a means to invoke a little extra public outrage at the thought of not only being "attacked" and ridiculed as well. As another block in the liberal media's echo chamber when Friedman chimes in with the promise that our democracy is in danger: "President Trump is either totally compromised by the Russians or is a towering fool, or both, but either way, he has shown himself unwilling or unable to defend America against a Russian campaign to divide and undermine our democracy" (Friedman, 2018). The echo chamber was reinforced by the words of Robinson:

> There it is, in black and white: Trump was elected with the active help of Russian President Vladimir Putin. While Putin is not named as a co-conspirator, the man behind the scheme – an oligarch named Yevgeniy Prigozhin – is a long-time crony known in Russia as "Putin's chef". The idea that he would meddle in a U.S. election without orders from Putin is ludicrous" (Robinson, 2018).

Once more, the main message is one of an impending threat that has the potential to undermine the values and norms of the American system and way of life.

One article from the LA Times sought to create a story detailing a long history of the Soviet Union and now Russia as seeking to "sow discord" in the United States. The logic of the story is that there were numerous attempts that sought to do this historically, but they invariably failed. However, Russia has apparently discovered their "silver bullet" with social media:

> Russian operatives couldn't have asked for better tools than Facebook and Twitter to spark conflict and deepen divisions within Americans, experts say. Never before could they fan propaganda with such ease and speed and needle the people most vulnerable to misinformation with such precision.

The typical style of format of narrative is used, where words that denote uncertainty are used, such as "appears" or "allegedly" (Pierson, 2018). Hillary Clinton's former press secretary, Brian Fallon, chimed in with more alarming assumptions and assertions. "It seems like the creative instincts and the sophistication exceeds a lot of the US political operatives who do this for a living" (Parker, A., Wagner, J., 2018). There is an effort to make the Russians and Putin seem like an unstoppable and highly sophisticated force that is bent on undermining US democracy by subverting the system. Yet little tangible proof is offered to support the highly alarmist claims. Through the use of assertion propaganda, these stories offer a number of different suggested "remedies", which include applying further punitive sanctions against Russia and/or removing Trump as President. There is also a significant and notable conflation between the measure of activity and measure of effect. Even assuming the dubious allegations of activity are correct, it does not mean that they necessarily automatically achieve the stated effect. A number of discernible buzzwords are often repeated to reinforce the idea of the moral panic by emphasizing some key ideas/threats, such as "Russian playbook", "Russian aggression", "running a sophisticated campaign", "undermining democracy", "Russia collusion", "hacking election", and "destroying US democracy". Robert Parry characterised mainstream US media as being "unctuous" and "unprofessional" in their coverage of the issue; not only did they uncritically go with the story, they also attacked those who did not in order to create a groupthink bandwagon effect (Parry, 2017a). However, there is an ever-growing narrative of evidence and opinion that seeks to debunk what has come to be known as *Russia-Gate* – the alleged collusion of Russia in electing Donald Trump as President of the United States.

There are a number of sources and people that are pushing back against the moral panic of the Russia threat narrative through deconstructing its logic, argumentation,

and evidence. One of those sources appeared in a mainstream media outlet, *The Guardian*, where the author begins with "Pundits and Democrats ascribe to a handful of bargain-basement Russian trolls all manner of ability – including orchestrating a coup d'etat". As part of the deconstruction, Frank mentions that the advertising budget for the 2016 US Presidential Election was US$9.8 billion and the alleged Russian Facebook trolls spent US$100,000, which supposedly was the most effective in "hacking" the election (Frank, 2018). Frank openly states that he believes that the reporting on the issue has been consciously and deliberately exaggerated, which is one of the markers for identifying a moral panic.

A number of key witnesses have also cast doubt upon the assertions of Russian interference in the 2016 US Presidential Election. One such occasion occurred when House Intelligence Committee Chairman Devin Nunes (R-Calif) stated in an interview that he was "up to speed on everything I have up to this morning. No evidence of collusion." He went further to suggest that there were members of the US intelligence community and the FBI that are leaking information in order to compromise the Trump presidency (Savransky, 2017). Michael Morell, the former Acting Director of the CIA, an endorser of Hillary Clinton who referred to Trump as a dupe of Russia backtracked. He stated: "On the question of the Trump campaign conspiring with the Russians here, there is smoke, but there is no fire, at all" (Dilanian, 2017). Some media outlets published scepticism of the Russian propaganda narrative too, such as when the shadowy front group PropOrNot[2] accused hundreds of journalists and outlets that did not take the official mainstream political and media narrative as "spreading Russian propaganda." The headline of the *New Yorker* spoke openly of the doubt being expressed – *The Propaganda About Russian Propaganda* (Chen, 2016). PropOrNot attempted to shape the information and knowledge environment by not only perpetuating the official Russia moral panic, but also attempted to silence any form of public dissent or divergence through character assassination. As George Orwell noted back in 1945 in *The Freedom of the Press*, "at any given moment there is an orthodoxy, a body of ideas which it is assumed that all right-thinking people will accept without question […] Anyone who challenges the prevailing orthodoxy finds himself silenced with surprising effectiveness".

There has been a growing sense of dissatisfaction that the mass media and journalism have become "an extension" of the official government narrative and other interest groups, rather than a voice of objective reason and public interest, the author linking the *Russia-Gate* narrative to the fake news phenomena (Hannan, 2018). Renowned investigative journalist, Robert Parry, noted the use of character assassination against those people and outlets (through labelling them as "Russian moles") that challenged the "orthodoxy" of the Russia threat moral panic. He also noted a logic that he described as being often missing in the alleged Russian "hack" of the presidential election. In particular, he pointed to discrepancies in applying logic and evidence, such as the relatively minor and insignificant sums of money allegedly being used to run their "sophisticated" influence campaign (Parry, 2017b). Even people that are normally highly critical of Putin and the Russian government, such as Masha

[2] http://www.propornot.com/p/home.html

Gessen, characterising the *Russia-Gate* saga as destructive politics making use of a conspiracy theory approach (Glasser, 2017). This criticism has not stopped the attempt to broaden the scope of the moral panic in the United States by mainstream political and media actors, which was witnessed in the aftermath of the Florida School shooting when there were assertions that a "Russian 'bot' army pounced" in an effort to "sow discord" in American society through divisive debates (Frenkel & Wakabayashi, 2018). Once more, the mainstream media accepts the orthodoxy without question, and takes the assertions as reality uncritically at face value and thereby betraying the theoretical foundations of good journalism. However, the United States has not been the only country to drive a moral panic using Russia as the folklore devil.

Another country that has extensively used the Russia "threat" as the basis of a moral panic is the United Kingdom. Some stories are timed for significant times of the year, such as the Christmas-New Year period, which is associated with festive family activities. A story that emerged at this time was an alarmist one that featured the Royal Navy needing to be sent in order to intercept and escort Russian naval ships. On the surface, the story implies that the Russian Navy violated British territorial waters, except for one small tract – "Royal Navy frigate HMS Westminster was sent to monitor four Russian vessels over the weekend as they passed close to British waters" (Miller, 2018). In other words, there was no real crisis or breech of international law, rather a constructed moral panic. The threatening "predictions" of leading members of the British government have also be quoted without any additional analysis or critique on numerous occasions, such as former Foreign Secretary Boris Johnson's assertion that Russia is "full of dirty tricks", and has the ability to disrupt UK politics with hacking. This led to discussions on how to defend against these hypothetical attacks (Wintour & Slawson, 2017). This news coincidentally appeared at a time when there was a debate as to whether to adopt secure on-line voting as an option. More recently, the former Defence Secretary Gavin Williamson warned that "Russia could cause thousands and thousands and thousands of deaths in Britain with an attack which would cripple the UK's infrastructure and energy supply" (Farmer, 2018). As with the previous cases, there was no supporting evidence to back the assertions, and the announcement came at a time when the defence budget was being reviewed. One of the more bizarre cases was the assertion that Russia hacked BREXIT, which actually came well after the vote and only emerged at the time of the US presidential elections in November 2017 (Burgess, 2017; Galeotti, 2017; Smith, 2017). The same style of rhetoric, reasoning and logic used in the US presidential election was used in BREXIT too, in an apparent attempt to link the two events together in a global super-conspiracy theory in spite of the obvious discrepancies, such as the chronological disjunction of the two events.

The moral panic of the Russia threat is much more widely and globally spread, from the Dutch Referendum on a trade deal with Ukraine and elections (Lagerman, 2017), to "looming" invasions of Ukraine (Baldor, 2014), the French Election (Daniels, 2017), the German elections (even though German intelligence found no evidence) (Knight, 2017), the Mexican elections (Garcia & Torres, 2018), and even that Putin gave orders to attack US troops in Syria (Peters, 2018). All of these stories shared the trademark approaches to communicating the moral panic in-line with the US

presidential model, with the various alleged risks to societal norms and values, the buzzwords used, different "remedies" offered depending on the objective (usually revealed by the specific timing and circumstance of the Russia "menace"). As noted by Glenn Greenwald, "every empire needs a scary external threat, led by a singular menacing villain, to justify its massive military expenditures, consolidation of authoritarian powers, and endless wars" (Greenwald, 2018).

Conclusion

At the beginning of this paper a question was posed: What is the logic of the Russian "threat", and are there any "cures" suggested in mainstream media coverage? Before, this is answered in full, the bits of the complex puzzle need to be brought together in order to make sense of the bigger picture. Firstly, is the role of journalism and the mass media. This institution has managed to create a branded myth around itself as being a fourth estate, an institution that checks and balances the political power in the name of public interest. However, there are concerns and evidence that journalism's role has become co-opted by economic and political interests. This is precisely because of the assumed power to influence perception and shape public opinion. The mainstream mass media are indelibly tied to the interests of the hegemonic system of liberal democracy acting in the capacity as their information gatekeeper and watchdog.

Currently, that system of liberal democracy is experiencing a multi-levelled crisis in terms of public trust and legitimacy owing to what has been labelled as being the populist challenge. This has been seen in the US elections when Trump beat his rival and the anticipated winner (by mainstream politics and mass media) Hillary Clinton, when the favoured liberal contender was beaten by someone that rhetorically stood against the liberal system. There were also similar challenges found in BREXIT, the French and German elections. Another problem of contemporary politics is found in the competition for increasingly scarcer governmental financial resources. As a result, a common communication strategy seems to have been developed using a "cookie cutter" approach in order to attain these political and economic objectives. After some years of not being the global folklore devil, Russia has been re-elevated to this status, which may be in part through the ability of the moral panic communicators to link the supervillain brand of the Soviet Union from the Cold War to the Russian Federation. Thereby, the brand has some pre-existing level of recognition and status to the target audiences.

Rather than taking the strategy of a longer term and somewhat unpredictable path of either reforming the system of a reasoned and rational form of communication, a shorter-term approach of using emotionally based messaging that intends to induce fear in the target audience. When fear is induced, the logic works differently insofar as there is less critical reflection on the quality of the logic and evidence being presented. Therefore, inducing a moral panic can adequately meet the organisational objectives. Traditionally, moral panics have been associated as a means of ethical or social regulation and control within society. This study presents an indicative case where moral panic is used to regulate and control politics and economics in a given society

or system in order to fend off challenges to their continued hegemony and in order to justify policy that may otherwise be difficult to pass.

Franklin et al. (2011) identified the progression of a moral panic, which can be easily applied to this case. Firstly, a threat is identified, in this case Russia and Putin. Secondly, the threat is distilled to an easily understandable form by the mass media, which can be seen in the uniform rhetoric and lexicon used globally, e.g. a "sophisticated campaign" or "undermining democracy". Thirdly comes the construction and exaggeration phase, whereby Russia is elevated to the status as a global threat and mega folklore devil. The next phase is to create a demand to do something; one such example is the demand by some sections of US society to impeach Trump for "Russian collusion". This creates the context whereby the actor(s) responsible for the moral panic have a freer hand at policy, such as deploying troops to Central and Eastern Europe. There is an evident effort to try and defend the viability of the moral panic from attack and deconstruction, by targeting those individuals and organisations that openly challenge the legitimacy and credibility of it, which is done by including them as being willing assistants to the "attack" on society and its values.

References

Baldor, L. C. (2014, August 6). Hagel: Growing Threat of Russia Invading Ukraine. *Washington Times*. Retrieved from https://www.washingtontimes.com/news/2014/aug/6/hagel-growing-threat-of-russia-invading-ukraine/

Baker, C. E. (2007). *Media Concentration and Democracy: Why Ownership Matters*. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Berzins, J. (2014). *Russia's New Generation of Warfare in Ukraine: Implications for Latvian Defence Policy* (Policy Paper No. 2). Riga: National Defence Academy of Latvia.

Bivins, T. (2010). *Mixed Media: Moral Distinctions in Advertising, Public Relations and Journalism*. New York: Routledge.

Boréus, K., & Bergström, G. (2017). *Analyzing Text and Discourse: Eight Approaches for the Social Sciences*. London: Sage.

Brown, S. (2016). *Brands and Branding*. London: Sage.

Burgess, M. (2017, November 10). Here's the First Evidence Russia Used Twitter to Influence Brexit. *Wired*. Retrieved from http://www.wired.co.uk/article/brexit-russia-influence-twitter-bots-internet-research-agency

Burns, R. & Crawford, C. (1999). School Shootings, the Media, and Public Fear: Ingredients for a Moral Panic. *Crime, Law & Social Change*, 32(2), 147–168. DOI: 10.1023/A:1008338323953

Chen, A. (2016, December 1). The Propaganda About Russian Propaganda. *The New Yorker*. Retrieved from https://www.newyorker.com/news/news-desk/the-propaganda-about-russian-propaganda

Critcher, C. (2008). Moral Panic Analysis: Past, Present and Future. *Sociology Compass*, 2(4), 1127–1144. DOI: 10.1111/j.1751-9020.2008.00122.x

Critcher, C. (2009). Widening the Focus: Moral Panics as Moral Regulation. *British Journal of Criminology*, 49(1), 17–34. DOI: 10.1093/bjc/azn040

Cohen, S. (1972). *Folk Devils and Moral Panic*. London: MacGibbon and Kee.

Curran, J. (2010). The Future of Journalism. *Journalism Studies*, 11(4), 464–476. DOI: 10.1080/14616701003722444

Daniels, L. (2017, April 23). How Russia Hacked the French Election. *Politico*. Retrieved from https://www.politico.eu/article/france-election-2017-russia-hacked-cyberattacks/

Darczewska, J. (May 2014). *The Anatomy of Russian Information Warfare: The Crimean Operation, A Case Study*. Ośrodek Studiów Wschodnick im. Marka Karpia: Centre for Eastern Studies.

Dilanian, K. (2017, March 16). Clinton Ally Says Smoke, But no Fire: No Russia-Trump Collusion. *NBC News*. Retrieved from https://www.nbcnews.com/news/us-news/clinton-ally-says-smoke-no-fire-no-russia-trump-collusion-n734176

Esser, F., & Spanier, B. (2005). News Management as News. *Journal of Political Marketing*, 4(4), 27–57. DOI: 10.1300/J199v04n04_02

Farmer, B. (2018, January 26). Russia Ready to "Kill Thousands and Thousands" of Britons With Crippling Attack, Defence Secretary Warns. *The Telegraph*. Retrieved from http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/2018/01/25/crippling-russian-attack-britains-infrastructure-could-kill/

Fenton, N. (2014). Defending Whose Democracy? Media Freedom and Media Power. *Nordicom Review*, 35, 31–43.

Frank, T. (2018, February 23). The Hysteria Over Russia Bots has Reached New Levels. *The Guardian*. Retrieved from https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2018/feb/23/russian-bots-us-election-coup-d-etat

Franklin, B., Hamer, M., Hanna, M., Kinsey, M., & Richardson, J. E. (2005). *Key Concepts in Journalism Studies*. London: Sage.

Franklin, B., Hogan, M., Langley, Q., Mosdell, N., & Pill, E. (2009). *Key Concepts in Public Relations*. London: Sage.

Frenkel, S., & Wakabayashi, D. (2018, February 19). After Florida School Shooting, Russian "Bot" Army Pounced. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from https://www.nytimes.com/2018/02/19/technology/russian-bots-school-shooting.html?emc=edit_th_180220&nl=todaysheadlines&nlid=498727810220

Friedman, T. L. (2018, February 18). Whatever Trump is Hiding is Hurting All of Us Now. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from https://mobile.nytimes.com/2018/02/18/opinion/trump-russia-putin.html?action=click&module=Ribbon&pgtype=Article

Galeotti, M. (2017, November 2). How Putin Could Yet Save Britain From Brexit. *The Guardian*. Retrieved from https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2017/nov/02/putin-save-britain-brexit-russia-eu-referendum

Garcia, D. A., & Torres, N. (2018, January 7). Russia Meddling in Mexican Election: White House Aid McMaster. *Reuters*. Retrieved from https://www.reuters.

com/article/us-mexico-russia-usa/russia-meddling-in-mexican-election-white-house-aide-mcmaster-idUSKBN1EW0UD

Garland, D. (2008). On the Concept of Moral Panic. *Crime Media Culture*, 4(1), 9–30. DOI: 10.1177/1741659007087270

Giles, R. H. (2010). An Emergent Neo-Journalism: The Decline and Renewal of News Media. *Harvard International Review*, Fall, 32(3), 36–40.

Glasser, S. (2017, March 20). Is Russia-Gate a Conspiracy Theory? *Politico.* Retrieved from https://www.politico.com/magazine/story/2017/03/masha-gessen-the-full-transcript-214927

Greenwald, G. (2018, February 12). Dutch Official Admits Lying About Meeting with Putin: Is Fake News Used by Russia or About Russia? *The Intercept*. Retrieved from https://theintercept.com/2018/02/12/dutch-official-admits-lying-about-meeting-with-putin-is-fake-news-used-by-russia-or-about-russia/

Hannan, E. (2018, January 31). Garbage In, Garbage Out: Tech Journalism, Fake News and the Russia Threat Narrative. *Medium*. Retrieved from https://medium.com/insurge-intelligence/garbage-in-garbage-out-technology-journalism-as-a-microcosm-of-the-mass-media-crisis-93bd8a4ac37b

Knight, B. (2017, February 7). German Intelligence "Finds No Evidence of Putin Disinformation Campaign". *Deutsche Welle*. Retrieved from http://www.dw.com/en/german-intelligence-finds-no-evidence-of-putin-disinformation-campaign/a-37448072

Kovach, B., & Rosenstiel, T. (2007). *The Elements of Journalism: What Newspeople Should Know and the Public Should Expect*. New York: Three Rivers Press.

Kovach, B., & Rosenstiel, T. (2011). *Blur: How to Know What is True in the Age of Information Overload*. New York: Bloomsbury.

Krinsky, C. (2013). *The Ashgate Research Companion to Moral Panics*. Farnham: Ashgate.

Lagerman, T. (2017, March 10). Russian Hackers Use Dutch Polls as Practice. *Deutsche Welle*. Retrieved from http://www.dw.com/en/russian-hackers-use-dutch-polls-as-practice/a-37850898

Lucas, E. (2015). *The Coming Storm.* (Baltic Sea Security Report). Washington, DC: Centre for European Policy Analysis.

Marsh, I., & Melville, G. (2011). Moral Panics and the British Media – A Look at Some Contemporary "Folk Devils". *Internet Journal of Criminology.* Retrieved from: https://www.academia.edu/2153760/Moral_Panics_and_the_British_Media_A_look_at_some_contemporray_Folk_Devils_

McChesney, R. W. (2003). Journalism, Democracy, … and Class Struggle. *Monthly Review,* 52(6), 1–15. DOI: 10.14452/MR-052-06-2000-10_1

McNair, B. (1998). *The Sociology of Journalism*. London: Arnold Publishers.

McRobbie, A., & Thornton, S.L. (1995). Rethinking "Moral Panic" for Multi-Mediated Social Worlds. *The British Journal of Sociology*, 46(4), 559–574.

Miller, J. (2018, January 8). Royal Navy Ships Rush to Intercept Russian Ships in English Channel. *Express*. Retrieved from https://www.express.co.uk/news/world/901675/royal-navy-intercept-russian-ships-channel-Frigate-HMS-Westminster

Mosco, V. (2009). The Future of Journalism. *Journalism,* 10(3), 350–352. DOI: 10.1177/1464884909102595

Newman, B.I. (2016). *The Marketing Revolution in Politics: What Recent U.S. Presidential Campaigns can Teach us about Effective Marketing*. Buffalo: University of Toronto Press. DOI: 10.3138/9781442669734

Parker, A., & Wagner, J. (2018, February 16). "Go Donald"!: Inside the Russian Shadow Campaign to Elect Trump. *Washington Post*. Retrieved from https://www.washingtonpost.com/politics/go-donald-inside-the-russian-shadow-campaign-to-elect-trump/2018/02/16/dea562c2-134a-11e8-9065-e55346f6de81_story.html

Parry, R. (2017a, April 4). Mainstream Media as Arbiters of Truth. *Consortium News*. Retrieved from https://consortiumnews.com/2017/04/04/mainstream-media-as-arbiters-of-truth/

Parry, R. (2017b, March 20). The Missing Logic of Russia-Gate. *Consortium News*. Retrieved from https://consortiumnews.com/2017/03/20/the-missing-logic-of-russia-gate/

Payne, K. (2005). The Media as an Instrument of War. *Parameters*, 35(1), 81–93.

Peters, R. (2018, February 13). Putin Had to Approve Russian Attack on US Troops. *NY Post*. Retrieved from https://nypost.com/2018/02/13/russians-attacked-american-troops-on-putins-orders/

Pierson, D. (2018, February 22). Russia Tried and Failed to Sow Discord in America. Then it Discovered Social Media. *LA Times*. Retrieved from http://www.latimes.com/business/technology/la-fi-tn-social-media-russia-20180222-story.html

Robinson, E. (2018, February 19). Mr. Trump: They're Laughing at You, Not with You. *Washington Post*. Retrieved from https://www.washingtonpost.com/opinions/mr-trump-theyre-laughing-at-you-not-with-you/2018/02/19/18605e7e-15b0-11e8-b681-2d4d462a1921_story.html?utm_term=.a561910a8a5a

Rusbridger, A. (2010, November 19). The Splintering of the Fourth Estate. *The Guardian*. Retrieved from https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2010/nov/19/open-collaborative-future-journalism

Sakwa, R. (2008). "New Cold War" or Twenty Years' Crisis? Russia and International Politics. *International Affairs*, 84(2), 241–267. DOI: 10.1111/j.1468-2346.2008.00702.x

Savransky, R. (2017, March 19). House Intelligence Chairman: "No Evidence of Collusion" Between Trump Camp and Russia. *The Hill.* Retrieved from http://thehill.com/policy/national-security/324685-nunes-says-hes-seen-no-evidence-of-collusion-between-trump-camp-and

Schudson, M. (2001). The Objectivity Norm in American Journalism. *Journalism*, 2(2), 149–170. DOI: 10.1177/146488490100200201

Shaya, G. (2012, April 3). The Myth of the Fourth Estate: What is the True Purpose of Journalism? *Lapham Quarterly*. Retrieved from https://www.laphamsquarterly.org/roundtable/myth-fourth-estate

Shirreff, R., & Olex-Szczytowski, M. (2016). *Arming for Deterrence: How Poland and NATO Should Counter a Resurgent Russia*. Washington, DC: Atlantic Council.

Slane, R. (2015, September 14). A Media Primer on the Art of Writing Russian Scare Stories. *The Blogmire*. Retrieved from http://www.theblogmire.com/a-media-primer-on-the-art-of-writing-russian-scare-stories/

Smith, G. (2017, November 17). Russia Used Twitter Bots to Influence the BREXIT Vote Too. *Fortune*. Retrieved from http://fortune.com/2017/11/15/russia-twitter-bots-influence-brexit/

Tapp, J. (2015, August 4). Andrew Fowler: "Why Journalism is in Decline". *ABC News*. Retrieved from http://www.abc.net.au/news/2015-08-04/tapp-why-journalism-is-in-decline/6670076

Tumber, H. (2001). Democracy in the Information Age: The Role of the Fourth Estate in Cyberspace. *Information, Communication & Society*, 4(1), 95–112. DOI: 10.1080/13691180110035759

Tumulty, K. (2018, February 18). We've Just Hit a New Presidential Low. *Washington Post.* Retrieved from https://www.washingtonpost.com/blogs/post-partisan/wp/2018/02/18/weve-just-hit-a-new-presidential-low/?utm_term=.a7f99d1dc168

Ward, S. J. A. (2005). Journalism Ethics from the Public's Point of View. *Journalism Studies*, 6(3), 315–330. DOI: 10.1080/14616700500131901

Ward, S. J. A. (2014). Radical Media Ethics: Responding to a Revolution. *Nordicom Review,* 35, 45–52.

Welch, M., Price, E. A., & Yankey, N. (2002). Moral Panic Over Youth Violence: Wilding and the Manufacture of Menace in the Media. *Youth & Society*, 34(1), 3–30.

Wintour, P., & Slawson, N. (2017, March 12). Boris Johnson: Russia has Ability to Disrupt UK Politics With Hacking. *The Guardian*. Retrieved from https://www.theguardian.com/uk-news/2017/mar/12/british-democracy-at-risk-from-russian-hackers-says-gchq

Woodstock, L. (2002). Public Journalism's Talking Cure: An Analysis of the Movement's "Problem" and "Solution" Narratives. *Journalism*, 3(1), 37–55.

Young, S. (2010). The Journalism "Crisis". *Journalism Studies*, 11(4), 610–624. DOI: 10.1080/14616701003638517

Zollmann, F. (2017). Bringing Propaganda Back into News Media Studies. *Critical Sociology*, 45(3), 329–345. DOI: 10.1177/0896920517731134

Changing Societies & Personalities, 2019
Vol. 3, No. 3, pp. 207–224
http://dx.doi.org/10.15826/csp.2019.3.3.072

ARTICLE

Religion in Public Life: Rethinking the Visibility and Role of Religion as an Ethical Resource in the Transformation of the Higher Education Landscape in Post-1990 Zambia

Nelly Mwale & Melvin Simuchimba
University of Zambia, Lusaka, Zambia

ABSTRACT
This article revisits the relationship between religion and education in post-1990 to understand the growing public role of religion in higher education in Zambia. The aim of the study that informs the article was to understand the public role of religion through the example of Catholicism in university education provision in Zambia. Informed by interpretivism and interpretive phenomenology, data were gathered through interviews with purposively chosen Catholic Church, Catholic university education representatives, and document analysis, and reductively explicated. Largely in conversation with the discourses of religious resources, the article demonstrates that the growing visibility of the Catholic Church on the Zambian university education landscape after the 1990s was driven by the quest to serve the needs of the Church, the principles of Catholic education and the society, thereby contributing to the transformation of the higher education landscape. The article argues that contrary to projections that secularisation would lead to a decline of religion in public life, religion had remained a useful ethical resource for the transformation of university education provision in post-1990 Zambia underpinned by an ethical concern to promote social and individual wellbeing and support the state's expansion of higher education.

KEYWORDS
religion, public life, ethical resource, Catholic university education, Zambian private higher education

Received 12 March 2019
Accepted 5 September 2019
Published online 5 October 2019

nelmwa@gmail.com
melvin.simuchimba@unza.zm

Introduction

This article revisits the relationship between religion and education using the example of the Catholic Church's recent engagement in university education provision to understand the growing public role of religion in post-1990 Zambia. It argues that contrary to projections that secularisation would lead to a decline in religion in public life, the visibility of religion on the university landscape signified that religion had remained a useful resource for the transformation of university education provision underpinned by an ethical concern to promote social and individual well-being, and support the state's expansion of higher education. The article was ignited by discourses of secularisation in Africa on the one hand, and the growth of religion affiliated universities on the other. Samarin (1966) acknowledged the observation by some sociologists that Africa would become increasingly secular. Unlike in Western Europe, secularisation was accompanied not by a decline in religious devotion but by a dramatic rise in South Africa (Elphick, 1997, pp. 1–15). In Zambia, the brisk growth of religion-affiliated higher education after the 1990s pointed to religion's growing presence in public life. As confirmed by Carpenter (2017), religion's boom in the public sphere was exemplified among other ways the growth of Church involvement in university education through the birth of Christian universities often attributed to the rapid rise of Christian adherence and the volatile growth of higher education in sub-Saharan Africa.

Despite the visibility of religion in public life and in particular, higher education through the surge in Christian universities, and amid the many recent acknowledgments of the global growth of both Christianity and higher education (Glanzer, Carpenter, & Lantinga, 2011; Carpenter, 2017), there has been little scholarly engagement with the phenomenon in Zambia. Unlike in other African contexts such as Nigeria and South Africa where the engagement of the Christian churches in higher education had been analysed (Enegho, 2017; Diedericks 2019), Zambian scholarship has neglected religion in higher education because of the preoccupation with the primary and secondary levels of education (Hambulo, 2016; Simuchimba, 2005; Carmody, 2007/2011). As advanced by Levy (2009), the private higher education system had not been a static entity but instead had changed and evolved over many years in response to social, economic and political change; hence deserved sustained critical investigation. This article accounts for the growing visibility of religion on the university education landscape in Zambia.

Given the numerous typologies of private higher education and Christian higher education, the article focuses on Catholic university education for purposes of exemplifying religions' engagement in university education. The interest in the Catholic Church was sparked off by the 125 years of Catholicism celebrations in 2016 (QFM News, 2017) and the 10th anniversary celebrations in university education in 2018. This was not only a time for institutional reflections, but also one that ignited a scholarly inquiry into the lived experiences of the Catholic Church. By so doing, the article does not suggest that the Catholic Church was the only Church in university education provision as the Protestant churches were also involved

in higher education. Instead, the article exemplifies how religion had shaped the university education landscape for purposes of making a modest contribution to discourses of religion in public life and documenting this new development for posterity. The insights in the article are also not for purposes of generalisation, but for providing a window, through which religion's visibility in public life could be understood in post-1990 Zambia.

The article compliments and extends Levy's (2017) conclusions that universities sponsored by Christian churches were a neglected but important part of private higher education everywhere by filling a contextual gap from the Zambian context and demonstrating the visible role of Christian universities underpinned by an ethical concern to transform the university education landscape. The article further compliments Mwale's (2017) portrayal of Catholic university education in the media in Zambia from an empirical perspective by unveiling the lived experiences of the Church in university education provision.

This article concentrates on post-1990s when higher education was liberalised. Indirectly, this was when the country was declared a Christian nation with the possibility of creating another kind of clientele in search of Christian oriented university education. These decisions were informed by Carpenter's (2017) observation that Christian higher education exists at the intersection of two of the most dynamic social trends in Africa, the rapid rise of Christianity, and volatile growth of higher education especially emerging around the 1990s (a period associated with a surge in Christianity and crisis in African universities). The article proceeds by situating religion in public life through its visibility in higher education in an analytical framework and a context. Thereafter, the methods that informed the article are highlighted before accounting for religion's presence on the university education landscape through the use of religion as an ethical resource.

Analytical Framework

Broadly informed by Derrick Layder's adaptive theory (1998) that allowed for learning from existing theories and generating insights from the emerging field data, the article is largely in conversation with Benne's (2001) framework of determining the category of an institution by examining eight aspects of its life. These include the public relevance of its Christian vision, public rhetoric, membership requirements, the role of the religion or theology department, and whether any such courses are required, the nature and frequency of chapel, the overall ethos, the degree of support by the sponsoring Church, and the role of the associated Church in matters of governance (Benne, 2001). A Catholic university was understood as one that acknowledged and embraced a [Catholic] confessional identity in the mission statements and altered aspects of its policies, governance, curriculum and ethos in light of its Christian [Catholic] identity (Schroeder, 2002, p. 9). Benne's categories helped to identify what constitutes a Christian university, and understand how the example of the Catholic Church's engagement in university education had contributed to the transformation of the university education landscape through the interaction of religion and education in the sector.

The article also draws on discourses of religious resources by Ter Haar and Ellis (2006). These include religious ideas (what people actually believe), religious practices, religious organisation (how religious communities are formed and function), and religious (or spiritual) experiences (such as the subjective experience of inner change or transformation) (Ter Haar, 2005, pp. 22–27). These components resonate with Ninian Smart's dimensions of religion (Smart, 1969), which include the practical or ritual, the experiential or emotional, the narrative or mythic, the doctrinal or philosophical, the ethical or legal, the social or institutional and the material. While Benne's framework will be used to understand the identity and general roles of religion in higher education, the discourses of religious resource will be used to explain the growing visibility of the Church in the sector. Though largely framing the study around these discourses, the limitations of using a specific framework in a study are acknowledged. Hence, the article only presents one of the many truths (Francis, 2001) on the growing visibility of religion's presence in higher education in post-1990 Zambia.

Contextualising the Setting

The article situates religion's role in public life as exemplified in the Church's engagement in higher education in the context of policies, the relationship between religion and education prior to the 1990s and the onset of Catholic engagement in university education. Before independence, there were neither public nor private universities in Zambia. The changes in legislation in the 1990s created a new platform for university education as private providers were encouraged to come on board through the *Educating our Future* policy document (Ministry of Education, 1996). Under this liberalised educational system, the right of private organisations, individuals, religious bodies, and local communities to establish and control their own educational institutions was recognised and welcomed (Ministry of Education, 1996).

University education in Zambia is also guided by other policy documents such as *Vision 2030*. *Vision 2030* (2006–2030) is Zambia's first ever long-term plan expressing the country's aspirations of being a prosperous middle-income country by the year 2030. The policy document embodies values of socio-economic justice underpinned by the principles of gender responsive sustainable development, democracy, respect for human rights, traditional and family values, positive attitude towards work, peaceful co-existence, and private-public partnerships (GRZ, 2006, p. 7). It identifies education as a critical component in enhancing the country's socio-economic development, and acknowledges that the country has yet to reach educational standards that are commensurate with sustainable development and promotes public-private partnerships in the sector (GRZ, 2006, p. 33).

The *Vision 2030* was operationalised through the implementation of five national development plans beginning with the Fifth National Development Plan (2006–2010), and the Sixth National development plan (2011–2015) that was revised to cover the period 2013–2016. The current national plan is the Seventh National Development Plan (2017–2021). Its focus in higher education is to increase access to university

education and technical education, vocational and entrepreneurship training (TEVET), enhancing the quality of training and increasing its relevance to the needs of the industry (GRZ, 2017).

Based on *Vision 2030* and the national development plans, higher education was legislated through the Higher Education Act (2013), which until 2013 was the University Act of 1999. Apart from establishing the Higher Education Authority (HEA) that regulates university education, the Act also spells out the procedures and regulations of private higher education institutions and highlights the functions of providers of higher education (Higher Education Act, 2013, pp. 106–107).

Catholic provision of university education was also illuminated by Catholic principles on education enshrined in the Catholic policy documents such as the 1965 *Gravissimum Educationis* (Pope P. VI, 1965). The *Gravissimum Educationis* was the second Vatican Council declaration on Christian education. Among its principles is that everyone has an inalienable right to an education that is in keeping with their ultimate goal, ability, sex, and the culture and tradition of their country. The purpose of education remains the harmonious development of the student's physical, moral and intellectual endowments, the promotion of the common good and motivation to appraise moral values with a right conscience. The declaration emphasises the additional right for all Christians to a truly Christian education, and the Church's obligation to make moral and religious education available in all schools. Additionally, the policy recognises that the Church and her schools depend on teachers for the accomplishment of their goals hence calls for special traits of the teachers.

The other Church policy document that guides Catholic university education is the 1990 *Ex Corde Ecclesiae*. It is an apostolic constitution on Catholic higher education that provides an overview for Catholic universities. It was intended to define and refine the Catholicism of Catholic institutions of higher education (*Ex Corde Ecclesiae*, 1990). The document identifies what constitutes Catholic identity at Catholic colleges and universities and specifies general norms to achieve a Catholic mission. These norms include being a community of scholars representing various branches of human knowledge and dedicated to research, teaching and service in accordance with its cultural mission. Others are informing and carrying out research, teaching and other activities with Catholic ideals, principles and attitudes, making known the Catholic identity, influencing all university activities with Catholic teaching and discipline, fully respecting the freedom of conscience of each person and possessing the autonomy necessary to develop a distinctive identity and purpose (*Ex Corde Ecclesiae*, 1990). The aspirations of *Gravissimum Educationis* (1965) and *Ex Corde Ecclesiae* (1990) were celebrated during the 2015 World Congress on Catholic education (Congregation for Catholic Education, 2014) that gave new stimulus to the Church's involvement in the field of education.

The Onset of Catholic Presence in University Education in Zambia

When Zambia gained independence in 1964, there were few university graduates and no public or private universities. Higher education was the responsibility of the

government of the Federation of Rhodesia and Nyasaland. Those who qualified to enter university went to the university college of Rhodesia and Nyasaland of 1955 in Salisbury while others went to South and East Africa (Kelly, 2006). This changed after independence when the country's first public university – the University of Zambia – was established in 1966, followed by Copperbelt in 1987 and others.

Prior to the 1990s, university education provision remained the state's responsibility through the two public universities. The Church was only involved in university education through its Catholic representation (the clergy and lay persons) based on their expertise in different fields. In addition to this, the Catholic missionaries shaped the Zambian education system through the provision of education at the lower levels, including the running of colleges of education and skills training centres in the country. Their engagement also included participation in the formulation of policies, sponsoring staff development to teach Religious Education (RE) in public higher education and the provision of teaching and learning materials among other ways (Carmody, 2004). For example, Thomas McGivern was the Inspector of RE at the Ministry of Education who shaped policies on RE and produced teaching and learning materials for the subject (Mwale and Chita, 2017, pp. 10–11).

After the 1990s, the Church vividly appeared on the scene of university education when in the quest to increase access to university education and amid inadequate funding to higher education, the government of the Republic of Zambia encouraged the establishment and accreditation of private universities (Kelly, 1991). As of 2018, the Catholic Church had four institutions that were registered and accredited with the Ministry of Higher Education and the HEA (St. Dominic's Major Seminary, DMI St. Eugene University, St. Bonaventure and Zambia Catholic University [ZCU]). Named after Saint Eugene De Mazenod, the founder of Oblates of Mary Immaculate (OMI), DMI St. Eugene University is run by the Daughters of Mary Immaculate. The Franciscans run St. Bonaventure University College. Unlike these two universities associated with the Catholic Church and run by religious congregations, ZCU was owned by the Zambia Conference of Catholic Bishops (ZCCB) and opened in April 2008. Despite the growth of Catholic higher education in Zambia, the Catholic clergy and laypersons have continued to contribute to Zambian higher education through their presence in the public higher education, including the chaplaincy service that has been provided since the early years of the establishment of public universities.

With regards to the relationship between religion and education in private universities in Zambia, it must be noted that differences abound with public universities. Given that the country has no policy on religion in education except as provided for in the country's Constitution and state policies, university education provision by the Church aligns with state policies. For example, the Catholic education system is open to people of other faiths and the religious freedoms of others are guaranteed especially since Zambia remained a multifaith society despite being declared Christian nation. At the same time, the Christian universities were at liberty to embrace their denominational ethos in education.

Method

The article is informed by insights from an interpretive phenomenological study (Moustakas, 1994; Van Manen, 1990; Padilla-Díaz, 2015), in which the unit of analysis was purposively chosen based on its relevance to the study (Mason, 2002). The study aimed to provide an in-depth self-understanding on the growth of Catholic university education by exploring the experiences of the Catholic Church in university education provision. Aware of the numerous Christian churches in university education provision, one Church (the Catholic Church) was chosen for purposes of depth and most importantly, because it was among the earliest churches to venture into the provision of education. The Catholic Church was also among the influential churches in social service provision and a recognised State partner in education (Gibbs & Ajulu, 1999; Impact Correspondent, 2017). The Catholic Church was therefore chosen based on its typicality or possession of particular characteristics being sought (Cohen, Manion, & Morrison, 2007). The decision was also informed by Creswell's (2007) advice that the more diverse the experiences of participants are, the harder it becomes to find the underlying essence and common meanings attributed to the studied phenomenon.

Of the Catholic higher education institutions, the study focused on ZCU because unlike other institutions, it did not belong to any particular Catholic congregation or religious order but instead was operated by Catholic bishops and owned by all Catholics. The study drew on recorded interviews with purposively chosen Church and Catholic university education representatives herein identified with letters of the alphabet (Strauss et. al., 1998), and document analysis. The decision was guided by Creswell (2007) and Van Manen (1990) on the numerous evidentiary sources in phenomenological studies such as interviews, documentation, and observations. Based on Polkinghorne's (1989) recommendation that researchers interview 5 to 25 individuals in phenomenological research, eight (8) participants from the Catholic Church (ZCCB) education department and ZCU were included in the study for face-to-face interviews. These included the ZCCB education department representative (1), the ZCU management representatives (2), longest serving lecturers at ZCU (2), and student representatives (3). The interviews were conducted at two sites (ZCCB in Lusaka and ZCU in Kalulushi, on the Copperbelt) over a period of three months in 2018 (August, September, October). The last interviews were conducted between May and June in 2019. The ZCCB Education department was targeted because it acts as liaison between the Ministry of Higher Education and Catholic educational facilities, represents the ZCCB on all educational fora, promotes Catholic ethos in the learning institutions, and coordinates the Church's commitment to providing quality education based on Gospel values (ZCCB, 2016).

Additional sources of data were observations of selected functions and document analysis. In this regard, some Church functions related to university education such as graduation ceremonies were attended, in particular, the 10th Anniversary celebrations and 7th graduation ceremony at ZCU in Kalulushi in September 2018. The fundraising functions in the public media were analysed for themes related to the

study. The study was also informed by document analysis, which was chosen on the basis of availability. The documents included archival materials in the ZCCB archives such as annual reports, conference minutes, strategic plans, Catholic university brochures, and newspaper articles among others. The guidelines by Scott (1990) on quality control, formulated for handling documentary sources (authenticity, credibility, representativeness, and meaning) also informed the use of documents.

Data were inductively analysed through the description of the phenomenon and significant statements, horizonalisation and the development of clusters of meaning through textural and structural descriptions of Catholic university education (Creswell, 2007). This involved the generation and application of codes to the data and the identification, analysis, and reporting of patterns. This was done while keeping in check Benne and Ter Haar's frameworks on what constitutes a Christian university and the religious resource that could produce knowledge for developmental purposes respectively.

In addition, ethical considerations were taken into account. For example, approval and ethical clearance was obtained from the University of Zambia (the Humanities and Social Sciences Research Ethics Committee). Permission from the ZCCB and ZCU was also sought for purposes of gaining access to their institutions and conducting the study. The interview processes also started with obtaining participants' permission to participate in the study. Suffice to note that ethical issues around privacy, informed consent, anonymity, secrecy being truthful and the desirability of the research issues (Blaxter, Hughes, & Tight, 2006, p. 158) were adhered too.

Accounting for the Visibility of the Catholic Church in Public Life through University Education Provision in Zambia

Despite the polices on liberalisation in the 1990s created an enabling environment for the Catholic Church to establish their own universities, the Church's visibility in public life was driven by their own reasons for the engagement in university education provision. To start with, the intent of the Catholic Church was to widen access to university education because Zambia's public universities were unable to absorb the population seeking higher education. This high demand for higher education was partly triggered by the expansion of primary and secondary education, leading to the increase in the number of qualified secondary school graduates seeking tertiary education (Masaiti & Mwale, 2017). For instance, only 8 percent of school leavers accessed public universities in Zambia (GRZ, 2013) while the projections in 2018 were put at 10 percent (Masaiti [Personal communication], 2018). This meant that only about a quarter of the applicants to higher institutions were admitted each year, leading to a high demand for admission in the private institutions.

> The Church thus began to offer the third level of education because of the growing number of secondary school leavers in need of this university education (Participant K).

In 2011, Vatican Radio also reported that the Zambian bishops had responded to the need to provide tertiary education to the ever-growing number of school leavers in the country by establishing the Catholic university in 2008. The widening of access to university education was also with a special focus on those from vulnerable backgrounds. This was confirmed and stressed by a participant who observed that

> the situation that was obtaining was that after people completed secondary level of education, many vulnerable and poor people would not afford to go into third level of education because of the costs involved […] the Church, being on the side of the poor, introduced university education to empower the poor and vulnerable (Participant J).

The Church wanted to supplement state facilities and programmes in university education by way of producing trained and formed personnel who would devote their time and energy to the study and solving of the social questions for the integral development of the country (Chilambwe, 2018). Although Catholic university education was established to widen access to university education, Church affiliated universities could only accommodate a small number of the students who qualified for tertiary education in their institutions (Hittenberger, 2004). Nonetheless, the vision and aspirations of the Church in the sector signified the quest to serve the needs of society by collaborating with the State to expand the university education sector, thereby demonstrating that religion could be a resource in higher education.

The Church's visibility in higher education was also driven by the quest to serve the ideals of Catholic principles in education by offering her own nature of university education that was at the same time in tune with state policies in higher education. For example, the ZCU and its programmes were accredited to the HEA. An important characteristic of Catholic university education was quality holistic university education that emphasised moral formation. For example, Catholic education was grounded in the integral development of the human person in accordance with the Gospel values (Calareso, Cesareo, & McFarland, 2011). The specific purpose was the formation of boys and girls, men and women who would be good (religious) citizens of the world. Therefore, the Catholic Church became involved in university education provision to impart morals and values to students.

> The Church views the admitted students not only as individuals searching for knowledge and skills but also as ambassadors in ethical values who could provide a service to the society at large (Participant L).

The Church got involved in university education provision to ripen capacity for right judgement, introduce the students to the culture heritage of past generations, promote a sense of value, and prepare students for professional life in a spirit of service (Chilambwe, 2018). As argued by Theron (2013), Christian higher education could contribute to the general acquisition of knowledge, and the moral formation of students in particular. The emphasis on quality holistic education that encompassed

moral formation further resonates with Benne's (2001) argument on the public relevance of the Christian vision in which the mission of education remained tailored to the mission of the Church.

The Catholic Church also became visible in university education to incorporate a spiritual ethos in the life of university education. This was contrary to the post-1990 university education landscape in which religion only remained as a subject to be taught to students being prepared to teach RE in schools. The spiritual ethos was driven by aspirations to produce a particular citizenry as manifested in the institutional mottos such as "the truth shall set you free". This was translated into providing an atmosphere not only tailored to academics but also exposing students to what life was all about (through experiences meant to help students develop into complete human beings – academically, spiritually, socially, and physically). These efforts included spiritual services and worship opportunities, sports activities, prayer meetings, campus clubs, and recreational activities among others. These activities shaped the relationship between religion and education through the emphasis on holistic university education that was not prominent in public university education.

Furthermore, the chaplaincy in Christian universities remains a key element (Benne, 2001). For example, the office of the university chaplain coordinated and superintended over all spiritual related activities, including consultation and counseling at ZCU. Spiritual gatherings such as the Catholic Student Community (CASC), and the Youth Forum were also popular. The Catholic ethos was among other ways promoted by the weekly spiritual activities, such as the celebration of mass every Sunday and Wednesday in the university chapel, and the monthly spiritual exercises, such as the days of recollection once in a month in which students and members of staff were accorded an opportunity to reflect on improve through self-retrospection and prayer. The overall organisation or structure of Catholic university education reflected through the support of the Church through the bishops and their role in governance cemented the public role of the Church in university education. As Calasero et al. (2011) pointed out, the Catholic University seeks to develop the whole person, emphasising the moral, religious, social, as well as the intellectual, in an integrated fashion that helps students discover and develop fully their human dignity and potential.

The Catholic Church's engagement in public life was further motivated by the desire to offer education that fostered excellence, service, and integrity by emphasising service at different levels. Service was tied to providing the Church with an opportunity to be of service in the provision of an integrated, holistic, and quality education at the university level. Service was also related to providing students with a chance to study in a Catholic environment, in which the acquisition of advanced skills, ethical, moral, and spiritual formation was stressed (Chilambwe, 2018), as well as service to society as a whole. According to the *Ex corde Ecclesiae* (1990), service was linked to the Church and society, pastoral ministry, cultural dialogue, and evangelisation.

The understanding of service further called on students and teaching staff alike to learn to be attentive to the poorest and those who suffer economic, social, cultural or religious injustice, "the option for the poor" (Komakoma, 2003). This entailed working towards bridging the gap between the rich and poor by making it possible

for students from poor backgrounds to access and complete university education, including the adult literacy programmes that targeted women. For instance, the adult literacy programme aimed to empower women especially those disadvantaged owing to certain cultural practices such as early marriages and teenage pregnancies (ZCU, 2018). These reasons underlined the ethical concern of the Church in which preference was given to the poor in the hope of addressing equality. Therefore, religion and education interacted closely on the university education landscape as opposed to a diminished relationship attributed to secularisation.

The Church was also concerned with future leadership to serve both societal and Church needs. The Church sees the establishment of the university as a means of preparing future leaders in Zambia This was to be through developing morals and principles of leadership qualities in the upcoming generations for the service and development of the country as there is no true development of a nation without an authentic, moral, and principled leadership and knowledge for its own sake is nothing unless it is put at the service of the nation (Chelambwe, 2018). As Carpenter (2017, p. 26) notes, "Church people start these universities so their own youth can flourish, but the institutions also aim to build up a nation". To produce leadership with an ethical concern, courses like Ethics and Catholic Social Teachings taught to all students, confirm the place of religion courses in a Christian university (Schroeder, 2002, p. 23). As argued by Nguru (2008), the Church's offering of her own distinct education was linked to advancing roles related to helping a student to become a certain kind of person and do certain kinds of things by integrating a student's faith and education to produce a student who is competent in his or her profession, and also committed to apply his or her competency to address the spiritual and material conditions of the African continent and the world.

Seen through the prism of Benne's framework, the Catholic Church's engagement in university education provision renewed the religion and education interface at the university level by way of being an extension of the Catholic education system and identity.

> Catholic universities are critical tools in evangelization [...]. We do not only focus on training would be professionals but we also teach social teachings of the Church so that Christ is communicated to change the world for better. We also focus on spiritual growth of our students so that they are helpful to society in future (Chilambwe, 2016).

As concluded by Altbach (2005), Catholic institutions globally had a tradition to serve the Church. Chivore (2006) also points out that the Church's quest to foster denominational convictions at university level through formal academic education remained prominent, implying a confessional kind of education. This signified that contrary to Burtchaell's (1998) observations in the United States of America in which Christian higher education was hardly Christian at all owing to the disengagement of colleges and universities from their sponsoring Christian churches or denominations that led to a diminishing role of education as a missionary activity, the understanding

of the role of the Catholic university signified that universities were still extensions of the work of the Church.

In addition, the engagement of the Church in university education provision had contributed to the transformation of the university education landscape by adding the religion affiliated higher education category to the Zambian context. This revived the relationship between religion and education at the university level. For example, higher education became to be identified with institutions underpinned by religious identities marked by Benne's (2001) attributes of a Christian university such as Christian vision, the role of the religion or theology department, and whether any such courses are required as reflected through the foundational courses such as Ethics and Social Teachings of the Church, philosophy and Religion Studies. Similarly, the nature and frequency of chapel and the overall ethos manifested the place of chaplaincy, religious activities and Catholic identity in the institution. This demonstrated that contrary to the projections on the diminishing place of religion in higher education or the dying of the religious light in the academy in the words of Burtchaell (1998), the growth of Christian universities as exemplified by Catholic university education had renewed the role of religion in public life.

Religion as an Ethical Resource in the Transformation of Higher Education in Zambia

Most of the reasons accounting for the more visible role of religion in public life through the Church's engagement in university education provision resonates with how religion is a resource that underpins notions of development (Ter Haar and Ellis, 2006). The visibility of the Catholic Church in public life is firstly facilitated by the Catholic teachings that constitute the religious ideas (Ter Haar, 2005). These included the religious ideas of spreading the faith through education in response to the Gospel of Mark 16:15, "Go into all the world and preach the gospel to all creation". The Catholic Church was thus inspired by the Great Command in Mark 16:15 (Chilambwe, 2018). Apart from the Biblical command, the Church philosophies on integrated, holistic, and quality education enshrined in their doctrines further drove the engagement and consequent transformation of the higher education landscape through the emphasis to produce a particular kind of citizenry.

Catholic university education believed in providing a study environment that stressed the acquisition of advanced skills, ethical, moral, and spiritual formation. These teachings were backed by the provisions in the Church policy documents such as the 1965 Declaration on Christian Education, and the *Ex Corde Ecclesiae* (1990). For example, the Church teaches that education is a universal human right and as such, true education aims at the formation of the human person in the pursuit of his or her ultimate end and of the good of the society, of which he or she is a member, and in whose obligations, as an adult, he or she will share what has been imparted in him/her (Pope P. VI, 1965). While this points to how the Church draws on secular discourses of human rights to support her mission in university education provision, this stance also resonates with the Church's stance on human dignity. Hence, investing in higher

education provided another avenue to advance the internal renewal of the Church, preserve and enhance its beneficent influence upon the world, especially the intellectual world (Pope P. VI, 1965). By cooperating with the state to expand higher education, the teachings of the Church became an ethical resource by way of forming a basis for doing what was considered to be morally right through engagement in university education provision.

In addition, the practices of the Church especially in living the social gospel and serving the needs of the poor inspired the Church's engagement in contributing towards the transformation of the university education landscape through the promotion of socio-economic development of the country. These aspirations were linked to the practice of responding to the needs of society that disrupted the well-being of humanity as informed by Church's social teachings. This underpinned what the Church perceived as the ethical duty to society. The Church's resolve to widen access; foster equity and play out its prophetic role could not be detached from the Church's practice of being on the side of the needy, and a moral compass (Lemmons, 2008). For example, the principles of the Catholic social teachings of solidarity that recognises that all people and social groups are united evoked the classical notion of virtue ethics, in which individuals seek to contribute their part to the creation of a moral community, and to cultivate strength of character to donate to the common good of an expanding community (MacIntyre, 2007). This entailed that the Church was tapping into her ethical resource in collaborating with the state in the expansion of university education by being in solidarity with the needy.

The structures of the Church also facilitated the involvement of the Church in the transformation of university education landscape because while the universities were open to people from different religious orientations, the immediate pool or clientele was the Church membership itself. This resonates with Benne's (2001, p. 187) strategies for keeping the faith in Christian educational institutions such as the availability of the critical mass of faculty, administrators, board members, and students who identify strongly with the institutions' mission with the ability to articulate the vision and provide leadership. It was also through the organisational structures of the Church (ZCCB) that ZCU had been established. These actions were underpinned by the religious ethical duty to provide education. As stipulated in the Declaration on Christian Education (Pope P. VI, 1965), the duty of educating belongs to the Church, not merely because she must be recognised as a human society capable of educating, but especially because she has the responsibility of announcing the way of salvation to humanity to build a good earthly society and a world that is more human.

The experiences of the Church gained over time also gave the Catholic Church the reputation in the university education sector. The Catholic Church in Zambia was recognised as a partner in social services provision, hence hoped to use the experiences gained at the lower levels to provide quality university education since 1895 (Mwale & Simuchimba, 2018). One participant noted that

> the Church has invested a lot in primary and secondary education and a lot of people appreciate Catholic education […], a lot of people value education offered

> by the Catholic Church […] some of them [people] will openly say, "I want my child to go to a Catholic school" (Participant J).

The then Catholic University Chancellor Archbishop Ignatius Chama also noted that the Church through the experience gained at providing education at primary and secondary level was responsible for the confidence it had to provide higher education (Muvi TV News, 2015).

The student participants in the study also confirmed the trust and parents' preference to Catholic education when recounting why they had chosen Catholic university education. They pointed to their parents' desire for them to have a Catholic education despite being non-Catholics (Participant N, O, and P). Hence, with experiences gained as provider of education at primary, secondary and tertiary levels, and as a partner in catering for the broader contemporary social needs in the country (Chilambwe, 2018), the Catholic Church became a valuable resource in the state's efforts to provide more access to quality university education.

Conclusion

The article explored the visibility of religion in higher education through the engagement of the Catholic Church in university education provision in post-1990 Zambia. As a new development on the higher education landscape, the article demonstrated that the Church was contributing to the transformation of the higher education landscape through the renewed interaction between religion and education exemplified in the quest to widen access, opt for the poor, offer holistic and humanised education, and promote integral development to serve the needs of society, the Church and Catholic principles on education. The article revealed that the engagement of the Church in university education provision was driven by upholding the attributes of Benne's categories of what constituted a Christian university. It also demonstrated that religion, more specifically Catholicism, remained an ethical resource for collaborating with the State in the expansion of higher education. Based on this, the article has argued that contrary to the widely held projections that religion would diminish, the growth of the Zambian Catholic education system through university education provision demonstrated the growing visibility of religion in public life in post-1990 Zambia.

The growing visibility of religion on the university education landscape through the example of the Catholic Church was anchored on the quest to serve the needs of the Church, the principles of Catholic education and the society, thereby contributing to the transformation of the higher education landscape. As such, the article demonstrated that the Church's transformation of the university education landscape could be attributed to the strides to remain relevant through an ethical concern and the state's inability to meet the growing demand for higher education in the country. The article therefore consolidates emerging scholarship on religion in public life exemplified through Christian universities in Zambia by showing that despite being a neglected aspect, religion remained a significant facet of the higher education landscape.

References

Altbach, P. G. (2005). The Private Higher Education Revolution: An Introduction. In P. G. Albach (Ed.), *Private Higher Education* (pp. 1–9). Sense Publishers.

Benne, R. (2001). *Quality with Soul: How Six Premier Colleges and Universities keep Faith with their Religious Traditions*. Grand Rapids, MI: W.B. Eerdmans.

Blaxter, L., Hughes, C., & Tight, M. (2006). *How to Research*. New York: Open University Press.

Burtchaell, J. T. (1998). *The Dying of the Light: The Disengagement of Colleges and Universities from their Christian Churches*. Grand Rapids, MI: W.B. Eerdmans.

Calareso, J. P., Cesareo, F., & McFarland, M. C. (2011, April 7). Vision for Catholic Education: As I see it. *The Telegram.*

Carmody, B. P. (2004). *Religion and Education in Zambia*. Ndola: Mission Press.

Carmody, B. P. (2007). Catholic Church and State Relations in Zambian Education: A Contemporary Analysis. In G. Grace & O'Keefe (Eds.), *International Handbook of Catholic Education. International Handbooks of Religion and Education,* (Vol. 2, pp. 543–562). Dordrecht: Springer. DOI: 10.1007/978-1-4020-5776-2_28

Carmody, B. P. (2011). Towards a Contemporary Catholic Philosophy of Education. *International Studies in Catholic Education,* 3(2), 106–119. DOI: 10.1080/19422539.2011.600279

Carpenter, J. (2017, July 10). The Rise of Private Universities in Africa is Being Dominated by Christian Schools. *Quartz*.

Carpenter, J. (2017). Christian Universities Grow in Africa. *International Higher Education*, 88, 25–26. DOI: 10.6017/ihe.2017.88.9692

Chilambwe, P. (2016, September 2). Catholic Universities are Tools of Evangelisation – ZCU Vice Chancellor Says. *Association of Member Episcopal Conferences in Eastern Africa News.*

Chilambwe, P. (2018, September 15). *ZCU 10th Anniversary Celebration Speech.* Zambia Catholic University, Kalulushi.

Chivore, B. R. S. (2006). Private Higher Education in Zimbabwe. In N. V. Varghese (Ed.), *Growth and Expansion of Private Higher Education in Africa.* Paris: International Institute for Educational Planning.

Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morrison, K. (2007). *Research Methods in Education*. London: Routledge.

Congregation for Catholic Education (2014). *Educating Today and Tomorrow: A Renewing Passion* [Instrumentum Laboris]. Retrieved from http://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/congregations/ccatheduc/documents/rc_con_ccatheduc_doc_20140407_educare-oggi-e-domani_en.html

Creswell, J. W. (2007). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design.* London: Sage Publications.

Diedericks, M. (2019). The Idea of a "Profit-Profit" Private Christian University in South Africa. *KOERS-Bulletin for Christian Scholarship,* 84(1), 1–14.

Ex Corde Ecclesiae. (1990). *Apostolic Constitution of the Supreme Pontiff John Paul II on Catholic Universities*. Vatican.

Elphick, R. (1997). Introduction: Christianity in South African History. In R. Elphick & R. Davenport (Eds.), *Christianity in South Africa: Political, Social and Cultural History*. Los Angeles: University of California Press.

Enegho, F. E. (2017). Is Our Well Poisoned? A Historical/Economic Analysis of Christian Higher Education in Nigeria. *Missionalia*, 45(3), 236–249. DOI: 10.7832/45-3-191

Francis, B. (2001). Commonality and Difference? Attempts to Escape from Theoretical Dualisms in Emancipatory Research in Education. *International Studies in Sociology of Education*, 11(2), 157–172. DOI: 10.1080/09620210100200071

Glanzer, P. L., Carpenter, J. A., & Lantinga, N. (2011). Looking for God in the University: Examining Trends in Global Christian Higher Education. *Higher Education,* 61(6), 721–755. DOI: 10.1007/s10734-010-9359-x

Gibbs, S., & Ajulu, D. (1999). *The Role of the Church in Advocacy: Case Studies from Southern and Eastern Africa*. Oxford: INTRAC.

Government of the Republic of Zambia (GRZ). (2006). *Vision 2030*. GRZ: Lusaka.

Government of the Republic of Zambia (GRZ). (2013). *Revised Sixth National Development Plan 2013–2016*. GRZ: Lusaka.

Government of the Republic of Zambia (GRZ). (2017). *Seventh National Development Plan 2017–2021*. GRZ: Lusaka.

Hambulo, F. M. (2016). *Catholic Secondary Education and Identity Reformation in Zambia's Southern Province.* [PhD Thesis]. University of South Africa.

Higher Education Act, No. 4 (2013). GRZ: Lusaka.

Hittenberger, J. S. (2004). Globalization, "Marketization", and the Mission of Pentecostal Higher Education in Africa. *PNEUMA: The Journal of the Society for Pentecostal Studies,* 26 (2), 182–215. DOI: 10.1163/157007404776111018

Impact Correspondent. (2017). 125 Years of Catholicism in Zambia: A Need for New Evangelisation. *Impact Magazine*, p. 5.

Kelly, M. J. (1991). *Education in a Declining Economy: The Case of Zambia: 1975–1985* [EDI Development Policy Case Series. Analytical Case Studies Number 8]. Washington, DC 20433: World Bank.

Kelly, M. J. (2006). *The Origins and Development of Education in Zambia*. Lusaka: Bookworld Publishers.

Komakoma, J. (2003). *The Social Teaching of the Catholic Bishops and Other Christian Leaders in Zambia: Major Pastoral Letters and Statements 1953–2001.* Ndola: Mission Press.

Layder, D. (1998). *Sociological Practice: Linking Theory and Social Research*. London: Sage.

Lemmons, E. A. (2008). What's so Catholic about the Catholic College: How Catholic Universities and Colleges Can Maintain a Healthy Sense of their Catholic Identity. *The Catholic Spirit. The Newspaper of the Archdioceses of St. Paul and Minneapolis.*

Levy, D. (2009). Growth and Typology. In S. Bjarnason, K. M. Cheng, J. Fielden, M. J. Lemaire, D. Levy & N. V. Varghese (Eds.), *A New Dynamic: Private Higher Education* (pp. 1–22). France: United Nations Educational.

Levy, D. (2017). Christian Higher Education's Place within Private Higher Education. *International Higher Education*, 88, 22–23.

MacIntyre, A. (2007). *After Virtue*. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press.

Masaiti, G., & Mwale, N. (2017). University of Zambia: Contextualization and Contribution to Flagship Status in Zambia. In D. Teffera (Ed.), *Flagship Universities in Africa* (pp. 467–505). London: Palgrave Macmillan.

Mason, J. (2002). *Qualitative Researching*. London: Sage.

Ministry of Education. (1996). *Educating Our Future*: *National Policy on Education*. Lusaka: ZEPH.

Moustakas, C. (1994). *Phenomenological Research Methods*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Muvi TV News. (2015, October 15, 5:10 pm). *State Commends Catholic Church.* CAT.

Mwale, N., & Chita, J. (2017). Trailing a Missionary Teacher's Position and Contributions in Zambian Religious Education. *Religion and Education*, 44(1), 22–38. DOI: 10.1080/15507394.2016.1271221

Mwale, N. (2017). Portrayal of Catholic University Education in the Media: Purpose and Contributions to Education in the Twenty-First Century Zambia. *International Journal of Catholic Catholicism,* 9(1), 52–65.

Mwale, N., & Simuchimba, M. (2018). 125 Years of Catholicism in Zambia: the History and Mission of the Church in the Provision of University Education. *Oral History Journal of South Africa*, 6(1), 1–16.

Nguru, F. W. (2008). What can Christian Higher Education do to Promote Educational Well-Being in Africa? In N. Lantinga (Ed.), *Christian Higher Education in the Global Context: Implications for Curriculum, Pedagogy and Administration* (pp. 135–149). Sioux Centre: Dordt College Press.

Padilla-Díaz, M. (2015). Phenomenology in Educational Qualitative Research: Philosophy as Science or Philosophical Science. *International Journal of Educational Excellence*, 1(2), 101–110.

Polkinghorne, D. E. (1989). Phenomenological Research Methods. In R. S. Valle & S. Halling (Eds.). *Existential Phenomenological Perspectives in Psychology* (pp. 41–60). New York: Plenum.

Pope P. VI. (1965). *Declaration on Christian Education: (Gravissimum Educationis*). St. Paul Editions.

QFM News. (2017, July 15). Catholics Celebrate 125 Years of Existence in Zambia. *QFM News*.

Samarin, W. J. (1966). Religion and Modernisation in Africa. *Anthropological Quarterly,* 39(4), 288–297.

Schroeder, J. (2002). Robert Benne: Quality with Soul: How Six Premier Colleges and Universities keep Faith with their Religious Traditions. *Intersections,* 13(9), 22–23.

Scott, J. (1990). *A Matter of Record: Documentary Sources in Social Research.* Cambridge: Polity Press.

Simuchimba, M. (2005). *Religion and Education in Zambia 1890–2000 and Beyond* [PhD Thesis]. University of South Africa.

Smart, N. (1969). *The Religious Experience of Mankind.* New York: Charles Scribner's Sons.

Strauss, A., Corbin, J. M., & Corbin J. (1998). *Basics of Qualitative Research: Techniques and Procedures for Developing Grounded Theory*. London: Sage Publications.

Ter Haar, G. (2005). Religion: Source of Conflict or Resource for Peace? In G. ter Haar & J. J. Busutti (Eds.), *Bridge or Barrier: Religion. Violence and Visions for Peace* (pp. 3–34). Leiden: Brill.

Ter Haar, G., & Ellis, S. (2006). The Role of Religion in Development: Towards a New Relationship between the European Union and Africa. *The European Journal of Development Research,* 18(3), 351–367. DOI: 10.1080/09578810600893403

Theron, P. M. (2013). The Impact of Christian Higher Education on the Lives of Students and Societies in Africa. *Koers,* 78(1), 1–8. DOI: 10.4102/koers.v78i1.60

Van Manen, M. (1990). *Researching Lived Experience: Human Science for an Action Sensitive Pedagogy*. New York: Routledge.

Zambia Catholic University (ZCU). (2018). *Graduation Booklet.* ZCU: Kalulushi.

Zambia Conference of Catholic Bishops (ZCCB). (2016). *Strategic Plan 2017–2026.* ZCCB: Lusaka. ZCCB archives.

Changing Societies & Personalities, 2019
Vol. 3, No. 3, pp. 225–242
http://dx.doi.org/10.15826/csp.2019.3.3.073

ARTICLE

Education Projects for Sustainable Development: Evidence from Ural Federal University[1]

Marina V. Volkova
Ural Federal University, Yekaterinburg, Russia

Jol Stoffers
Research Centre for Employability, Zuyd University of Applied Sciences, Heerlen, the Netherlands

Dmitry M. Kochetkov
Peoples' Friendship University of Russia (RUDN University), Moscow, Russia
National Research University Higher School of Economics, Moscow, Russia

ABSTRACT
Sustainable development is a worldwide recognized social and political goal, discussed in both academic and political discourse and with much research on the topic related to sustainable development in higher education. Since mental models are formed more effectively at school age, we propose a new way of thinking that will help achieve this goal. The authors undertook this study in the context of Russia, where the topic of sustainable development in education has been yet poorly developed. The authors used the classical methodology of the case analysis. The analysis and interpretation of the results employed the framework of the institutional theory. Presented is the case of Ural Federal University, which has been working for several years on the creation of a device for the purification of industrial sewer water in the framework of an initiative student group. Schoolchildren recently joined the program, and such projects have been called university-to-school projects. Successful solutions for inventive tasks contribute to the formation of mental models. This case has been analyzed in terms of institutionalism, and the authors argue for the primacy of mental institutions over normative ones during

[1] This study was first presented at the International Conference on Sustainable Cities (Sandler, Volkova, & Kochetkov, 2018).

Received 18 August 2019
Accepted 21 September 2019
Published online 5 October 2019

m.v.volkova@urfu.ru
jol.stoffers@zuyd.nl
kochetkovdm@hotmail.com

sustainable society construction. This case study is the first to analyze a partnership between a Federal University and local schools regarding sustainable education and proposes a new way of thinking.

KEYWORDS
sustainable development, sustainable education, university-to-school projects, mental institutions, case study, Russia

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS
The authors wish to express their gratitude to anonymous reviewers, who made this paper much better. The study was conducted with the financial support of the Russian Foundation for Basic Research, project *18-00-01040 KOMFI "The Impact of Emerging Technologies on Urban Environment and the Quality of Life of Urban Communities".*

Introduction

Two polar viewpoints exist regarding Earth's climate, with proponents and opponents of the concept of global warming agreeing that humanity has contributed to climate change. Researchers are paying more and more attention to studying the causes and effects of climate change from the standpoint of social sciences (Jorgenson et al., 2019; Rosa, Rudel, York, Jorgenson, & Dietz, 2015; Rosa & Dietz, 2012). The growth of the world's population and technological advancements have required increasing amounts of energy, which can be obtained only by burning fuel. Consequently, technogenic pollution of the planet has grown steadily over the years and air quality in large cities does not meet regulatory standards, leading to increases to respiratory, cardiovascular, and allergenic diseases and generating annual financial losses comparable to the GDP of a small country. Another prominent issue is water quality. The amount of water in nature is fixed, and for use in industry, agriculture, and everyday life, the only freshwater is suitable. Contaminated water causes a decrease in the quality of drinking water, thermal pollution of water bodies, and flooding of territories. The demand for water has reached a level such that in many places, including Europe, there is an acute problem regarding the lack of freshwater. Scientists warn that in one or two generations, most of the world's population will lack freshwater (Connor, 2013).

In a synthesis report, the United Nations (UN) Secretary-General stressed sustainable development goals (SDG) for everyone (United Nations, 2014) and that no one should be left behind (Chin & Jacobsson, 2016). Universities have demonstrated a trend of redesigning their strategies and organizations in line with principles of sustainability (Beynaghi et al., 2016). Sustainability is then changing from a component of education to a social learning process (Barth & Michelsen, 2013). Universities commonly join global networks such as the Sustainable Development Solutions Network, supported by the UN, the International Sustainable Campus Network (ISCN), the Association for the Advancement of Sustainability in Higher Education (AASHE) in the United States, and the Environmental Association

for Universities and Colleges (EAUC) in the United Kingdom (Soini, Jurgilevich, Pietikäinen, & Korhonen-Kurki, 2018). A modern interpretation of sustainable development includes environmental, economic, and social dimensions (Farley & Smith, 2013; Kuhlman & Farrington, 2010; Shriberg, 2004).

The UN's vision emphasizes the role of education in building the future (United Nations, 2015). Concerning education for sustainable development (ESD), this does not entail gathering recyclable materials, feeding birds in winter, and participation in ecological events. These are essential components, but not the most vital to the present argument. Several studies suggest that the growth of professional knowledge of a scientific, technological, and socioeconomic nature directly enhances an innovative development path (Barth & Michelsen, 2013). Thus, for the greening of production to occur, there must be an increase in the general culture of people in an area. The pivotal outcome of the intellectualization of the population is the emergence of intellectual and innovative space. Its functioning requires the new type of behavior, not only for individuals but for the social and economic systems as a whole.

Intellectualization of the population and various innovations arising from it cannot develop in a short time; any society needs an extended period for its maturation, which includes the accumulation of knowledge and then turning it into a way of thinking that is suitable to the bulk of the population. Intellectual loners can only offer original ideas, describe them, and make prototypes, but only the collective efforts of a skilled workforce can transfer ideas into mass production. As a source of knowledge accumulation and generation, secondary and higher education moves to the forefront of the development of a sustainable society. Relevant skills and competencies are essential to implementing the paradigm of sustainable development (Bochko, 2015). Competence-oriented programs have been recognized as a factor in the transition of education in the direction of sustainable development (Jacobi, Toledo, & Grandisoli, 2016), a concept that many empirical studies support (Dlouhá, Glavič, & Barton, 2017).

Nevertheless, most discussions on the formation of competencies relevant to sustainable development are conducted in the context of higher education (Lambrechts, Mulà, Ceulemans, Molderez, & Gaeremynck, 2013; Mulà et al., 2017; Wiek, Withycombe, & Redman, 2011). One viewpoint suggests that the agenda of sustainable development within a framework of educational discourse is controversial and problematic, with some authors arguing that education on sustainable development is a product and carrier of globalization (Jickling & Wals, 2008). Many universities throughout the world have adopted Sustainable Development as part of their mission; however, most SD efforts were not holistically integrated throughout the HEI system. The level of individual competences is well-reviewed in Lozano et al. (2015). Kasimov (2013) summarizes ESD in Russia as the following:

> The ideology of ESD in Russia as a whole is not denied, but it is not perceived as a universal educational paradigm that objectively reflects the challenges of the time. Promotion of ESD in Russia objectively corresponds to the interests of the country, but in fact, it is inhibited.

The same is demonstrated by Ermakov (2013), who surveyed ESD experts, including researchers, university professors, methodologists, and activists of public organizations. The average assessment of the implementation of the UN's Economic Commission for Europe (ECE) strategy objectives for ESD in the Russian Federation (on a 4-point scale: 0=activity has not started, 1=activity is in process, 2=activity is developing, and 3=activity is completed) was only 0.5. A survey of teachers in several regions of Russia conducted by the same author demonstrates that 77.4% of respondents are aware of the need for ESD implementation in all educational institutions and at all levels of education. However, only a small portion (10.8%) perceive that their methodological training is sufficient for ESD implementation, and 30.4% found it difficult to answer, which most likely indicates poor familiarity with ESD (Ermakov, 2011).

Within the framework of technical education, teachers often treat sustainable development as an "aspect" of engineering (Mulder, Desha, & Hargroves, 2013). Sustainability issues need to be addressed at the meta-level, using a holistic system approach, so that educators can make decisions about conflicting issues arising from (sub)disciplinary analysis. This approach was implemented, for example, at the Energy Engineering Graduate Program at Başkent University (Wood & Edis, 2011). We argue that sustainable development requires not only skills and competencies but the formation of stable patterns of thinking. It is the point where secondary education comes to the forefront since the establishment of mental models at an early age is much more effective. Children are required to study at school from 7 to 16 years. In junior classes, the students at the natural sciences lessons are taught generally about the environment and ecology. There are also Olympiads of ecological directions for students. In some schools, children, under the guidance of teachers and supervisors, write reports or conduct feasibility studies, often an analysis of data from the Internet, on environmental topics. At university, this type of education ceases due to the organization of studies such that at the department level (apart from specialized ones), sustainable development and ecology are not primary subjects. Consequently, students have acquired some knowledge on the topic, but a way of thinking has not been formed. There is also currently a lack of innovative breakthroughs in the field of sustainable education.

Anthropogenic impacts on the Earth's biosphere is so global that governments of the world must cooperate in the field of ecology, though nuances are at play. A desire to reduce emissions of carbon dioxide into the atmosphere led to heated debates concerning the Paris Climate Agreement. One country might have concerns about reducing the anthropogenic impact on the planet, and another, for example, Great Britain, uses a climate agenda to protect its market. Some argue that global markets have a problem with carbon protectionism, which can lead to sanctions and pressure on national economies (Kilkiş, 2015). In this context, the withdrawal of the United States from the Paris Agreement represents merely the protection of the national business. Taking the problem more broadly, the entire history of the struggle for sustainable development is parallel to the history of the battle of the population for the environment, whereas, for entrepreneurs, it is for profit. Pollution control facilities are often too expensive for medium and small businesses, leaving an uneven advantage for large plants and enterprises. Thus, the choice between profit and environment

among most entrepreneurs in the world is evident. The only deterrent to ecological irresponsibility is the regulatory role of the government regarding environmental protection with the different forms of punishment such as penalties, sanctions, etc. There are entrepreneurs for whom taking care of the environment is a priority, but for most, profit comes first, and delegating environmental expenditures is an afterthought. The most environmentally conscious are young people who grew up and received education at a time when ecological problems became relevant and were discussed openly. As practice demonstrates, if a person has been exposed to environmental education since childhood, according to them, a businessperson and an ecologist should be able to make an inner compromise. As in most emerging countries, there is nearly no formal education policy concerning sustainable development in Russia. In this context, such projects are particularly important. We analyze the experiences of a partnership between Ural Federal University and local schools regarding sustainable education, and we call such projects university-to-school projects.

Recent Research

A detailed review of the literature is beyond the scope of this study, especially now a sufficient number of reviews in the field have been published. We can refer an interested reader, for example, to the work of Agbedahin (2019), which draws a certain line under empirical research and suggests future directions of research in the field of ESD. The work shows the relationship between Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) and the achievement of Sustainable Development Goals (SDG). The researchers paid considerable attention to the nexus between environmental education and ESD. Franco et al. (2018) analyze the practice of applying ESD in educational policies and curricula. The authors argued that the achievement of SDG largely depends on a better understanding of the existing gaps, focus areas, and regional differences between the Higher Education for Sustainable Development (HESD) policies. Sinakou, Boeve-de Pauw, Goossens, & Van Petegem (2018) found that teachers do not take the concept of sustainable development holistically; usually, they put more emphasis on the economic and social aspects of SD. The authors of the article argued that teacher training programs should implement a holistic approach. The Russian researchers came to similar conclusions highlighting the following problems in the development of ESD (Grishaeva, Wagner, Tkacheva, Lugovskoy, & Moro, 2018):

- the discrepancy between the trends of higher education and the objective demands in society and politics that contradict sustainable development in general;
- insufficient level of development of critical thinking of students in the process of environmental education as well as the pedagogical problem of the formation of students' reflective experience;
- the problem of "locality" and "narrow targeting" of learning content;
- the problem of the development of interdisciplinary and transdisciplinary approaches to environmental education;
- the issue of pedagogical adaptation of axiological bases of ESD.

The study by Svanström, Sjöblom, Segalàs, & Fröling (2018) considered the possibility of using Multivariate Data Analysis (MVDA) and concept maps in the learning process. The work showed the relationship between personal characteristics and background of students, on the one hand, and performance in ESD, on the other. The work by Molderez and Ceulemans (2018) highlighted systems thinking as a critical competence for ESD. Interestingly, the development of systems thinking, in this case, is built through the perception of the pieces of art. Molderez and Fonseca (2018) stressed the importance of real-world experience and service learning for the formation of sustainable development competencies.

Materials and Methods

We use the case study methodology as a research basis, a method that focuses on conducting intensive analyses of a situation that involves considering the context and using a combination of different research methods (i.e., qualitative and quantitative), data collection, and analysis. The technique was described by Eisenhardt (1989) and Yin (2003), who proposed an interpretation of the essence of a case study as a research strategy. Most contemporary researchers refer to Stake (2000/2008) and Yin (2003, 2004), which became fundamental to subsequent studies based on the situational approach (Easton, 2010; Ellet, 2007; Naumes & Naumes, 2006). Researchers identify inherent problems with the case study method. Assessing higher education sustainability case studies, Corcoran, Walker, and Wals (2004) discuss a gap between the internal need for contextual significance/importance and external demand for transferability/abstraction. Case studies are introspective and justified within a single institutional reality. If the purpose of a case study is to improve one's institutional practices, this might be sufficient, but if the goal is also to improve institutional practices elsewhere, the analysis structure should take this into account. Therefore, during the current analysis, importance was placed on context, including the institutional landscape. Analysis of institutions enables a better understanding of the processes within a social system as a whole.

In recent decades, institutional analysis, sometimes differentiated during neo-institutional analyses, has developed actively in numerous approaches. The tradition of the new institutional economics is grounding in the writings from North (1990), Eccles and Williamson (1987), and others. In sociology, the contemporary institutional analysis was summarized by W. Scott, M. Brinton, V. Nee, P. Di Maggio, and W. Powell (Romanelli, Powell, & DiMaggio, 1992; Scott, Brinton, & Nee, 1999). Culture and symbolism are given much greater emphasis in institutional analysis than in standard, primarily economic, studies of organizations and behavior (Ostrom, 2011). We understand institutions as a set of formal norms, informal constraints, and coercive mechanisms (North, 1990). Institutions can be divided broadly into four groups:

- Normative – norms, rules, customs, standards, conventions, contracts, etc. (North, 1990);
- Functional – status functions and routines (Nelson, 1994; Searle, 1995).
- Structural – organizational forms and models of transactions (Scott, 1995).

- Mental – collective representations, beliefs, stereotypes, values, cognitive schemes, etc. (Denzau & North, 1994).

We undertook the study based on the case of Ural Federal University (Yekaterinburg, Russia); we describe the case in the next section. The institutional analysis enables evaluation of the theoretical relevance of the case and its policy implications for Russia and the world.

Results

We argue that it is necessary to use school environmental practices during the initial days of a project at a university, and essential to involve students when solving practical problems. Those who engaged in ecological problems at school take the work willingly. The task should not be too narrow, but rather large, incorporating knowledge from multiple areas. As an example, we cite the disposal and treatment of polluted waters of small combined heat and power stations (CHP), and thermal power plants (TPP). The primary sources of hot water and heating are also the fundamental origins of pollution in a living area due to their locations. Losses of heat supply from CHPs and TPPs increase depending on the distance to consumers. Historically, many of them concentrate in urban environments where it is impossible to place cooling ponds, sludge accumulators, etc. At the same time, a variety of heat exchangers, scrubbers, and other equipment can be used.

Due to technological processes, a large amount of contaminated water is emitted during steam condensation at a CHP or TPP. An even more tremendous amount (10 to 15 times more than has been discharged) is needed to ensure that condensation and cooling of discharged water occur at the end. The most conservative estimates show that even a small CHP plant incurs significant losses as a result, and if we add the cost of water treatment and its disposal, the amount increases. CHPs and TPPs use water for washing boilers and other mechanisms, and if this water is thus returned to circulation for reuse, several problems can be solved simultaneously – reducing water consumption, reducing heat pollution, and obtaining an additional product – which will make the process more attractive to potential consumers and investors.

Such research has been conducted at Ural Federal University since 2008 under the supervision of M. Volkova, exclusively by students or volunteers who are not engaged in specialized departments. The problem involves a broad range of issues, including the creation of a purification technique with the help of developed biofilters and the study of the complete use of filters. The team of students changed over the years, and the range of tasks varied. Each student can choose the direction in which they work. For example, construction of a prototype is more suited to builders, use and production to physicists, and biochemists might conduct a study of optimal conditions for the operation of biofilters. These students publish their findings, resulting in the formation of ecological thinking.

The team that is the focus of this study is uncommon; its composition changes regularly, all students are technical specialists, and the principle is voluntary work. Work in the research team occurs during the first year, and there is no compensation

or funding. The team is working on a topical issue; the leader wants to show that environmental protection is not costly, as is commonly believed. Groups of similar-minded people wishing to improve the ecological situation are capable of solving environmental problems. The need for such work appears to be shaped by the educational component, in addition to the environmental one, and there was thus a desire to attract students to scientific work to broaden their horizons and develop their creative abilities. The involvement of students in solving practical environmental problems was effective. Students' engagement during their first year empowers a system of continuous ecological education. Creativity enables personal freedom, unites similar-minded people, and distracts from reality. Such teams are an excellent opportunity for the integration or inclusion of students with disabilities, who can realize their potential at creative discussions and while studying or processing experimental materials. If their state of health does not allow them to participate personally, modern means of communication allows these children to communicate remotely.

For people with disabilities, much is done to create an accessible environment, but the most critical aspect is a sense of necessity and usefulness to others, achieved by working in creative teams. It enables communication with others on equal footing, a realization of one's thoughts and projects, and in the end, raises self-esteem. We had an opportunity to verify this statement from experience. In a team of students during the Ural Project Session on Tavatuy, there was a child with disabilities, expressed in the impossibility of concentrating continuously on work, quick fatigue, and absent-mindedness. He nevertheless gladly took readings from the instruments and research information (for a more extended period than the rest of the children). His role in preparing video reports for the presentation was irreplaceable due to his double role as both actor and director. Restrictions related to his health limitations did not allow him to engage in physical labor, but in the team, he was responsible for his part of the work.

What attracts students to a job that is not paid and occupies their spare time? According to the results of unstructured interviews with program participants[2], the answers are:

- a possibility to develop creative ideas;
- an opportunity to participate in the scientific conferences;
- the student might not become a scientist in the future, but an experience of presenting publicly is always useful.

The first presenters are usually hesitant, and the presentations are not gripping to the audience. However, after a year or two, the students are confident speakers, communicating effectively with the audience. The only thing that remains for students to remember about their work is certificates, presentations, and publications. From the data collected, the team of researchers developed a schematic diagram of the device, which has advantages such as compactness and wastelessness and can be adapted easily to particular features of production. Thus, from the original idea and due to the

[2] An interview was conducted with all participants of the program, and aimed at answering two questions: 1) what is your motive for participating in the program, and 2) what results have you received/plan to get from participation in the program?

initiative of students and proposals that explore several aspects, the project divided into three parallel studies:

- application of purified water (for irrigation and plant cultivation);
- studying the possibility of obtaining biogas from biomass grown during the purification of condensate;
- development and improvement of the machine itself (patent application is in the process now).

A few issues require closer examination and study in the future. The team participated several times in competitions to receive funding from UMNIK[3], from which we obtained good reviews. We are hopeful that funding will come, and without it, all projects will have to be postponed and possibly ended. Fortunately, there are many creative children in the country, and they have a desire to contribute to environmental improvement. While working on the project and participating in conferences, the students unconsciously attracted attention to ecological issues. For this work and during different years, two received Vernadsky nominal scholarships[4]. Even more important are the social skills the students gained such that whatever they do in their lives, they will be able to rally themselves around like-minded people. Interesting studies and substantial proposals were developed, with enthusiasm as the sole driver. The students had an opportunity to realize their ideas while doing something exciting and necessary. Not all of them enrolled in postgraduate or master's studies in an environmental field. From custom, we preserve the work of previous generations of student volunteers in memory of the crucial work they performed. The quantity is irrelevant; the purpose is that students have a clearer understanding of the environment as a science. Some students continued their education, and the articles helped with admission to post-graduate or master's programs, and others found employment. Only 20% enrolled in environmental master's studies, with one individual in postgraduate studies. Sixty percent majored in life safety[5] and chose an ecological career path after graduation.

Students can begin this work even earlier. Beginning at grades 7 or 8, a sufficient stock of knowledge accumulates among students, and their desire to apply them to practical tasks. A striking example is the Ural Project Session held for gifted students by Ural Federal University. To participate in the session, a student must pass a contest to which students from the 7th to 11th grades were admitted. The job included several directions, one of which was Intellectual Energy Systems. During the session, a project titled *Purification of Technical Water from Power Plants Using Simple Algae* was developed. The team consisted of 5 people – 2 students from the 11th grade, two from 10th, and one from 8th. The students not only understood the problem entirely but developed and assembled a prototype. The device consisted of three filters (Figure).

[3] A program of the Fund for the Promotion of Innovation that finances youth projects with scientific novelty (http://umnik.fasie.ru).

[4] In 1996, the Vernadsky Fund established a scholarship awarded to environmental students and students of other majors dealing with sustainable development, and in 2004, scholarships for postgraduate and doctoral students were established (http://www.vernadsky.ru/projects-of-the-foundation/scholarships-named).

[5] This major is similar to labor protection.

Contaminated water entering the pipe in the first filter (far left) is subjected to primary purification from coarse contamination. In filters 2 and 3, there are algae, in which polluted water is saturated with oxygen, which changes the hardness. Indications of temperature, light, and hardness are controlled automatically by sensors on a control panel. If a sensor detects a decrease in hardness to a predetermined degree, the valve opens automatically, and purified water returns to the system or goes on to other uses (a tap is demonstrated on the stand). If the water does not reduce the hardness sufficiently, controlled by a solenoid, it returns to a new cleaning cycle. Thus, a closed cycle enables the water to be purified to a predetermined value (Fig. 1).

Figure 1. *The water purification machine assembled by schoolchildren*

The idea was so exciting to the students that at the conclusion of the session, the team did not disband. The students created the group NP Team on social media and continue to participate in grant competitions. There is intent to advance the development of a comprehensive method for cleaning contaminated water from CHP plants. The rector of Ural Federal University supported the pilot project, and students were given the opportunity to create prototypes. The only downside is that two of the students are graduating this year. However, one of the graduates is on track to enter Ural Federal University, and the two students of non-graduating classes (40% of the team) are participating in UrFU projects.

The team has also participated in the Ural Project Session in the educational center *Sirius* (Sochi). One hundred students who had passed competitive selection attended. Students from public, municipal, and private schools located in the Russian Federation in the regions of the Urals and Western Siberia were eligible to participate in the competition. The purpose of the Ural Project Session was the identification, development, and support of gifted students in design and research. Tasks to be performed during the session included:

- activation of creative, cognitive, and intellectual initiatives of students who show interest and an inclination to studying mathematics and earth sciences;
- identification and support of students with an aptitude for research and development;
- generalization and development of best practices in the study of mathematics, physics, chemistry, and biology in upper grades, including preparation for Olympiads, development of research and educational projects, and organization of the extracurricular work of students;
- engagement of scientists, specialists from research institutions, and higher education institutions to work with students.

One of the results was a project to create environmentally friendly thermal power plants using photosynthetic processes. The use of algae to produce future bioethanol fuels is currently very relevant. At the moment, based on the Department of Nuclear Power Plants and Renewable Energy Sources with the help of talented schoolchildren, a project is being developed to obtain bioethanol from algae grown on the polluted waters of thermal power plants. The first experiments conducted by the team showed that the alcohol content in bioethanol from algae grown on water after a contact heat exchanger is 2–2.5 times higher than that of algae grown on pure water. Thus, problems of recycling low-potential waste heat are solved, as well as the reduction of carbon dioxide emissions and thermal pollution; ponds accumulators can be converted into bioplants. The use of the photosynthesis process technology will make it possible to significantly compensate for the oxygen consumption of the CHP and TPP.

At the same time, the rate of oxygen generation is 3–5 times higher than the rate in natural ecosystems when using algae and the elevated temperature of the wastewater of thermal power plants. As a result, this will lead to an increase in the quality of life of the population. Thus, an overall reduction of anthropogenic impact, cleaning ponds and obtaining bioethanol will ultimately make CHP and TPP more environmentally friendly.

Discussion and Conclusions

The growth of the Earth's population, industry development, and an increase in environmental pollution is not a positive prospect for the ecological future of the planet, and the younger generations realize this, the better. Quietly contemplating and understanding the scale of the impending disaster is insufficient. To amend the situation, we must create, work on, and try to solve problems. There is an old Soviet film, "Cherez ternii k zviozdam" (*Through the Thorns to the Stars*), in which Earthmen visit a planet that was brought to a nearly unfit state by its inhabitants, and who spend their time doing general cleaning. The earth becomes suitable for life again. It is a fantastical dream, but we need to solve the problems ourselves. We argue that the problem can be solved through school and student environmental creativity. Of course, students sometimes do not have sufficient knowledge, but enthusiasm and a desire to apply their knowledge to something important can overcome this. Probably, this will

not influence every student similarly, but the more such programs are available, the faster a generation will develop with a sustainable way of thinking.

It is unjustified to consider that the work of students is insignificant and impractical. There are many ways to reduce emissions at CHPs and TPPs. Nearly all methods of reducing the environmental load are energy-consuming, expensive, and cumbersome, but all were developed in research institutions by large teams. Students do not have the same financial resources, so they use elementary materials in their studies. The outcome is inexpensive and produces a more attractive product, and by solving a specific applied problem, it is, therefore, possible to create an active position about sustainable development in younger generations.

Consider the problem from an institutional theory viewpoint. Normative institutions are among the most rigid formal institutions, which rely on violence as a coercive mechanism. The government relies on this type of institution. Routines are repetitive, standard, and predictable procedures for solving similar problems. The theory of structural institutions was developed at the firm level, but the model also operates at the national level. It determines not only the structure itself but the model of interaction of various elements of a system. Mental institutions or mental models imply a similar perception and interpretation of reality. At the core of mental institutions are values integral to the culture of the individual and society. At the same time, values are divided into both absolutes, which an individual always follows, and relatives, which are conducted only when profitable.

Functional and structural institutions are derived from normative and mental ones, and we can thus define the latter as primary institutions. The importance of mental institutions is greater. Transaction costs of accession and evasion determine the adoption of regulatory institutions; if transaction costs of fraud are lower than the costs of compliance, a person will choose not to comply with the norm. Another element of public consciousness is an ideology, which combined with institutions and mental models determines individual choices and affects economic, social, cultural, and environmental indicators. Mental models, institutions, and ideologies are part of the process by which people interpret and order the environment. Mental models are endogenous and to some extent unique to each person. Exogenous ideologies and institutions provide a closer sharing of beliefs and ordering of the environment. Relationships among mental models, ideologies, and institutions depend on the product and the environment. We do not have sufficient information about how progression occurs in mind (Denzau & North, 1994), but we can assert that mental models form most effectively at a young age, and their formation occurs over a long period. In the case of mental institutions, transaction costs of evasion are incredibly high because they are supported by both social and internal mechanisms of moral evaluation. The costs of changing mental institutions are also high, and we, therefore, conclude that only people with stable mental models of sustainable development can guarantee a sustainable future. It does not negate the role of normative institutions during the transitional period since the formation of mental institutions takes a long time (at least one or two generations). During this period, normative institutions create greenhouse conditions for the development of mental institutions.

Sustainable development largely depends on individual competencies. Nevertheless, today, there is no agreement among researchers what they should be. This case correlates with the German definition of "shaping competence" (de Haan, 2006; de Haan et al., 2008; Rieckmann, 2012) many universities have undertaken activities for implementing Higher Education for Sustainable Development (HESD which includes:

- competence in anticipatory thinking;
- competence in interdisciplinary work;
- competence in cosmopolitan perception and change of perspectives;
- competence in handling incomplete and complex information;
- participatory competence;
- competence in cooperation;
- competence in dealing with individual decision dilemmas;
- competence in self-motivation and motivating others;
- competence in reflection on personal and cultural models;
- competence in independent action;
- competence in ethical action;
- capacity for empathy and solidarity.

How does this skill set correlate with the case described? First and foremost, it is proactive thinking. One should note that the work of large research teams is often somewhat "stamped" and therefore, employees are to some extent devoid of creativity. School and university teams in this case, on the contrary, can afford any, sometimes fantastic ideas. If the concept has further development, then it can develop the competence of advanced thinking. At the same time, unviable ideas evoke a craving for knowledge, a desire to understand why this is impossible now. The project is interdisciplinary. When creating the installation, it was necessary to apply programming skills, design skills, automation skills, and management skills. Each team member was responsible for the separate area, but at the same time, the students worked as one team helping each other. As a result, each of them acquired new competencies and knowledge in other disciplines.

Working on a project that meets one of the global challenges changes perspectives and mindset. The project presents an alternative way to absorb CO_2, the main greenhouse gas that poses a threat to all of humanity. Thus, the understanding of the global nature of the task leads to the desire to participate. Everyone participates in the work by virtue of their skills, and this creates a team. Having different knowledge and skills, schoolchildren and students utterly different in character are to submit their project to the jury during the project session. They can complete the task only in close cooperation and with mutual assistance. We agree that personal background affects performance in ESD (Svanström et al., 2018); at the same time, teamwork smoothes the differences.

Each member of the team is an equal participant in the research team. This or that task is not imposed on anyone. Everyone chooses a job in a project on which he works independently. The supervisor basically does not offer a ready-made solution, so the team members need to analyze the data themselves and find the missing

information. Sometimes, they had to use incomplete data, analyze and interpret it taking into account the capabilities and knowledge to achieve your goal. While working on the interdisciplinary project, everyone is responsible for a particular stage of work: e.g., someone can program, and someone else has design skills. The project approach enables the solution of the problem of interdisciplinarity (Grishaeva et al., 2018; Sinakou et al., 2018) more effectively than the traditional curriculum. Besides, the case supports the thesis that real-world experience is critical for ESD (Molderez & Fonseca, 2018). We had a situation when a member of the team responsible for connecting the automation was able to convince the team to change the design for a more reliable connection of control systems. Thus, the schoolchildren formed the competence of individual decisions within the framework of their task.

In the end, the schoolchildren and students working in a team have a different nationality, which leaves an imprint on the behavior of an individual. Teamwork helps to make sense of one's behavior as well to get acquainted with the behavioral models and culture and other team members. In our opinion, the ability to respect others builds the competence of ethical action, i.e., respect is a solution to axiological problems.

However, we must keep in mind that we are considering the initiative of a particular university. Even though such an initiative is not unique, we cannot talk about the existence of an established national policy at the moment. It is what Russia really lacks. Besides, we consider the case from the standpoint of institutional analysis, but Sustainable Development in higher education is an interdisciplinary object of study in its essence. For example, students' perceptions, as well as community engagement, can be the subjects of further case studies and theoretical contributions. Russia, with its transforming higher education system, is an extremely voluminous and significant research niche.

References

Agbedahin, A. V. (2019). Sustainable Development, Education for Sustainable Development, and the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development: Emergence, Efficacy, Eminence, and Future. *Sustainable Development,* 27(4), 669–680. DOI: 10.1002/sd.1931

Barth, M., & Michelsen, G. (2013). Learning for Change: an Educational Contribution to Sustainability Science. *Sustainability Science*, 8(1), 103–119. DOI: 10.1007/s11625-012-0181-5

Beynaghi, A., Trencher, G., Moztarzadeh, F., Mozafari, M., Maknoon, R., & Leal Filho, W. (2016). Future Sustainability Scenarios for Universities: Moving Beyond the United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 112, 3464–3478. DOI: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2015.10.117

Bochko, V. S. (2015). Intellektual'noe obespechenie innovatsionnogo razvitiia ékonomiki [Intellectual Support of Innovative Development of the Economy]. *Innovatsionnoe Razvitie Ėkonomiki: Tendentsii i Perspektivy*, 1, 14–26.

Chin, A., & Jacobsson, T. (2016). TheGoals.org: Mobile Global Education on the Sustainable Development Goals. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 123, 227–229. DOI: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2015.08.061

Connor, S. (2013, May 24). Lack of Fresh Water Could Hit Half the World's Population by 2050. *Independent*. Retrieved from http://www.independent.co.uk/news/science/lack-of-fresh-water-could-hit-half-the-world-s-population-by-2050-8631613.html

Corcoran, P.B., Walker, K.E., & Wals, A.E. (2004). Case Studies, Make-Your-Case Studies, and Case Stories: a Critique of Case-Study Methodology in Sustainability in Higher Education. *Environmental Education Research*, 10(1), 7–21.

de Haan, G. (2006). The BLK "21" Programme in Germany: a "Gestaltungskompetenz"-Based Model for Education for Sustainable Development. *Environmental Education Research*, 12(1), 19–32. DOI: 10.1080/13504620500526362

de Haan, G., Kamp, G., Lerch, A., Martignon, L., Müller-Christ, G., & Nutzinger, H.-G. (2008). *Nachhaltigkeit und Gerechtigkeit*. Springer Science & Business Media. DOI: 10.1007/978-3-540-85492-0

Denzau, A.T., & North, D.C. (1994). Shared Mental Models: Ideologies and Institutions. *Kyklos*, 47(1), 3–31.

Dlouhá, J., Glavič, P., & Barton, A. (2017). Higher Education in Central European Countries – Critical Factors for Sustainability Transition. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 151, 670–684. DOI: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2016.08.022

Easton, G. (2010). Critical Realism in Case Study Research. *Industrial Marketing Management*, 39(1), 118–128. DOI: 10.1016/j.indmarman.2008.06.004

Eccles, R.G., & Williamson, O.E. (1987). The Economic Institutions of Capitalism: Firms, Markets, Relational Contracting. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 32(4), 602–605. DOI: 10.2307/2392889

Eisenhardt, K.M. (1989). Building Theories from Case Study Research. *The Academy of Management Review*, 14(4), 532–550. DOI: 10.2307/258557

Ellet, W. (2007). *The Case Study Handbook: How to Read, Discuss, and Write Persuasively about Cases*. Boston: Harvard Business School Press.

Ermakov, D.S. (2011). Obrazovanie v interesakh ustoychivogo razvitiia v Rossii: sostoianie, otsenka progressa i perspektivy [Education for Sustainable Development in Russia: Status, Assessment of Progress and Prospects]. *Ėkologicheskoe obrazovanie: do shkoly, v shkole, vne shkoly*, 2, 28–33.

Ermakov, D.S. (2013). Shkola na puti k ustoichivomu razvitiiu [The School on the Way to Sustainable Development]. *Na Puti k Ustoĭchivomu Razvitiiu Rossii*, 64, 8–16.

Farley, H.M., & Smith, Z.A. (2013). *Sustainability: If It's Everything, Is It Nothing?* New York and London: Routledge.

Franco, I., Saito, O., Vaughter, P., Whereat, J., Kanie, N., & Takemoto, K. (2018). Higher Education for Sustainable Development: Actioning the Global Goals in Policy, Curriculum and Practice. *Sustainability Science*. DOI: 10.1007/s11625-018-0628-4

Grishaeva, Y. M., Wagner, I. V., Tkacheva, Z. N., Lugovskoy, A. M., & Moro, P. N. (2018). Education for Sustainable Development Today: A Problem Area for Overcoming Difficulties of Pedagogical Adaptation. *South of Russia: Ecology, Development*, 13(3), 159–166. DOI: 10.18470/1992-1098-2018-3-159-166

Jacobi, P. R., Toledo, R. F., & Grandisoli, E. (2016). Education, Sustainability and Social Learning. *Brazilian Journal of Science and Technology*, 3(1), 3.

Jickling, B., & Wals, A. E. J. (2008). Globalization and Environmental Education: Looking beyond Sustainable Development. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 40(1), 1–21. DOI: 10.1080/00220270701684667

Jorgenson, A. K., Fiske, S., Hubacek, K., Li, J., McGovern, T., Rick, T., Schor, J. B., Solecki, W, York, R., & Zycherman, A. (2019). Social Science Perspectives on Drivers of and Responses to Global Climate Change. *Wiley Interdisciplinary Reviews: Climate Change*, 10(1), e554. DOI: 10.1002/wcc.554

Kasimov, N. S. (2013, November). Ėkologicheskoe obrazovanie [Ecological Education]. Paper presented at *3rd All-Russian Conference on Environmental Education*, Moscow. Retrieved from http://greenlight-int.org/files/Презентации Экоконференция/4.Касимов.pdf

Kilkiş, Ş. (2015). Educating Future Energy Engineers for Sustainability: Case Study in Energy Economy. *Journal of Sustainable Development of Energy, Water and Environment Systems*, 3(1), 26–48. DOI: 10.13044/j.sdewes.2015.03.0003

Kuhlman, T., & Farrington, J. (2010). What is Sustainability? *Sustainability*, 2, 3436–3448.

Lambrechts, W., Mulà, I., Ceulemans, K., Molderez, I., & Gaeremynck, V. (2013). The Integration of Competences for Sustainable Development in Higher Education: an Analysis of Bachelor Programs in Management. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 48, 65–73. DOI: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2011.12.034

Lozano, R., Ceulemans, K., Alonso-Almeida, M., Huisingh, D., Lozano, F. J., Waas, T., Lambrechts, W., Lukman, R., & Hugé, J. (2015). A Review of Commitment and Implementation of Sustainable Development in Higher Education: Results from a Worldwide Survey. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 108, 1–18. DOI: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2014.09.048

Molderez, I., & Ceulemans, K. (2018). The Power of Art to Foster Systems Thinking, One of the Key Competencies of Education for Sustainable Development. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 186, 758–770. DOI: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.03.120

Molderez, I., & Fonseca, E. (2018). The Efficacy of Real-World Experiences and Service Learning for Fostering Competences for Sustainable Development in

Higher Education. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 172, 4397–4410. DOI: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2017.04.062

Mulà, I., Tilbury, D., Ryan, A., Mader, M., Dlouhá, J., Mader, C., Benayas, J., Dlouhý, J., & Alba, D. (2017). Catalysing Change in Higher Education for Sustainable Development. *International Journal of Sustainability in Higher Education*, 18(5), 798–820. DOI: 10.1108/IJSHE-03-2017-0043

Mulder, K., Desha, C., & Hargroves, K. (2013). Sustainable Development as a Meta-Context for Engineering Education. *Journal of Sustainable Development of Energy, Water and Environment Systems*, 1(4), 304–310. DOI: 10.13044/j.sdewes.2013.01.0023

Naumes, W., & Naumes, M.J. (2006). *The Art & Craft of Case Writing*. New York, NY: Routledge.

Nelson, R.R. (1994). Routines. In G. Hodgson, W. Samuels, & M. Tool (Eds.), *The Elgarcompanion to Institutional and Evolutionary Economics.* (Vol. 2, pp. 249–253). Aldershot: Edward Elgar.

North, D.C. (1990). *Institutions, Institutional Change, and Economic Performance*. Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press.

Ostrom, E. (2011). Institutional Analysis and Development: Elements of the Framework in Historical Perspective. In C. Crothers (Ed.), *Historical Developments and Theoretical Approachers in Sociology* (Vol. 2). Retrieved from https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/4dfe/f508d7f9698b03ab4d94c31cd812db3b51ff.pdf?_ga=2.60590820.836967844.1568659198-936618499.1568659198

Rieckmann, M. (2012). Future-Oriented Higher Education: Which Key Competencies Should be Fostered Through University Teaching and Learning? *Futures*, 44(2), 127–135. DOI: 10.1016/j.futures.2011.09.005

Romanelli, E., Powell, W.W., & DiMaggio, P.J. (1992). The New Institutionalism in Organizational Analysis. *The Academy of Management Review*, 17(3), 612–615. DOI: 10.2307/258726

Rosa, E.A., Rudel, T.K., York, R., Jorgenson, A.K., & Dietz, T. (2015). The Human (Anthropogenic) Driving Forces of Global Climate Change. In R.E. Dunlap & R.J. Brulle (Eds.), *Climate Change and Society: Sociological Perspectives* (pp. 32–60). DOI: 10.1093/acprof

Rosa, E.A., & Dietz, T. (2012). Human Drivers of National Greenhouse-Gas Emissions. *Nature Climate Change*, 2(8), 581–586. DOI: 10.1038/nclimate1506

Sandler, D., Volkova, M., & Kochetkov, D. (2018). University-to-School Environmental Projects for Sustainable Development: A Case of Ural Federal University. *IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science*, 177, 012034. DOI: 10.1088/1755-1315/177/1/012034

Scott, W.R. (1995). *Institutions and Organizations. Ideas, Interests and Identities*. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications.

Scott, W. R., Brinton, M. C., & Nee, V. (1999). The New Institutionalism in Sociology. *Contemporary Sociology*, 28(4), 425–426. DOI: 10.2307/2655306

Searle, J. (1995). *The Construction of Social Reality*. New York: Free Press.

Shriberg, M. (2004). Assessing Sustainability: Criteria, Tools, and Implications. In P. B. Corcoran & A. E. J. Wals (Eds.) *Higher Education and the Challenge of Sustainability* (pp. 71–86). Dordrecht: Springer. DOI: 10.1007/0-306-48515-X_6

Sinakou, E., Boeve-de Pauw, J., Goossens, M., & Van Petegem, P. (2018). Academics in the Field of Education for Sustainable Development: Their Conceptions of Sustainable Development. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 184, 321–332. DOI: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.02.279

Soini, K., Jurgilevich, A., Pietikäinen, J., & Korhonen-Kurki, K. (2018). Universities Responding to the Call for Sustainability: A Typology of Sustainability Centres. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 170, 1423–1432. DOI: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2017.08.228

Stake, R. E. E. (2000). *The Art of Case Study Research* (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications.

Stake, R. E. E. (2008). Qualitative Case Studies. In N. Denzin & Y. Lincoln (Eds.), *Strategies of Qualitative Inquiry* (3rd ed., pp. 119–150). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications.

Svanström, M., Sjöblom, J., Segalàs, J., & Fröling, M. (2018). Improving Engineering Education for Sustainable Development Using Concept Maps and Multivariate Data Analysis. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 198, 530–540. DOI: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.07.064

United Nations. (2014). *The Road to Dignity by 2030: Ending Poverty, Transforming All Lives and Protecting the Planet Synthesis (*Report of the Secretary-General on the post-2015 agenda). Retrieved from https://documents-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N14/670/01/PDF/N1467001.pdf?OpenElement

United Nations. (2015). Transforming Our World: the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. *General Assembley 70 Session*, 16301 (October), 1–35. DOI: 10.1007/s13398-014-0173-7.2

Wiek, A., Withycombe, L., & Redman, C. L. (2011). Key Competencies in Sustainability: a Reference Framework for Academic Program Development. *Sustainability Science*, 6(2), 203–218. DOI: 10.1007/s11625-011-0132-6

Wood, T., & Edis, T. (2011, August 31). Pain of Carbon Protectionism. *The Australian Financial Review*, p. 59.

Yin, R. K. (2003). *Case Study Research: Design and Methods*. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications.

Yin, R. K. (2004). *The Case Study Anthology*. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications.

Changing Societies & Personalities, 2019
Vol. 3, No. 3, pp. 243–257
http://dx.doi.org/10.15826/csp.2019.3.3.074

ARTICLE

Discourse of Modernist Heritage and New Ways of Thinking about Socialist Urban Areas in Eastern Europe

Mikhail S. Ilchenko
Institute for Philosophy and Law, Ural Branch of the Russian Academy of Sciences, Yekaterinburg, Russia
Ural Federal University, Yekaterinburg, Russia
Leibniz Institute for the History and Culture of Eastern Europe (GWZO), Germany

ABSTRACT
Dealing with the socialist urban legacy proved to become one of main challenges for the cities of Eastern Europe in the last decades. The fall of socialism found most of the socialist urban areas either as "rejected" heritage or as a sort of "devastated" spaces which had lost their functional meaning, symbolic significance, and any clear narratives. In such conditions, it is particularly important to watch out for those processes, which enable socialist urban legacy to acquire new languages and symbols in order to be included into the current social dynamics. This article explores the potential of the world modernist heritage discourse in giving a new approach to interpreting urban legacy of socialist era. Over the past decade, the sharp increase in the activities around re-thinking and revitalization of modernist heritage turned into a global trend. For Eastern Europe modernist legacy appeared to become a certain lens, through which it is possible to explore various visions of the Eastern European urban past within different contexts. The article seeks to reveal how the global discourse of modernist heritage influences current perceptions and attitudes towards the socialist urban legacy in the Eastern European countries, and aims to find out to what extent it facilitates integration of this legacy into changing symbolic contexts.

Received 18 August 2019
Accepted 17 September 2019
Published online 5 October 2019

msilchenko@mail.ru

KEYWORDS
socialist city, post-socialist city, modernist heritage, urban narratives, urban identity, discourse of world heritage, Eastern Europe

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS
This research was supported by the Russian Science Foundation (grant №17-18-01165)

Introduction

Mastering the Socialist urban heritage has become one of the key challenges to many Eastern European cities in the last twenty years. The main concern is not caused by its current functionality such as the questions of how to efficiently adjust these buildings to the new conditions or how to integrate them into the modern urban space. Rather, it is the public attitude to this heritage, and the problem of how this socialist legacy should be treated and spoken of in the present. After the demise of socialism, enormous housing and residential districts, which defined the visual distinctiveness and spatial structure of many cities for decades, lost their purpose and hardly any new meanings were attached to them in subsequent development. Unsurprisingly, many authors have recently turned to exploring the ways of describing post-socialist spaces and focused on the diverse urban narratives and city texts (Young & Kaczmarek, 2008; Czepczyński, 2010; Center for Urban History of East Central Europe, 2017; Sigma, 2016).

The emotional and symbolical rejection of socialist urban heritage was evidently a natural reaction to the social transformations of the 1990s. But it was a temporary stage in public discussion about this legacy (Czepczyński, 2008). For many cities, socialist buildings remained essential elements of their urban space and, therefore, required new interpretations and new significations.

In this context, the new approaches to interpreting modernist urban heritage in Eastern European countries gained currency in diverse fields of study and cultural activism. Once socialist architecture is regarded as a part of global cultural heritage of modernism, buildings and districts of socialist construction could be inscribed into new global contexts and endowed with new meanings.

In Eastern Europe, one has to remember, modernist architecture of different parts of the region is associated with different historical periods. For countries such as Poland, Czech Republic, Slovakia, and Lithuania, pre-war modernism symbolizes their newly acquired independence and, is, therefore, in stark contrast with the period of postwar socialism (Szczerski, 2010; Galusek, 2018). For other post-Soviet states (Russia, Ukraine, Belarus), however, this architecture ushered in an epoch of utopian socialism, which in the following decades would engender new cultural forms (Cohen, 2011; Kosenkova, 2009).

It is, therefore, crucial to understand how modernist socialist heritage is adopted and appropriated by new urban narratives in various local contexts, and how different are the ways of interpreting it. The aim of this article is to reveal how the discourse of

world modernist heritage influences current perceptions and public representations of the socialist urban legacy in the countries of Eastern Europe, and, thus, to find out to what extent it facilitates integration of this legacy into changing symbolic contexts.

Modernist Heritage in Eastern Europe: Global Trends and Local Contexts

Since the early 2000s, increased scholarly interest in urban modernist heritage has turned into a global trend (Voss & Molitor, 2018; Ritter & Vienna Center of Architecture, 2013; Kulić, Parker & Penick 2015; Beil & Schmitz, 2002). Soviet modernist districts first of the interwar and then of the post-war period gradually garnered the attention of urban activists, scholars, architects, artists, and intellectuals from different countries all over the world.

The processes around the Soviet modernist heritage in Eastern Europe followed the global trends. Every step in the symbolic "discovery" of modernist East European architecture reproduced the stages elsewhere in the world. At first, modernist districts were seen by the public as objects of special cultural significance and world "heritage" (Haspel, Petzet, & Schmückle-Mollard, 2008; ICOMOS Germany, 2013; Belyakova, Dushkina, & Mikeska 2006), then they were turned into objects of aesthetic interest and artistic practices (Prents, 2014; Hoppe, 2014; Pare, 2007), and later they became attractive to tourists (Czepczyński, 2008, pp. 132–137; Hlaváčková, 2012; Gdynia City Hall, 2016).

One distinguishing feature shared by Eastern European countries is the way of looking at modernist architecture as an embodiment of critical historical periods – periods of social experimentation and radical cultural change, which still largely determine the appearance and identity of post-socialist cities. In these conditions, managing the modernist heritage is instrumental in representing the past, its atmosphere and historical symbols. Modernist districts of Eastern European cities can be aestheticized or used for creating new architectural forms (Bartetzky, Dietz, & Haspel, 2014, pp. 195–273; Ershov & Savitskii, 2008). They might be perceived from nostalgic and romanticized perspective (Czepczyński, 2008, pp. 143–147; Young & Kaczmarek, 2008). They can engender the search for new cultural meanings or historical reflection (Galusek, 2018; Kladnik, 2009). But, one way or another, these urban districts are inevitably involved into the symbolic dialogue with the past.

Images of the past of Eastern European cities are incorporated into the new discourses for describing modernist housing, which, in their turn, become integral to new urban narratives. It should be noted that, on the one hand, in each local context, modernist architecture refers to specific historical symbols and periods such as the formation of the Soviet state, development of the new nation states in Eastern Europe, and strengthening of socialist regimes in the post-war period. On the other hand, this architecture also pertains to the narrative of global cultural heritage, which incorporates all these countries, cities, periods and epochs into unified symbolic space, blurring the national and historical boundaries. This double implication is particularly relevant to the architecture of socialist modernism, which thus acquires new opportunities for representation outside specific ideological interpretations.

The article sets out to examine the cases of several countries, in particular the means and ways of inscribing socialist urban districts into the narrative of global modernist heritage. The second part of the article explores contemporary public representations of the districts in former socialist cities in Russia and Ukraine; these districts were an example of interwar modernist urban architecture in the Soviet Union. The third part focuses on the cases of two Polish cities: Katowice, which became a site of intensive modernist construction in the interwar and postwar periods, and Krakow with its industrial district of Nowa Huta, a symbol of socialist urban construction in post-war Eastern Europe.

The analysis mostly deals with policy documents, presentation materials and strategies of urban development, materials of multiple art projects, as well as expert interviews with urban and social activists, representatives of the active urban community who take part in the preservation of the modernist heritage in post-socialist cities. In a word, the material analyzed here comprises all the sources, which could shed light on the dominant ways of representing the Eastern European modernist urban heritage in the public discourse that is defined and shaped by the "expert community" (Lefebvre, 1991). Consequently, this paper follows the tradition that analyzes urban space as a "social product" (Lefebvre, 1991; Soja, 1996), in particular, its dominant perceptions and representations established in the public discourse (Lefebvre, 1991; Fraser, 2015; Stanek, 2011).

Soviet City in the World Heritage Discourse

Interest in Soviet architecture and urban heritage has recently become one of the major cultural trends (Neville & Wilson, 2013; Pare, 2007; Ritter & Vienna Center of Architecture, 2013; Ershov & Savitskii, 2008). Soviet urban spaces attract more and more not only scholarly but also public attention – of artists, social activists, journalists, and other members of urban community. This interest was spurred by a variety of factors, most importantly, the view of Soviet architecture as a part of the world cultural heritage. Such perspective reinforced and to a great extent legitimized the new perception of Soviet urban spaces, engendering new interpretations. This trend was particularly pronounced in the case of inter-war modernist architecture – constructivist and avant-garde structures represented as a part of the huge global urban-planning project of the 1920s and 1930s.

A good example in this respect are socialist cities ("*sotsgorod"*). Construction of *sotsgorod* micro-districts was one of the most ambitious large-scale town-planning projects aimed at creating experimental territories with communal housing clustered around industrial factories in the 1920s and 1930s (Miliutin, 1930; Kotkin, 1997; Flierl, 2012; Meerovich, 2011). After the collapse of the USSR, *sotsgorod* districts lost their former meanings and turned into typical urban outskirts and low-income, often disadvantaged areas of megapolises. The public perceived them as spaces "from the past" and associated them with the grey Soviet daily life.

It, therefore, seems remarkable that since the mid-2000s, it was this architecture that has started to attract public attention to *sotsgorod* districts. Both

expert communities and wider public came to the view that many buildings located in these areas (for example, *Avtozavod* [Automobile plant] district of Nizhny Novgorod, *sotsgorod* in Magnitogorsk and *Uralmash* [Ural Heavy Machine Building Plant] in Yekaterinburg) are of particular architectural and historical value, and the areas themselves are in fact full-fledged historical sites and monuments of Socialist town-planning (Belova & Savitskaia, 2011, pp. 7–32; Starikov, 1998; Bauhaus na Urale, 2008). In the perception of the mass public, this situation led to a clash between two completely irreconcilable realities – the unremarkable, dreary reality of everyday life, on the one hand, and that of universal value and significance, commonly identified as "cultural heritage", on the other.

The key factor, which enhanced this effect was the tendency to see spaces of *sotsgorod* in the context of global trends in town-planning and art. The districts, which were routinely perceived by the majority as "Soviet" started to be represented as a part of the world cultural legacy. This change in the public attitude largely originated in a series of research, art, and education projects devoted to the work of foreign specialists who participated in designing and constructing *sotsgorod* districts in different corners of the USSR in the 1920s and 1930s, primarily the graduates of the renowned "Bauhaus" school (see, for example, Bauhaus na Urale, 2008; Tokmeninova, 2010; Obshchee, 2010). What mattered most was not the specific historical evidence or the real significance of their work, but the very fact of the symbolical involvement of "Bauhaus" brand into creating what seemed to be absolutely ordinary Soviet districts.

The case of *Uralmash* is particularly illustrative in this respect. *Uralmash* is one of the largest *sotsgorod* built in the 1930s next to the Ural Heavy Machine Building Plant in the city of Sverdlovsk (now – Yekaterinburg). In the early 2000s, *Uralmash* became a platform for the collaborative Russian-German project "Das Bauhaus im Ural", which searched for traces of the work of those Bauhaus graduates who moved to the USSR and worked at industrial sites of Ural towns and cities in the 1930s.

In the case of *Uralmash*, this project was mostly associated with the name of German architect Bela Scheffler. The archival investigation has shown that not only was Scheffler specially invited to work in the design department of *Uralmashstroi* (a trust that was in charge of construction at the plant) in 1932 but he also participated in the construction of the key objects of the *sotsgorod* and was involved in the discussion of the key questions of its development. In later periods, his real role and extent of participation in the planning of *Uralmash* was a question much discussed by architects. These matters, however, were secondary in comparison with the fact of the symbolical involvement of "Bauhaus" brand into the creation of *Uralmash sotsgorod*. In the early 2000s, the very awareness of this fact produced a powerful emotional effect: "In our Uralmash – a Bauhaus architect?" "A graduate of the celebrated art school worked in Uralmash... Incredible!" was a typical reaction of local inhabitants to the newly discovered historical evidence (see Rastorguev, 2011, p. 206; Dzhapakov, 2002).

Such emotional reaction was important because it allowed people to see the *sotsgorod* district in a new light, outside the usual context: while previously it was mostly associated with "Soviet" and "industrial" and at later stages came to be known

as a dangerous, crime-ridden neighborhood, now familiar buildings, which used to be nothing more than a background for everyday city life, were presented to the public as exemplars of unique aesthetic and historical value. A half-abandoned marginal space was turned into a "sanctuary of Constructivism".

In much the similar way *sotsgorod* districts of Kharkiv and Zaporizhia (Ukraine) are now considered on a par with world famous monuments of modernist architecture in Dessau and Frankfurt am Main (Obshchee, 2010). In its turn, the *sotsgorod* in Nizhny Novgorod is now represented as one of the "world's major utopias" due to the fact that foreign specialists were involved in the construction of the Gorky Automobile Plant (Austin, 2004). Another site, which used to be all but forgotten but is now featured in the spotlight of public attention, ready to be included into the UNESCO World Heritage List, is the *sotsgorod* in Novokuznetsk. What made it popular is the fact that it was designed by the team of celebrated German architect and town planner Ernst May (Bendichenko, 2013).

Thus, Soviet urban spaces have suddenly been refashioned into a "heritage" of paramount global importance (Kiaer, 2005, pp. 264–265). It was the discourse of "heritage" that first allowed public positive representation of Soviet architecture and brought it beyond the dispute about ideology or politics. New symbolical interpretations start to be applied not only to specific architectural structures but also to whole Soviet-era districts, which have now turned into the "Soviet urban legacy".

For example, the modernist housing complexes of the 1920s and 1930s often attract scholarly and public attention not only because of their stylistic, aesthetic or town-planning characteristics but also because of the epoch they represent and stand for. This leads to the formation of the discourse of "unrealized utopia", which offers a new way of talking about the Soviet interwar architecture.

The "utopian" discourse changes the angle of looking at modernist districts in the post-Soviet context. They capture our attention because they contain signs and specific markers of the period. A good illustration is the art project "Communal Avant-Garde", which sought to turn *Uralmash* in Yekaterinburg and *Avtozavod* in Nizhny Novgorod into a space for promenades, contemplation and research (Belova & Savitskaia, 2011). In the introduction devoted to *Uralmash*, the authors emphasized that

> Uralmash is a fascinating ruin, in which it is hard to tell the traces of the real from the traces of the utopian. This article is aimed at helping you, dear reader, to find the main objects of a sotsgorod [...] but in doing so, you have to follow one basic rule: please add the word "probably" to all our recommendations. For example, on the right side of the street you [probably!] will see this or that and you [probably!] will have to turn into this or that side-street. You are probably setting off to walk across a non-existent place but along the way, you will probably be able to find its shadows and echoes (Belova & Savitskaia, 2011, p. 35).

This text, which has a strong emotional appeal and employs a creative play of images, reveals an important characteristic in the representation of the past of *sotsgorod* districts: on the one hand, this past appears as a real historical period,

tangible and ready to be experienced immediately through specific artefacts, buildings, and structures. On the other hand, the same artefacts and the special atmosphere of the experimental town-planning sites construct the image of the interwar period as a remote epoch of high hopes and expectations, which has its own historical characteristics but also produces the impression of being situated outside specific time frames. "Sometimes you get the feeling that a sotsgorod district is a thing in itself. That this utopian city wasn't built in the Soviet Union. As if not during the famine of 1932–1933. As if its construction time is beyond our grasp", says Pyotr Boyko, an urbanist and researcher, describing his impressions from the district of the sixth settlement in Zaporizhia (Expert interview with Pyotr Boyko, 2017).

The process, which initially involved only narrow circles of enthusiasts, eventually became a massive trend. *Sotsgorod* districts were increasingly regarded by the mass media and the public as places that were interesting to visit in order to get the authentic feel of the Soviet era, see the unique architecture and marvel at the innovative town-planning solutions.

Information on *sotsgorod* districts was included into travel guides and the contours of these areas were highlighted in tourist maps, while the need for conservation of these districts as objects of particular "historical and cultural significance" was mentioned in various strategies and projects of urban development (Asriian, 2014; Kamenskii, 2017; Zaporizhzhia City Council, 2018).

Public discussions of *sotsgorod* districts as unique objects of world legacy at numerous conferences, exhibitions, festivals, presentations, and round tables put them in the spotlight and filled these spaces with new meanings and new significance.

Such discussions often contributed to the creation of this – to a great extent mythologized – image. For example, the *sotsgorod* in Zaporizhia, now often marked on tourist maps and featured in guidebooks, was not just "rediscovered" but to a certain extent became an intellectually constructed urban space with boundaries replicating the contours of the unrealized town-planning projects of the Soviet era (see, for example, Mordovskiĭ, 2011). Most importantly, all these myths, symbols, real and fictional stories endowed these territories with a new public image and new language, and thus made them visible to the public eye on the maps of modern cities.

It is noteworthy that this treatment of interwar Soviet modernism as world heritage gradually began to embrace other periods and styles of Soviet town-planning. *Sotsgorod* is a telling case in this respect. The fundamental modernist idea underpinning the concept of *sotsgorod* continued to develop after the Second World War. Buildings of the new era and of the new appearance were in one way or another embedded into the previously built modernist urban construction and therefore were perceived as an integral part of the urban landscape. It turned out that *sotsgorod* as a "world heritage" is not only the city of the 1930s but also the city of the post-war decade, the city of mass housing construction of the 1960s and the city of the late Soviet epoch (Kosenkova, 2009; Brade & Neugebauer, 2017; Uralmash…, 2018).

The narrative of modernist architecture did not seek to reveal the style or unique features of urban districts but contributed to the symbolical discovery of the Soviet city as such. The upsurge of interest of urbanists and urban activists in the architecture

of the 1970s and 1980s is, therefore, symptomatic. The art and research projects exploring this theme have prompted new angles of perception of late Soviet urban spaces (see, for example, Meuser & Zadorin, 2015; Snopek, 2015).

New Representations of the "Unwanted" Heritage: the Experience of Working with Socialist Architectural Legacy in Poland

In Poland, in the 1990s, the socialist urban heritage was the primary target of absolute symbolic rejection. Unlike in other post-Soviet countries, in Poland it was not merely destined to oblivion, it was rather subjected to open rejection and labeled as "undesired" (see, for example, Ciarkowski, 2017). The experience of recodification and "liberation" of urban territories from the symbols of the socialist past in Eastern Europe in the 2010s shows that "purging" the urban landscape from the signs of the past (Czepczyński, 2008, pp. 109–147) does not necessary lead to their disappearance from the symbolical representations of the city, just turns them into a figure of silence. This rejected and "repressed" past remains an important element of urban identity, acting as a source of new discourses to describe and new approaches to study the historical symbols and narratives.

These tendencies come to the fore in contemporary Poland. The socialist urban heritage has recently become a part of the new local narrative in the city of Katowice, a centre of Polish modernist architecture. Katowice, a major hub in the industrial region of Silesia, became a site of active construction in the interwar period, associated by the city inhabitants with the establishment of the new Polish government (Odorowski, 2013; Syska & Kiełkowski, 2015). This was followed by the socialist period, when the government of the Polish People's Republic sought to turn Katowice into a model industrial city (see, for example, Crowley, 2009). Katowice may now serve as one of the most successful examples of revitalization of industrial heritage in Eastern Europe, and the regional authorities actively use this rhetoric to promote the new image of the city (Lamparska, 2013; Sobala-Gwosdz & Gwosdz, 2017).

The socialist urban heritage in this context acquires completely new meanings and significance: it is no longer rejected or deprived of its history but, on the contrary, is represented as an important symbolic stage in the development of the city and region. Katowice is represented as a city whose history, regardless of the political regime, is inextricably connected with industry and modernism, the latter two in fact constituting the core of the city's identity. This message is conveyed, among other things, through various exhibition projects, which seek to tell the story of the city and the region from a new perspective (The Light of History…, 2017), but also through diverse tourism initiatives, which turn the modernist heritage into one of the city's brands – *Szlak Moderny*[1]. As a result of the renovation and active promotion campaign, the multi-purpose arena complex *Spodek*, and one of the largest apartment buildings in Poland *Superjednostka*, considered as the key symbols and brands of socialist Katowice, have acquired a new symbolic status of the city's landmarks in the recent years (see Chojecka, 2004; Bulsa & Szmatloch, 2018, pp. 124–126). In this sense, the ideological

[1] http://moderna.katowice.eu

component of the socialist modernist architecture plays a secondary role since it is just one of the multiple manifestations of the internal logic of urban development:

> Modernity and modernism could be said to determine Katowice's identity. Not as a style, however, but as a way of thinking. This can be seen in workers' settlements of the early nineteenth century, which were not only town-planning but also social experiments. The same happened after World War I, when modernism became the government's official program. Even after World War II, socialist realism had its own distinctive face here, different from that of Warsaw or Moscow, but with a local touch, bearing the traces of the inter-war period. After 1956, active experimentation with structures started says Anna Syska, an architect and urban scholar, about the new city history narrative (Expert interview with Anna Syska, 2019).

Under the brand "Katowice the modern city", the socialist heritage of Katowice acquires new symbols and meanings, and thus actually reinvents itself.

Similar trends in the representation of the socialist heritage is demonstrated by Nowa Huta, a district of Kraków. The case of Nowa Huta is particularly interesting because it was built in the first post-war decade as an exemplary "socialist town" of the Polish People's Republic. Even though in its layout, the logic behind its planning, and specific elements of the design this district featured a distinctly modernist look, it had no pre-socialist past (Jurewicz, 2012; Lebow, 2013). It gradually transformed from a marginal industrial district of the 1990s, associated exclusively with the socialist past, into a popular spot for young people, intellectuals and tourists, thus providing a case of successful "rebranding" in the management of the "unwanted" urban heritage (Pozniak, 2013; Matoga, 2015; Czepczyński, 2008, p. 133). A former industrial outskirt area, Nowa Huta is now a creativity space filled with cultural activities. Its socialist symbols were replaced by the museum of the socialist past and tourist attractions. It took just a few years for the district, which used to look bleak and dreary and was largely seen as a remnant of the socialist era, to turn into one of the most visited places in Krakow.

Seen as a "unique town-planning and social experiment", Nowa Huta was freed from the ideological contexts and fitted ideally within the new trend – the interest in town-planning experimentation, architectural aesthetics, and exploration of new urban spaces. It does not mean, however, that Nowa Huta has become a trivial tourist attraction and a space devoid of any past.

Socialist symbols still remain among the key markers of the district, distinguishing it from its counterparts in the public space. Renaming of streets, museumification, ironic interpretation of socialist symbols, and what is referred to as the "special atmosphere of the district" still point to the socialist past. The past as a symbolic figure is inherent in each of these phenomena but it is now viewed from a new angle, thus unlocking opportunities for fresh interpretations. For the young generation, which is the main actor in the cultural revitalization of the district, this past is not an abstract notion but is experienced through personal involvement or through the memory of their parents (Pozniak, 2014, pp. 156–179).

> On the one hand, it seems that no room has been left for the socialist past in the conversation about Nowa Huta. It is all but absent from the conversation about the development of the district [...] On the other hand, one of the main reasons behind the young generation's interest in Nowa Huta is undoubtedly its past and nostalgia for the past. It is the time of our childhood. At the same time this past seems quite remote and no longer constitutes a threat. This is something we associate with our childhood years,

says historian Alicja Maslak-Maciejewska from Jagiellonian University (Expert interview with Alicja Maslak-Maciejewska, 2018). The socialist past is deideologized, reconsidered, and reconstructed. Nevertheless, it still plays an important role in the generation of diverse new narratives representing the history and symbolic significance of Nowa Huta, including romanticization of its architecture or the attempt to position it as a centre of resistance to the socialist regime (Sibila, 2006; Pozniak, 2013, pp. 122–126). In this sense, Nowa Huta is a striking example of how the historical and architectural heritage of socialism can be handled in order to bring about new symbolic interpretations of this heritage and create opportunities for placing it anew in the contemporary urban space.

* * *

It is widely assumed that recognizing specific architectural structures or districts as objects of cultural heritage is a local process of aesthetic and cultural significance. This process, however, goes beyond the local boundaries and encompasses the whole of Eastern Europe as it has to do with the way these countries handle their urban socialist legacy. In the majority of these countries, the public perception of the socialist period is still riddled with contradictions, and, therefore, dealing with socialist architecture inevitably means having to deal with the historical past and its symbols. In this respect, the public representation of socialist buildings as the world modernist heritage is an important example of how this "unwanted" architecture is symbolically transformed into "objects of world culture", "vestiges of modernity" and popular tourist attractions. Spaces and buildings, which used to be rejected or just invisible, become imbued with new meanings and show themselves in a new light to the public.

Actually, by offering renewed vision for socialist urban legacy, the discourse of modernist heritage stimulates symbolic re-discovering of the socialist urban areas in public mind and allows them to acquire new ways of representation, as well as the new possible functional roles in the urban space. At the moment, the ways of speaking about socialist urban heritage seem to be no less important than the practical mechanisms of its implementation. And it is quite likely that just this new symbolical view will provide a basis for the development of a coherent urban planning strategy, and, probably, will help to shape a new attitude towards these spaces in the current social, economic, and cultural context

It should be noted that this process encompasses countries with different historical past and different interpretations of the past. For example, in the former Soviet Union states, socialist urban districts often tend to be forgotten rather than

rejected and the initiatives and projects based on treating them as "objects of cultural heritage" are often driven by the feelings of nostalgia and sentimentalism. As for post-socialist Eastern European countries, after the period of emphatic rejection of the socialist past, the relation to the socialist urban heritage took more familiar and reticent form of cultural revitalization. Nevertheless, in both cases, the global process of appropriation of the modernist heritage produces a similar effect as it contributes to the symbolic inclusion of these districts into the new local narratives of post-socialist cities. This process is likely to become an important step towards the development and strengthening of their new identity.

References

Asriian, A. (2014, May 26). *Administratsiia Nizhnego Novgoroda planiruet razrabotat' novyĭ proekt planirovki Avtozavodskogo parka kul'tury do kontsa 2014 goda* [Administration of Nizhny Novgorod Plans to Establish New Planning Project for Avtozavodskij Park of Culture Up to the End of 2014]. *NTA-Privolzh'e.* Retrieved from https://www.nta-nn.ru/news/society/2014/news_513536/

Austin, R. C. (2004). *Building Utopia: Erecting Russia's First Modern City, 1930*. Kent State University Press.

Bartetzky, A., Dietz C., & Haspel J. (Eds). (2014). *Von der Ablehnung zur Aneignung? Das architektonische Erbe des Sozialismus in Mittel- und Osteuropa.* Ort, Verlag: Wien, Köln, Weimar, Böhlau.

Bauhaus na Urale: ot Solikamska do Orska [Bauhaus in the Urals: from Solikamsk to Orsk]. (2008). Yekaterinburg: Materials of the International Scientific Conference, 12–16 November 2007.

Beil, H., & Schmitz, R. (2002). *Günter Förg- Photographs: Bauhaus Tel Aviv-Jerusalem*. Berlin: Hatje Cantz Publishers.

Beliakova, I., Dushkina, N., & Mikeska, R. (2006). Heritage at Risk: Preservation of 20th Century Architecture and World Heritage. In *Moscow, 17–20 April 2006: Proceedings of Scientific Conference: Abstract Collection*. Moscow: Moscow Architectural Institute.

Belova, E., & Savitskaia, A. (2011). *Kommunal'nyi avangard: kat.-putevoditel' po sotsgorodam avtozavoda i Uralmasha v Nizhnem Novgorode i Yekaterinburge* [Communal Avant-Garde: Catalogue-Guidebook]. Nizhnii Novgorod.

Bendichenko, S. (2013, October 8). *"Sotsgorod" v Novokuznetske hotiat vnesti v spisok IUNESKO* [Sotsgorod in Novokuznetsk Seeks to be Included in UNESCO World Heritage List]. *RIA*. Retrieved from https://ria.ru/20131008/968603876.html

Brade, I., & Neugebauer, C. (Eds). (2017). *Urban Eurasia: Cities in Transformation*. Berlin: DOM Publishers.

Bulsa, M., & Szmatloch, B. (2018). *Sekrety Katowic.* Lodz: Księży Młyn Dom Wydawniczy.

Center for Urban History of East Central Europe. (2017). Socialist City [Note]. Retrieved from https://lia.lvivcenter.org/en/themes/socialist-city/

Ciarkowski, B. (2017). Unwanted Heritage and its Cultural Potential. Values of Modernist Architecture from the Times of the Polish People's Republic. *MAZOWSZE Studia Regionalne*, 22.

Chojecka, E. (Ed.). (2004). *Sztuka Górnego Śląska od średniowiecza do końca XX wieku*. Katowice: Muzeum Śląskie.

Cohen, J.-L. (Ed.). (2011). *Building the Revolution: Soviet Art and Architecture 1915–1935*. London: Royal Academy Publications.

Crowley, D. (2009). Architecture and the Image of the Future in the People's Republic of Poland. *Journal of Architecture*, 14, 67–84.

Czepczyński, M. (2008). *Cultural Landscapes of Post-Socialist Cities. Representation of Powers and Needs*. Aldershot: Ashgate Publishing.

Czepczyński, M. (2010). Representations and Images of "Recent History": The Transition of Post-Socialists Landscape Icons. In M. Dmitrieva & A. Kliems (Eds.), *The Post-Socialist City. Continuity and Change in Urban Space and Imagery* (pp. 16–33). Berlin: Jovis Verlag.

Dzhapakov, A. (2002). Vozvrashhenie imeni: Bela Shefler [Return of the Name: Bela Shefler]. *Nauka i Zhizn'*, 9. Retrieved from https://www.nkj.ru/archive/articles/5128/

Ershov, G., & Savitskii, S. (Eds.). (2008). *Progulki za iskusstvom: Leningrad–Moskva–Sverdlovsk* [Art Walks: Leningrad–Moscow–Sverdlovsk]. Saint Petersburg.

Expert Interview with Alicja Maslak-Maciejewska (2018). Unpublished manuscript.

Expert Interview with Anna Syska (2019). Unpublished manuscript.

Expert Interview with Pyotr Boyko (2017). Unpublished manuscript.

Flierl, T. (2012). *Standardstädte Ernst May in der Sowjetunion 1930–1933. Texte und Dokumente*. Berlin: Suhrkamp Verlag Berlin.

Fraser, B. (2015). *Toward an Urban Cultural Studies: Henri Lefebvre and the Humanities*. Palgrave Macmillan.

Galusek, Ł. (Ed.). (2018). *Architecture of Independence in Central Europe*. Krakow: International Cultural Center.

Gdynia City Hall. (Ed.). (2016). *Gdynia and Modernism. A Monument of History* [Tourist Booklet]. Gdynia: Gdynia City Hall.

Haspel, J., Petzet, M., & Schmückle-Mollard, C. (Eds.). (2008). *World Heritage Sites of the 20th Century – Gaps and Risk from a European Point of View*. Michael Imhof Verlag.

Hlaváčková, P. (Ed.) (2012). *Brněnský architektonický manual. Průdovce architekturou 1918–1945.* Dům uměnĭ města Brna.

Hoppe, M. (2014). Zuerst verschwinden die Bilder, dann die Bauten. Fotograsche Aufnahmen baulicher Relikte des Sozialismus. In A. Bartetzky, C. Dietz & J. Haspel (Eds.), *Von der Ablehnung zur Aneignung? Das architektonische Erbe des Sozialismus in Mittel- und Osteuropa* (pp. 240–249). Wien, Köln, Weimar: Böhlau Verlag.

ICOMOS Germany. (Ed.). (2013). *Socialist Realism and Socialist Modernism. World Heritage Proposals from Central and Eastern Europe* [Documentation of the European Expert Meeting of ICOMOS on the Feasibility of an International Serial Nomination of 20th Century Monuments and Sites in Post-Socialist Countries for the UNESCO World Heritage List in Warsaw, 14th–15th of April 2013]. Berlin: Hendrik Bäßler Verlag.

Jurewicz, K. (2012). *Nowa przestrzeń. Modernizm w Nowej Hucie*. Kraków.

Kamenskii, S. (2017, June 26). *Kak perezagruzit' raĭon Uralmash, kotoryi nikto ne liubil* [How to Re-Load the Uralmash District which Nobody Loved] [Interview]. *ASI*. Retrieved from https://www.asi.org.ru/article/2017/07/26/kamenskij-intervyu-uralmash/

Kiaer, C. (2005). *Imagine No Possessions: The Socialist Objects of Russian Constructivism*. Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press.

Kladnik, A. (2009). Happy Living in a New Socialist Town. Construction, Design and the Distribution of the Apartments in Yugoslavia and Czechoslovakia. In A. Bartetzky & M. Schalenberg (Eds.), *Urban Planning and the Pursuit of Happiness: European Variations on a Universal Theme (18th–21st Centuries)* (pp. 116–127). Berlin: Jovis Diskurs.

Kosenkova, J. (2009). *Sovetskij gorod 1940-h–pervoj poloviny 1950-h gg.: Ot tvorcheskih poiskov k praktike stroitel'stva* [Soviet City of 1940s – First Half of 1950s: From Creative Pursuits to Urban Planning Practice]. Moscow: LIBROKOM.

Kotkin, S. (1997). *Magnetic Mountain: Stalinism as a Civilization*. University of California Press.

Kulić, V., Parker T., & Penick, M. (Eds.). (2015). *Sanctioning Modernism: Architecture and the Making of Postwar Identities*. University of Texas Press.

Lamparska, M. (2013). Post-Industrial Cultural Heritage Sites in the Katowice Conurbation, Poland. *Environmental & Socio-economic Studies*, 1(2), 36–42. DOI: 10.1515/environ-2015-0011

Lebow, K. (2013). *Unfinished Utopia. Nowa Huta, Stalinism, and Polish Society. 1949–56*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.

Lefebvre, H. (1991). *The Production of Space*. Oxford: Blackwell.

Matoga, Ł. (2015). Exploring the History and Heritage of Communism in Nowa Huta District in Krakow, Poland: Potential or a Problem in Managing Tourism in a

City? *Journal of Hospitality and Management Tourism*, 6(7), 90–103. DOI: 10.5897/JHMT2015.0160

Meerovich, M. (2011). *Kladbishhe sotsgorodov: gradostroitel'naja politika v SSSR (1928–1932 gg.)* [Cemetery of Socialist Cities: Urban Planning Policy in the USSR (1928–1932)]. Moscow: ROSSPEN.

Meuser, P., & Zadorin, D. (2015). *Towards a Typology of Soviet Mass Housing. Prefabrication in the USSR 1955–1991*. Berlin: DOM Publishers.

Miliutin, N. (1930). *Sotsgorod. Problema stroitel'stva socialisticheskih gorodov* [Sotsgorod; The Problem of Building Socialist Cities]. Moscow, Leningrad.

Mordovskiĭ, M. (2011). *Shestoĭ posëolok – "gorod budushchego"* [6th Settlement – "the City of the Future"] [Zaporizhia: Personal Guide]. Zaporozh'e: Dikoe pole.

Neville T., & Wilson, V. (Eds.). (2013). *Building the Revolution. Soviet Art and Architecture 1915–1935* [Catalogue]. The Royal Academy of Arts, UK.

Obshchee: Buklet vystavochnogo proekta «1920–1930. Bauhaus. Avangard. Zaporozh'e, Har'kov, Dessau, Frankfurt-na-Majne» [A Common: Booklet of the Exhibition Project "1920–1930. Bauhaus. Avant-Garde. Zaporizhia, Kharkiv, Dessau, Frankfurt"]. (2010). Zaporizhia.

Odorowski, W. (2013). *Architektura Katowic w latach międzywojennych 1922–1939*. Katowice: Muzeum Śląskie w Katowicach.

Pare, R. (2007). *Lost Vanguard: Russian Modernist Architecture 1922–1932*. New York: The Monacelli Press.

Pozniak, K. (2013). Reinventing a Model Socialist Steel Town in the Neoliberal Economy: The Case of Nowa Huta, Poland. *City & Society,* 25, 113–134. DOI: 10.1111/ciso.12009

Pozniak, K. (2014). *Nowa Huta: Generations of Change in a Model Socialist Town*. University of Pittsburgh Press.

Prents, L. (2014). Musterplatten, Erzählmuster. Erinnerung, Identität und Autobiografie in den Werken zeitgenössischer Kunst zur Architektur der sozialistischen Moderne. In A. Bartetzky, C. Dietz & J. Haspel (Eds.), *Von der Ablehnung zur Aneignung? Das architektonische Erbe des Sozialismus in Mittel- und Osteuropa* (pp. 214–229). Wien, Köln, Weimar: Böhlau Verlag.

Rastorguev, A. (2011). Heritage of the Experiment. From the History of the Architectural Avant-Garde in Urals. *Ural*, 8, 205–223.

Ritter, K., & Vienna Center of Architecture (Eds.). (2013). *Soviet Modernism 1955–1991: Unknown History*. Zurich: Park Books.

Sibila, L. J. (2006). *Nowa Huta: architektura i twórcy miasta idealnego: niezrealizowane projekty*. Krakow: Muzeum Historyczne Miasta Krakowa.

Sigma. (2016). Nizhnij Novgorod: popytka sovremennogo opisanija [Nizhnij Novgorod: Attempt of Theoretical Reflection] [Set of notes]. Retrieved from https://syg.ma/arsenal-nlo

Snopek, K. (2015). *Belyayevo Forever. A Soviet Microrayon on its Way to the UNESCO List*. Berlin: DOM Publishers.

Sobala-Gwosdz, A., & Gwosdz, K. (2017). "Katowice effect"? Regeneration of the Site of the Former Katowice Coal Mine Through Prestige Cultural Projects". *Urban Development Issues*, 56, 27–40. DOI: 10.2478/udi-2018-0010

Soja, E. (1996). *Thirdspace: Journeys to Los Angeles and Other Real-and-Imagined Places*. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell.

Stanek, Ł. (2011). *Henri Lefebvre on Space: Architecture, Urban Research, and the Production of Theory*. Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press.

Starikov, A. (1998). Uralmash – obrazets kompleksnoĭ zastroĭki sovetskogo perioda [Uralmash is a Sample of a Complex Building of the Soviet Period]. In *Yekaterinburg: istorija goroda v arhitekture* [Yekaterinburg: History of the City in an Architecture]. Yekaterinburg: Sokrat.

Syska, A., & Kiełkowski, T. (2015). *Styl gotycki wyklucza się. Międzywojenna architektura w województwie śląskim*. Katowice: Śląskie Centrum Dziedzictwa Kulturowego w Katowicach.

Szczerski, A. (2010). *Modernizacje. Sztuka i Architektura w Nowych Państwach Europy Środkowo-Wschodniej 1918–1939.* Łodz: Muzeum Sztuki w Łodzi.

The Light of History. Upper Silesia Over the Ages [Permanent Exhibition]. (2017). Silesian Museum in Katowice. Retrieved from https://muzeumslaskie.pl/en/wystawy/the-light-of-history-upper-silesia-over-the-ages/

Tokmeninova, L. (Ed.). (2010). *Bauhaus na Urale. Sohranenie nasledija*: *Materialy mezhdunarodnogo nauchnogo seminara, 22–24 avgusta 2008 g., Yekaterinburg* [Bauhaus in the Urals. Preservation of the Heritage: Materials of the International Research Seminar, 22–24 August 2008, Yekaterinburg]. Yekaterinburg: Vebster.

Uralmash: ulicy, istorii, lica [Uralmash: Streets, Stories, Faces] [Guidebook]. (2018). Yekaterinburg.

Voss, K., & Molitor J. (2018). *Bauhaus. Eine fotografische Weltreise / A photographic journey around the world*. Berlin: Be.Bra Verlag.

Young, C., & Kaczmarek, S. (2008). The Socialist Past and Postsocialist Urban Identity in Central and Eastern Europe: The Case of Łódź, Poland. *European Urban and Regional Studies,* 15(1), 53–70. DOI: 10.1177/0969776407081275

Zaporizhzhia City Council. (2018). *K prorabotke proekta rekonstruktsii biblioteki Sotsgoroda privlekli amerikanskogo arhitektora-urbanista* [American Architect and Urbanist is Involved into Elaboration of the Reconstruction Project for the Sotsgorod Library]. Retrieved from https://zp.gov.ua/ru/articles/item/2876

Changing Societies & Personalities, 2019
Vol. 3, No. 3, pp. 258–272
http://dx.doi.org/10.15826/csp.2019.3.3.075

ARTICLE

Transformation of Museum Communication through Art Mediation: The Case of the 4th Ural Industrial Biennial of Contemporary Art

Elena S. Kochukhova
Institute for Philosophy and Law, Ural Branch, the Russian Academy of Sciences, Yekaterinburg, Russia

ABSTRACT
Current museum studies have attracted research attention to changes in communication between museums and viewers, which is increasingly acquiring a hierarchical character. A notable example of such transformation in Russia was an art mediation project realized under the auspices of the Ural Industrial Biennial of Contemporary Art. This article is focused on the experience of art mediation excursions at the 4th Biennial, which took place in the fall of 2017 in the city of Yekaterinburg. Mediation is considered as a set of methods that allow the traditional viewer to be transformed into a certain form of involved audience. A new view on the museum audience is presented from the standpoint of current international and Russian museology. It is shown that the institution of Russian contemporary art is currently experiencing a surge of interest. Aims and objectives of the art mediation project carried out during 4th Biennial are analyzed. Visitor practices during art mediation are reconstructed using both quantitative data (self-assessment after excursion) and qualitative data (17 in-depth interviews with mediators) collected during field research at the 4th Biennial. Three ways of visitors' participation in mediation are revealed. The author suggests that the visitor's influence on the experience of the mediator should be considered as the most significant evidence of changes in museum communication.

KEYWORDS
art mediation, museum communication, Ural Industrial Biennial, viewers, involved audience

Received 25 July 2019
Accepted 17 September 2019
Published online 5 October 2019

elenascause@yandex.ru

Art Mediation and Changes in Visitor-Museum Communication

Art mediation is a new museum practice, which evolved in the last decades of the twentieth century and is now actively developing (Camara et al., 2014; Violett, 2014; Malikova, 2015). The notion "mediation" comes from French museum practice, where a broader concept "*la mediation culturelle*"[1] is used (Caillet, 1995; Liot, 2010; Lafortune, 2012). According to the *Guidelines for Museum Mediators*, mediation is "a process in which the central figure is the visitor according to a constructivist approach, based on the knowledge of the different kinds of visitors, of learning styles, of interpretative communities" (Camara et al., 2014, p. 8). It applies to different types of museums such as historical, ethnological, technical, fine arts, and so on. The term "art mediation" refers to a set of mediation methods applied in visual arts[2].

This article explores art mediation as a phenomenon illustrating transformations in museum communication. Such transformations are aimed at changing the relationship between the viewer and the institution with the purpose of reducing the distance between them. Specialists in the field of museology are seeking answers to various questions, such as whether art mediation is capable of shortening this distance or what methods of interaction this form can offer to the viewer.

In general, there is a perceivable lack of research on art mediation since this practice has appeared only recently. At the same time, questions related to mediation as a museum practice are widely discussed in the professional museum community. The most comprehensive research on this issue was conducted in 2012–2014 by Ines Camara and her team and was supported by the European Commission. This study pursued a practical purpose – to design "the theoretical basis of the training course, which had a common part and another based on the national context" (Camara et al., 2014, p. 11). The research identified and compared museum mediation practices in seven European countries.

In other publications, mediation is explored as a new form of museum education. F. De Backer et al. generalized existing approaches to art mediation, relying on classical works on museum pedagogy (De Backer et al., 2014). M. Villa described the experience of the Bogota Art Mediation Lab and concluded that the main challenge for mediators is to connect art with emotions, claims, and memories of visitors, regardless of their educational backgrounds (Villa, 2015). M. Györgyfova emphasized that talking about visitors' perceptions is an important element in museum education (Györgyfova, 2016). Art mediation is also described as a way to create a museum community. For example, C. Vasconcellos and M. da Silva analyzed the case of a museum in San-Paulo and represented art mediation as a tool to reduce the symbolic and real distances between the museum and its immediate neighborhood (Vasconcellos & da Silva, 2018).

[1] That concept describes non-hierarchical communication between any cultural institutions and their audience.

[2] However, it should be noted that the expression "art mediation" is often used to describe the capacity of art to act as an intermediary between the author and the viewer or the teacher and the student. Seen in this way, an art object is a tool used to convey ideas. In this article, we are going to use the term "art mediation" to denote a set of methods that allow a museum to involve visitors into communication, rather than an attribute of art itself.

In Russia, the emergence of interest in art mediation is related to the project "Manifesta 10: the European Biennial of Contemporary Art in St. Petersburg" in 2014 (Manifesta, 2014). Sepake Angiama, the Head of Education for Manifesta 10, proposed the following understanding of mediation, which was later adopted by other Russian projects: "In the context of contemporary art, the role of the mediator is to ensure a dialogue in a pluralistic situation of interaction between the viewer and art. We teach our mediators to stimulate dialogue and create conditions that learn visitors to articulate their perceptions through observation, discussion and creativity" (Angiama, 2014).

In 2015, the Ural Branch of the National Centre for Contemporary Arts (NCCA) launched an educational program "Mediation in the Field of Art" (NCCA, 2015), whose graduates then worked at the 3rd Ural Industrial Biennial (the project was repeated as the 4th and 5th Biennial). Another example is a training course for art mediators carried out by the Garage Museum of Contemporary Art in 2015, and dedicated to the opening of a new museum building and a new exhibition (Garage, 2015). In 2016, PERMM Museum of Contemporary Art presented its own art mediation course in Perm (PERMM, 2016). In 2017, in Nizhny Novgorod, the NCCA branch started the School of Art Mediation (NCCA, 2017). In summer of 2019 in Yekaterinburg, the Contemporary Art Gallery introduced an internship program for mediators (Uralgallery, 2019). In their programs, the above-mentioned institutions described art mediation as a practice of involving visitors into the dialogue about art.

The experience of large Russian cities shows that in recent years there has been an upsurge of interest in mediation on the part of institutions of contemporary art. However, Russia still has a long way to go in this respect, and this topic is largely underexplored in academic research. A pioneering work in this respect is Daria Malikova's Master thesis on methods of interaction with the audience of art museums. D. Malikova defines art mediation as a method of educational work, she also describes its place in the system of educational activities of art museums, highlights the key characteristics of this method by comparing them with traditional practices of museum education (Malikova, 2015). The general principles of mediation as an element of museum pedagogy are investigated by Izmailova and Kolokoltseva (2016). N. Striga uses her own mediation experience to reflect upon the principles of mediator training and to describe the techniques of working with art objects at an exhibition (Striga & Pronin, 2017).

However, art mediation as a phenomenon is not just a new museum education practice. It plays a crucial role in the transformation of museum communication. The questions that are interesting to consider in this respect are as follows: Who are the agents of the transformation that museum communication is now undergoing? And what specific changes does this transformation encompass?

Russian museums need to accomplish an important task of improving the new formats of communication with their audiences (Dukel'skij, 2010). Traditional museum communication formats are hierarchical while the new formats, on the contrary, should be horizontal. The basic principle of art mediation is to make the viewers' voices be heard. Therefore, it is necessary to depart from the traditional hierarchy in museum communication, to change the museum's attitude towards the audience, and to transform the audience behavior patterns.

In her theoretical review of visitor studies, A. Maksimova has outlined three concepts of museums in the twentieth century: a museum of the "temple of arts" type, a museum for experts, and a museum engaging visitors in its work (Maksimova, 2014, p. 161). These three types of museums correspond to three types of visitors: "observer"; "expert", and "partner". The first and the second types are traditional: the museum exhibits its objects for the public to see while the public, in its turn, is divided into professionals, who understand museum infrastructure and can influence museum practices thanks to their expert position, and non-professionals, who can watch and get impressions. Thus, traditional museum communication involves, on the one hand, experts, who determine the themes, objects, and ways of exhibiting, and, on the other hand, viewers, who can choose from the range of options that experts offer. There is, however, a new understanding of museum communication, which enables the viewer not only to watch and comment on what they see, but also to get involved in the work of the museum, solve the same tasks as professionals – determine the theme and concept of the exhibition, supervise it, communicate with artists, and interpret their ideas. It is a new type of visitor – the "partner". In general, this new vision of the viewer underpins the interest in studying audience experience and, as a result, leads to transformations of museum practices (Pekarik, Doering, & Karns, 1999; Simon, 2010; Falk & Dierking, 2013; Maksimova, 2014; Nikitin, 2018).

The view of the visitor as an equal partner contributes to the general shift in museum communication, which can be observed in Russian art institutions. Likewise, the visitors of the Ural Industrial Biennial of Contemporary Art[3] are not just viewers, art mediation is used as one of the museum communication strategies based on participation, it "draws attention to the moment of mutual exchange, coordination, which is so important in the new museology" (Malikova, 2018, p. 182).

As an example of this shift from the "viewer" to "involved audience", let us look at the case of the art mediation project at the 4th Ural Industrial Biennial of Contemporary Art, which took place in the fall of 2017 in the city of Yekaterinburg. To describe the transformation of communication that happens during an excursion conducted by a mediator, I analyzed seventeen in-depth interviews with art mediators[4]. Interviews were conducted during two weeks in November 2017[5], which were closing the 4th Biennial event. By this time all the respondents had accumulated a diverse experience

[3] The Ural Industrial Biennial of Contemporary Art is a large regional art project held in Yekaterinburg and other Ural cities. The project seeks to integrate the region into the context of the international art scene. The Biennial takes place at former industrial and non-exhibition sites, and thus the concept of industry is explored both as a heritage and as an actual practice. Curators, artists, sociologists, and cultural theorists from around the world define the Urals in all kinds of ways. The first Biennial took place in 2010. In September 2019, the 5th Biennial "Immortality" opened in Yekaterinburg (Ural Biennial, 2019)

[4] Interviewing was a part of the project "Study of the Audience of Contemporary Art Sites in Major Russian Cities", realized in 7 large regional Russian cities by the Ural branch of the NCCA in cooperation with Yekaterinburg Academy of Contemporary Art and research company "Socium" in 2017–2018. The project included observation in institutions of contemporary art, surveys of visitors at exhibitions, in-depth interview with curators, art-directors, and artists. The project was supported by the Vladimir Potanin Foundation. For more detail see: www.artauditoria.ru.

[5] Interviews are anonymized, a literary correction, which smooths out the features of oral speech is applied to the quotations used in the article. 17 out of 18 mediators worked at the 4th Biennial are interviewed.

in art mediation. Therefore, the survey was aimed at catching actual mediation practices, which could shed light on whether the main idea mediation, i.e. establishing a dialogue about art, could be realized, and whether the monological nature of the classical museum communication could be overcome.

In order to investigate mediators' experience, the interview guide covered three main blocks. The first was motivation to become an art mediator. Questions in this block included:

- Why did you decide to take part in the mediation program?
- What did you find attractive?
- What were your expectations?

The second block was aimed at assessing attitudes towards contemporary art before and after mediation work, and included such questions as:

- What contemporary art exhibitions had you visited before participating in the mediation program?
- What is contemporary art for you now?

The third block of questions was focused on the participant's mediation experience, including:

- Which excursions and visitors impressed you the most?
- Please, tell about the best and worst excursions in your opinion.
- Can you describe the types of Biennial visitors?
- Did you meet cases of aversion to contemporary art?
- How was your work group?
- Which mediation methods did you use during excursions? What was the result of your work?

Although the conducted in-depth interviews had their own features due to the specifics of the qualitative method, they were all linked by a common topic that could facilitate the analysis of the obtained data. Initially, all answers describing mediation work were identified using Open and Axial coding according to the grounded theory (Strauss, Corbin, 1998). Further, at the stage of Selective coding, a particular attention was paid to the topic of communication between the art mediator and the visitor. Based on our respondents' descriptions of their mediation experience, I identified three types of visitor participation and the main agent (or agents) of the transformation.

Art Mediation at the 4th Ural Industrial Biennial: Goal, Participants, and Practices

At the 4th Ural Industrial Biennial, one of the ways to involve the audience in the discussion about art was an excursion with an art mediator. The topic of the Biennial – "New Literacy" – is interpreted as "a tool to eliminate illiteracy, whether it is the actual verbal illiteracy or ignorance in any professional sphere (for example, the sphere of contemporary art or industrial production)" (Ural Biennial, 2017). In this context, art mediation was a necessary tool for ensuring the new literacy of the audience.

Art mediation means that a visitor would move from the position of a viewer to that of an involved person. Similar to Manifesta 10, mediation is defined as the "strategy work with the audience, based on involvement and complicity, transforming the exhibition into

a space for discussion" (Malikova, 2018, p. 182). In contrast to the role of a traditional museum guide, who is expected to follow the script of an excursion, an art mediator is more flexible as he or she is oriented towards meeting the individual needs of the visitors and can adjust the tour to their specific interests. His or her task is to encourage the visitors to discuss what they see and to co-create the meaning of the work. At first glance, in such museum communication the viewer should be the main agent of the transformation since mediation is aimed at changing the patterns of perceiving art at an exhibition. According to the results of visitors' self-assessment after the mediator excursion, the vast majority were interested in hearing the opinions of other members of the group and wanted to participate in the discussion themselves (Malikova, 2018, p. 207). As for the types of their activity, the results were as follows: 89 percent "listened to the mediator"; 62 percent "answered the mediator's questions"; 54 percent "discussed something with their companions"; 52 percent "if offered, interacted with the art objects"; 51 percent took photos and made selfies; 50 percent got separated from the group and independently examined objects; 32 percent asked questions; 31 percent read annotations to the exhibits; 23 percent found themselves to be deep in thought[6] (Malikova, 2018, p. 210). These data demonstrate the success of the mediation project as it is obvious that many visitors engaged in different kinds of activities outside the roles prescribed by traditional museum communication patterns, which is a sign of the deep transformation in the viewer's experience. However, before we make any conclusions, we need to deal with the problem of re-observation: how would these viewers behave in a different situation? Would they want to have a discussion if the format of their excursions did not include that possibility? Moreover, the visitors' self-assessment results did not always coincide with the mediators' observations, who reported that only one third of all the groups they worked with were active and engaged in communication, which would be different from the traditional museum communication.

In all likelihood, participants have a strong impact on art mediation, but we should not forget that there are art mediators too, not only viewers. The leader of the biennial mediation project clarifies the goals that mediators focus on:

> They help viewers to see what is important in the idea of the curator or the author, but the curator's opinion or the author's position does not become the ultimate truth. They act as an impetus for further visitors' reasoning and interpretation, which has an equal right to exist. The mediator is not a storyteller, but a facilitator of the conversation: they involve visitors in an exchange of opinions on works of art [...] encourage participants to express their judgment based on their own life experience and knowledge" (Malikova, 2018, p. 183).

Therefore, to analyze new museum communication patterns it is important to understand who were both the visitors and the mediators at the 4th Ural Industrial Biennial.

Among the 4th Industrial Biennial visitors, the majority had rarely or almost never attended events related to contemporary art (Burlutskaya, 2018, p. 121). According

[6] 205 self-assessment multiple-answer multiple choice questionnaires were analyzed.

to the results of the visitors input narrative analysis (a set of requests and attitudes, which determine the perception and evaluation of the experience gained at an art exhibition), 55 percent of the visitors expected to receive new emotions and expand their horizons; 17 percent were interested in the artistic content of the exhibition; 13 percent came for entertainment and distraction; and 13 percent did not select any of the options offered to them in the motivation survey[7] (Malikova, 2018, pp. 184–189). The analysis of additional data has shown that self-development, reflection on social transformations, and discussions on values are socially expected reasons for interest in contemporary art. However, the real reason for visitors' participation in the Biennial was mainly "mere curiosity" (Malikova, 2018, p. 189).

As for the art mediators, they were not professionals in the field of art or museum work. For the most part, they were part students majoring in the humanities, there were also economists, editors, a professor, a museologist, a stylist, and a bartender. All those who became art mediators at first were viewers of contemporary art. The main reasons why they decided to work as art mediators were that they perceived it as a personal challenge associated with the acquisition of new experience and internship in the field close to their major. Some young people were also thinking about making a career in culture:

> "I can say that the work as a mediator will update and expand my expertise, my knowledge" (female, 22 years old).

> "This time I don't want to be a volunteer anymore, I want to rise to a higher level in this hierarchy, and mediation seems to be the next one" (male, 21 years old)

> "For me, it has been a very important step in order to decide where to move on in the profession" (female, 25 years old).

> "I remember that a lot of mediators from the previous Biennial got a job somewhere, in the same sphere of art, when the Biennial ended. I do not know how much this attracts me, but I consider it as an option. To do some networking, to accumulate a cultural capital" (male, 24 years old).

Art mediation is a personal challenge for older persons and young people:

> "I've decided to take a chance, talked to Daria [director of the mediation project], understood that this is what I need. Therefore, the reason why I've become one of the mediators is that I wanted to learn how to understand modern art" (female, 60 years old).

> "I've been working at a high school for a long time, but somehow it seems to have taken all the pleasure out of it [...] And I've had a spontaneous but quite successful

[7] The question was "Why do you visit contemporary art exhibitions?" The questionnaire was designed to measure the respondents' degree of agreement. 808 visitors were surveyed.

experience of working as a curator [...] Yes, and I thought I was wasting my talents here" (female, 55 years old).

"I wanted some new impressions, and, perhaps, I was caught up in this mid-life crisis, when you have no idea what you need to do in life" (female, 40 years old)

"It was a challenge because I have never thought about such activity for myself" (female, 30 years old).

"[I wanted] to change the direction. It is the direction in which you choose to move that determines who you are at the moment […] that is, there were questions that you would not resolve without forcibly getting yourself out of the current situation. Questions related to the future profession, what you study, your role in life" (female, 19 years old).

Nonetheless, apart from the above-mentioned motives, all respondents observed that they felt close to contemporary art. There is also one more reason: some respondents pointed out that participation in the Biennial on a deeper level was very important for them as such:

"I have an interest in contemporary art, I cannot miss such an event as the Biennial. It's great that I've managed to be a mediator" (female, 22 years old)

"If you want to be in the thick of things, especially to be engaged in contemporary art, then you should try to be a part of some significant events" (female, 23 years old).

"For me, it's a pleasure. Actually, I like talking about art." (male, 22 years old)

"I love art, and I really wanted to be in the project. Two more reasons – it has given me a chance to explore the exhibition, and it is very interesting for me to see how people interact with art" (female, 21 years old).

"I wanted to correct the mistakes I made at the 3rd Biennial, secondly, last time I was ecstatic and this time I wanted to see it all again, but more soberly" (female, 30 years old).

Mediators were selected by open competition, announced by the NCCA Ural branch. The first stage of the competition included writing a motivation letter, at the second stage, there was an interview. Afterwards, the selected candidates were trained, they observed how the exhibition was created, communicated with artists, passed the exam, and became the mediators at the Biennial. They conducted excursions daily with large and small groups of visitors (accidentally assembled visitors or organized groups of schoolchildren, students, families, friends, etc.).

Describing the experience of a viewer, mediators recall both typical and unique stories. All respondents faced a situation when the group was ready to listen and watch, but not to speak. This is the expected reaction of a traditional viewer and the mediators were trained to transform it. The shift from the traditional viewer to the involved participant was a personal story each time. However, putting these stories together, three main scenarios of art mediation can be identified.

One of the most common indications of visitor involvement in mediation was the case when one of the group members became an expert for the rest of the participants:

> "Here is today's tour […] I like the moment with the plant, when an employee of this plant told us about all these devices, how they work" (female, 60 years old).

> "There were just about eight people, a micro-group. Some of them were already 50 years old, some were about 30 years old (2 or 3 women). It was interesting, because those who were in their fifties, they [...] took the position that it [the exhibition] was not clear to them, but at the same time, they explained their position. And those who were in their thirties [...], one of them was very well informed in the cultural context. When she said 'Oh, I know that', I asked her to tell something about it, and everyone listened to her. It was perfect. Those who listened to her did not know this information and she provided it" (female, 26 years old).

> "Someone is very eager to speak, someone is not, and if you are trying to stimulate them, it does work. Usually, yes, they usually want to speak. It's true. They are proud that they know" (female, 21 years old, about the viewers with some experience of perception of contemporary art).

A rarer case is the involvement of all the group members in the discussion about the exhibition. According to the respondents' experience, there is one objective impediment to such mediation, it is the group size. Other significant limitations are subjective: they are primarily the mood of the group and the skills of the mediator.

Participants' knowledge in the field of arts, at first glance, facilitates the dialogue about the exposition. Indeed, for one mediator the professionalism of the audience is crucial for this exchange of knowledge and impressions to take place:

> "Excursions for professionals, people engaged in intellectual activities, suit me best of all. Usually, these are small groups. When you speak to them, they really need it, they understand, listen attentively, solve some of their professional tasks through my speech. I can give them maximum information […] And these people take it, and give me some knowledge in return" (female, 19 years old).

However, for another mediator the opposite is true:

> "A tough room is the room full of art critics. They are well prepared. But they are keen on showing you that you are not needed here" (female, 47 years old).

Moreover, art mediation is designed primarily for the traditional audience and not for professionals who, by virtue of their expert position, are used to talking about art. Therefore, more significant examples of the changing museum communication are the situations in which discussion and exchange of impressions appear in an "ordinary" group. For example, one of the mediators was impressed by the tour he conducted for employees of a technological company, who came to the Biennial because they were specifically interested in its theme and content:

> "I can't express it in words, because these were the feelings when I heard and saw this feedback from almost everyone. And in the course of our discussions, absolutely, completely new ideas were born, that, for example, had never occurred to me before. And that's why I still love mediation: you always expand your idea, your way of looking at objects and art, because people, they are so awesome and they always bring something new, something of their own" (female, 21 years old).

Another respondent was surprised by the reaction of teenagers:

> "I did not expect that it would be comfortable for me to work with schoolchildren. I am absolutely delighted by them. Most of them are really open to art, that is, they are ready to give their own interpretations rather than reproduce conventional ones" (female, 22 years old).

The narratives of the art mediators about their experiences reflect the shift in their perception of the exhibition. One of the respondents considers that this transformation constitutes the core of art mediation:

> "This is a special approach […]; the mediator has a special approach to work which enriches not only the incoming group but also the mediators themselves. It just teaches us to look at works in a new, different way" (female, 22 years old).

If the awareness of the art mediator changes, the excursion should also change since the mediator is one of its significant elements. Taking it as a starting point that the mediator's perception is influenced by the audience, we can distinguish the third way of visitor participation in mediation. This can be illustrated by the following observations of our respondent:

> "For example, I've never been to some room. And then the viewer goes there on their own. And we have a most interesting conversation there, which makes me think: 'Oh, why did we always pass by this room?'. And I set out with the next group and go to this room. I start a dialogue based on the previous conversation. It worked not because of me, but because someone was personally interested in it. Yes, indeed [...] it is such a growing and genuine experience" (female, 32 years old).

This indirect influence on other members of the audience through the experience of an art mediator is the third way visitors can get involved into museum communication. In many interviews, respondents reflect on the fact that visitors have provided them with a new perspective on the exhibition. This inner transformation in the mediators' thinking and feelings entails a change in the content and route of their excursions. From this point of view, the mediator is the prime agent of the transformation in museum communication as he or she initiates this transformation in relation to the audience.

The Biennial mediation project is one of the first steps towards a new museum communication. The advantages of this project involve a positive feedback from the audience, as well as relevant examples for further research confirming that museum practices are indeed undergoing transformations. According to the visitors' feedback and the art mediators' opinions, the audience was occasionally involved in a dialogue about art.

However, some limitations concerned with this project should be mentioned, which does not allow us to talk about its complete success. Firstly, any dialogue is only possible when the mediator and the audience speak "the same" language; however, the mediators in this research claimed to experience occasional rejection on the part of visitors. These situations made the mediators lose their emotional balance. Thus, the respondents spoke of the feelings of desolation, bewilderment, grief or fear. Similar emotional risks were described in professional works of French museum mediators (Peyrin, 2010). In the future, a mechanism should be developed that could help to determine a suitable audience for every mediator, thus facilitating optimal allocation of workload. Since the transition to a new museum communication is being carried out by the personal efforts of mediators, their personal comfort becomes as significant as their professional training.

Secondly, for viewers to enjoy the maximum freedom of judgment, the mediator should take a detached position towards the institution (Malikova, 2015). For the 4th Biennial, most of the mediators were recruited from regular visitors. As a result, they found occasional negative assessments concerning the Biennial itself or contemporary art as a whole rather disappointing. Although the process of moderator training did include the component of critical thinking development, not all mediators were capable of interpreting art industry critically.

Thirdly, the absence of a sustainable environment that could maintain the developed skills of non-hierarchical museum communication among the audience impedes the formation of its long-term patterns. It is highly likely that the audience having gained the experience of mediation and dialogue during the Biennial would not be able to apply it in other cultural institutions.

From the standpoint of the development of cultural industries, investments in the training of mediators seem to be prospective. Skills developed in the field of museum communication can be applied in various cultural projects. It should be noted, however, that art mediation is a relatively new practice not only in Russia, but also in the international context (Camara et al., 2014; Violet, 2014; Malikova, 2015; Villa, 2015; Györgyfova, 2016; Vasconcellos & da Silva, 2018). Therefore, the initiative of

the Ural branch of the NCCA can be considered as one of the first steps towards the development of art mediation both in Russia and abroad.

From Classical to New Museum Communication: Who is the Agent of Transformation?

Art mediation at the 4th Ural Industrial Biennial of Contemporary Art was aimed at involving visitors into an exchange of knowledge and impressions. These goals are related to the new view on visitor-museum communication. In art mediation, many methods are used to change the model of museum communication from hierarchical to horizontal. The mediator uses their professional knowledge to start a discussion, prepare a transition from one object to another rather than to teach or enlighten the visitors.

The case of the 4th Ural Industrial Biennial shows that viewers sometimes make a transition from observers to involved participants during art mediation. This transition strongly depends on the combination of several factors, the main factors being the group size, the mediator's skills, and the mood of the visitors. Exhibition organizers can influence the intensity of the transformation in audience experience by improving the mediators' skills and limiting the group size.

All of the above does not mean, however, that in museums, which support traditional communication patterns, a situation when one visitor becomes an expert in front of other viewers or when an interesting discussion takes place within a small group of people is impossible. Undoubtedly, the mediator facilitates and legitimates such cases. However, the visitor's influence on the experience of the mediator is the most significant evidence of the changes in the patterns of museum communication: not only are new voices heard in the exhibition space, but they also influence the way the new visitors see this space.

From this point of view, the mediator is a key agent of the transformation of museum communication. Firstly, they rethink the experiences and attitudes towards the exhibition. Secondly, they adjust the route of their excursions according to the visitors' interests. In addition, in the case examined, the mediators themselves illustrated the shift from the position of a viewer to that of an involved person since they all began their acquaintance with contemporary art as viewers. Furthermore, an art mediator occupies a transitional position between the new and traditional museum communication patterns, playing the two roles. From the perspective of the involved viewer, the mediator is a partner in museum communication; from the perspective of the traditional viewer, the mediator is an expert.

The art mediation project at the 4th Ural Industrial Biennial demonstrates that museums and other institutions of contemporary art are ready to rely on the experience of the audience and involve visitors in the production of meanings within the exhibition space. Although a significant part of the audience come with a request for a traditional excursion, they are ready to interpret art objects. For the audience and the institution, this movement towards each other is the beginning of the transition to new museum communication.

References

Angiama, S. (2014). *Chto takoe art-mediatsiia?* [What is Art Mediation?] [Workbook]. Retrieved from http://manifesta10.org/media/uploads/files/workbook_mediation_rus.pdf

Burlutskaya, M. (2018). Kto prishel na 4 ural'skuiu biennale sovremennogo iskusstva [Who visited 4th Ural Industrial Biennial of Contemporary Art?]. In A. U. Prudnikova & L. E. Petrova (Eds.), *«Chto-to novoe i neobychnoe»: auditoriya sovremennogo iskusstva v krupnyh gorodah Rossii* ["Something New and Extraordinary": Contemporary Art Audience in Major Russian Cities] (pp. 120–140). Moscow: Kabinetnyj uchenyj; Yekaterinburg: EACA.

Caillet, E. (1995). *A l'approche du musée: la médiation Culturelle*. Lyon: Presses universitaires de Lyon.

Camara, I., Fernambuco, A., Nunes, M., Berei-Nagy, F., Da Milano C., Agnese, R., & Koskijoki, M. (2014). *Guidelines for Museum Mediators Professionals in Europe* (Final Report: Museum Mediators Research Results). Retrieved from http://museummediators.eu/wp-content/uploads/2014/09/MMediatorsEurope_ResearchResults_finalReport.pdf

De Backer, F., Peeters, J., Buffel, T., Kindekens, A., Romero Reina, V., Elias, W., & Lombaerts, K. (2014). An Integrative Approach for Visual Arts Mediation in Museums. *Procedia – Social and Behavioral Sciences,* 143, 743–749. DOI: 10.1016/j.sbspro.2014.07.419

Dukel'skij, V. Yu. (Ed.). (2010). *Muzeĭnaia kommunikatsiia: modeli, tekhnologii, praktiki* [Museum Communication: Models, Technologies, Practices]. Moscow.

Falk, J. H., & Dierking, L. D. (2013). *The Museum Experience Revisited.* Walnut Creek, CA: Left Coast Press.

Garage. (2015). *Garage Mediators* [Note]. Retrieved from https://garagemca.org/en/event/garage-mediators

Györgyfova, M. (2016). Sprostredkovanie výtvarného umenia návštevníkom galérií a múzeí umenia za pomoci využitia animácie a arteterapie [Mediating Visual Art to Gallery and Museum Visitors Using Animation and Art Therapy]. *Muzeológia a kultúrne dedičstvo*, 4(2), 35–46.

Izmailova, A., & Kolokoltseva, M. (2016). Art-mediatsiia v deiatel'nosti hudozhestvennyh muzeev [The Art Mediation on Fine Arts museum]. *Molodoj uchenyj*, 14, 292–294.

Lafortune, J.-M. (2012). *La Médiation culturelle: Le sens des mots et l'essence des pratiques*. Québec: Presses de l'Université du Québec.

Liot, F. (Ed.). (2010). *Projets culturels et participation citoyenne: Le rôle de la médiation et de l'animation en question*. Paris: L'Harmattan.

Maksimova, A. (2014). Kontseptual'nye i metodologicheskie voprosy izucheniia posetiteleĭ muzeev [Conceptual and Methodological Issues of Studying Museum Visitors]. *Sociologiya: metodologiya, metody, matematicheskoe modelirovanie*, 39, 157–188.

Malikova, D. (2015). *Metody raboty s auditorieĭ hudozhestvennogo muzeia: ot tradicionnyh praktik k mediatsii (osmyslenie i integratsiya opyta Evropejskoi biennale sovremennogo iskusstva «Manifesta 10»)* [Methods of Working with the Audience of Fine Arts Museum: from Traditional Practices to Mediation (Understanding and Integrating the Experience of the European Biennial of Contemporary Art "Manifesta 10") [Master's thesis]. Retrieved from http://elar.urfu.ru/handle/10995/31712

Malikova, D. (2018). Zritel'skii opyt i mediatsiia: rabota s ozhidaniiami i otnosheniem posetiteleĭ [Visitors' Experience and Mediation: How to Work with Visitors' Expectations and Relationships]. In A. U. Prudnikova & L. E. Petrova (Eds.), *«Chto-to novoe i neobychnoe»: auditoriia sovremennogo iskusstva v krupnyh gorodah Rossii* ["Something New and Extraordinary": Contemporary Art Audience in Major Russian Cities] (pp. 166–121). Moscow: Kabinetnyj uchenyj; Yekaterinburg: EACA.

Manifesta. (2014). Chto takoe art-mediatsiia? [What is Art Mediation?] [Note]. Retrieved from http://m10.manifesta.org/ru/education/art-mediation/

NCCA. (2015). Obrazovatel'naia programma "Mediatsiia v sfere iskusstva" [Educational Program "Mediation in Art"]. Retrieved from http://www.ncca.ru/news.text?filial=5&id=1231

NCCA. (2017). Shkola art-mediatsii v Arsenale. [Art-Mediation School in Arsenal] [Note]. Retrieved from http://www.ncca.ru/events.text?filial=3&id=4033

Nikitin, S. (2018). Issledovaniia auditorii muzeev [The Museum Audience Researches]. In A. U. Prudnikova & L. E. Petrova (Eds.), *«Chto-to novoe i neobychnoe»: auditoriia sovremennogo iskusstva v krupnyh gorodah Rossii* ["Something New and Extraordinary": Contemporary Art Audience in Major Russian Cities] (pp. 322–349). Moscow: Kabinetnyj uchenyj; Yekaterinburg: EACA.

Pekarik, A. J., Doering, Z. D., & Karns, D. A. (1999). Exploring Satisfying Experiences in Museums. *Curator: The Museum Journal,* 42(2), 152–173.

Peyrin, A. (2010). *Être médiateur au musée. Sociologie d'un métier en trompe-l'œil*. Paris: La Documentation francaise.

PERMM. (2016). *Art-mediaciya. Proekt*. [The Art Mediation. The Project]. Retrieved from http://wp.permm.ru/#/menu/art-mediatsiya/

Simon, N. (2010). *The Participatory Museum*. Santa Cruz, CA: Museum 2.0.

Strauss, A. L., & Corbin, J. (1998). *Basics of Qualitative Research: Grounded Theory Procedures and Techniques* (2nd ed.). London: Sage.

Striga, N., & Pronin, A. (2017). Vzaimodeĭstvie so zritelem ural'skoĭ industrial'noĭ biennale sovremennogo iskusstva: opyt mediatsii [Interaction with the Audience of the Ural Industrial Biennial of Contemporary Art: the Mediation Experience]. In *Kul'tura otkrytogo goroda: novye smysly i praktiki. Materialy V Vserossijskoj nauchno-prakticheskoj konferencii studentov, aspirantov i molodyh uchenyh* [Open city Culture: New Meanings and Practices. Materials of the V Conference of Students, Graduate Students and Young Scientists] (pp. 163–166). Yekaterinburg: EACA.

Ural Biennial. (2017). *New Literacy* [Note]. Retrieved from http://fourth.uralbiennale.ru/en/o-biennale/novaya-gramotnost

Ural Biennial. (2019). *Ural Biennial* [Note]. Retrieved from https://fifth.uralbiennale.ru/en/about_the_biennial/

Uralgallery. (2019). *Letniaia stazhirovka dlia ékskursovodov i mediatorov v Galeree sovremennogo iskusstva* [Summer Internship for Guides and Mediators at the Contemporary Art Gallery]. Retrieved from http://www.uralgallery.ru/sobit.php?id=473

Vasconcellos, C. M., & da Silva, M. A. (2018). A mediação comunitária colaborativa: novas perspectivas para educação em museus. *ETD – Educação Temática Digital,* 20(3), 623–639. DOI: 10.20396/etd.v20i3.8651713

Villa, M. L. (2015). *Experiencias y herramientas de mediación del arte contemporáneo*. Bogota: Idartes.

Violett, M. (2014). *Entre démocratisation culturelle et préservation d'une exigence de l'œuvre: construire une médiation de l'art contemporain* [Article]. Retrieved from http://chmcc.hypotheses.org/543

Changing Societies & Personalities, 2019
Vol. 3, No. 3, pp. 273–275
http://dx.doi.org/10.15826/csp.2019.3.3.076

BOOK REVIEW

Joan Wallach Scott (2018). Sex and Secularism. Princeton University Press

Andrey S. Menshikov
Ural Federal University, Yekaterinburg, Russia

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS
The work on the text was supported by the grant of the Russian Science Foundation (No. 17-18-01194)

This book, written by a notable specialist in "gender and women's history in France" (p. 15), makes its intent clear from the start. It is a polemical contribution to the ongoing debate on the "clash of civilizations", and the role of Islam in the modern societies. Islam, however, is not at the focus of the analysis. The author consistently deconstructs a rhetorical equation between secularism and modern values such as freedom and equality by reconstructing the ways the discourse of secularism functioned at different historical stages. Today, the identification of secularism with the Enlightenment, with the triumph of reason over religion, with emancipation and gender equality produces discursively its own counterpart, which is oppressive, violent, and irrational Islam: "By definition, secularism is associated with reason, freedom, and women's rights, Islam with a culture of oppression and terror" (p. 3). However, the historical genealogy of secularism traced by Joan Wallach Scott reveals that "*gender inequality was fundamental to the articulation of the separation of church and state that inaugurated Western modernity* […] Euro-Atlantic modernity entailed a new order of *women's subordination*, assigning them to a feminized familial sphere meant to complement the rational masculine realms of politics and economics" (p. 3, italics in the original).

By disentangling the meanings of the secular, which refers to "things nonreligious"; secularization, which designates the process of replacing religious authority with rationality; and secularity, which captures the modern situation of nonreligious way of life, J. W. Scott makes clear that the discourse of secularism was hierarchical from the start, and was designed to order the relation between the European and its cultural others, the past and the future, masculine and

Received 15 September 2019
Published online 5 October 2019

asmenshikov@urfu.ru

feminine. This hierarchical ordering eventually necessitated the emergence of religion as a singular phenomenon (lumping together everything non-secular) and the invention of "world religions". In the late nineteenth century during the anticlerical campaigns for the separation of organized religion from the state and for the moral autonomy of the individuals against cultural hegemony of Christianity, the term secularism was coined in England by George Holyoake, a founder of the British Central Secular Society, in 1851, while in France the word *laïcité* was first used in 1871. Thus, a set of following oppositions emerged:

> "Political" and "religious" in the nineteenth century meant the nation versus institutionalized religion (state versus church), but also the Christian nation versus the "uncivilized" and "primitive" tribes in Africa and the Ottoman lands. "Public" and "private" separated the market and politics, instrumental rationality and bureaucratic organization from home and family, spirituality, affective relationality, and sexual intimacy (p. 13).

The separation of the public with its rationality and the market with its competition, on the one hand, from the private with its personal spirituality and the family with its emotional sustenance, on the other, was reflected in the gender division between male and female domains of society: "Gender difference was inscribed in a schematic description of the world as divided into separate spheres, public and private, male and female" (p. 31). It is necessary to highlight in this context that gender relations were not subordinate to politics. On the contrary, J. W. Scott emphasizes the "mutually constitutive nature of gender and politics" (p. 25). Indeterminacy of the denaturalized and secularized politics needed certainty that would be rooted in "immutability of gender" and "in human nature and biology rather than divine law" (p. 31), whereas gender inequality was interpreted through the optics of political interests (demographic reproduction and family morality), and social laws (complementarity of genders in the division of labor). Thus, gender inequality is inseparable from the development of nation-state and capitalism.

The last chapter of the book focuses on the implications of secularism in modern society. In particular, how the criticism of Islam from the perspective of secularism reveals the underpinning asymmetries in Western societies. Subordination of women in Islam is presented primarily through the practices of veiling, and consequently, the liberation is understood as "unveiling". Human agency of Muslim women is limited in this discourse to sexual liberation, to the right to uncover their bodies, and thereby to "advertising their sexual availability, and so appealing to longstanding gender asymmetries" (p. 158). As J. W. Scott points out, "the focus on liberated sexuality (whether hetero- or homosexual) echoes with the notion of consumer desire as the motor of the market and serves to draw attention away from the economic and social disadvantages that result from discrimination and structured forms of inequality" (p. 159). The equation of freedom with ability to pursue sexual desire occludes the persistent inequalities (wage disparity, glass ceiling, domestic violence, etc.):

> Humans are the subjects and objects of desire, at once consumers and commodities, naturalized as such. The collapse of the distinction between public and private, the entry into the public arena of the formerly private feelings and practices of sex does not necessarily politicize sex […] the idea that sex itself is natural (and so presocial) is depoliticizing (p. 177).

So, in their struggle against gender oppressive Islam the Western societies demonstrate that today we too often limit the individual freedom to consumer freedom, and the liberation to sexual liberation. Thus, echoing Foucault, J. W. Scott reminds us that in our historical deconstruction of emancipation it is not only the positive ideal that mattered but also "the point was a negative one: to be emancipated from sex, not to be defined by it" (p. 162).

Finally, it is worth keeping in mind that secular self is in no way more "natural" than any other, and it equally

> means a set of bodily practices to be learned, rehearsed and performed, ranging from ways of dressing (and undressing), talking and socializing with men to enacting in public. The habitations of the secular are not transmitted "naturally" and implicitly, but on the contrary become part of a project of modernity and politics of self that require [for those coming from outside] assimilation and "acculturation" to Western culture (p. 164).

Although the author planned to "revisit a large body of literature written by second wave feminists, as well as by historians of religion, race, and colonialism" and to "synthesize this work and offer new interpretations based upon it" (p. 3) rather than offer an analysis of new empirical material, the book will be useful to historians, as well as to political philosophers, and specialists in Religious Studies.

Changing Societies & Personalities, 2019
Vol. 3, No. 3, pp. 276–280

ETHICAL CODE

FOR JOURNAL EDITORS

We ask all journal editors to make every reasonable effort to adhere to the following ethical code for *Changing Societies & Personalities* journal articles that are worthy of peer review:

- Journal editors should be accountable for everything published in their journals meaning that they should strive to meet the needs of readers and authors; strive to constantly improve their journal; have processes in place to assure the quality of the material they publish; champion freedom of expression; maintain the integrity of the academic record; preclude business needs from compromising intellectual and ethical standards; always be willing to publish corrections, clarifications, retractions and apologies when needed.
- Journal editors should give unbiased consideration to each manuscript submitted for consideration for publication, and should judge each on its merits, without regard to race, religion, nationality, sex, seniority, or institutional affiliation of the author(s).
- Journal editors' decisions to accept or reject a paper for publication should be based on the paper's importance, originality and clarity, and the study's validity and its relevance to the remit of the journal. Editors should not reverse decisions to accept submissions unless serious problems are identified with the submission.
- Journal editors must ensure that all published reports and reviews of research have been reviewed by suitably qualified reviewers (including statistical review where appropriate), and ensure that non-peer-reviewed sections of their journal are clearly identified.
- Journal editors must keep the peer-review process confidential. The editor and any editorial staff of the journal must not disclose any information about a submitted manuscript to anyone other than the corresponding author, reviewers, potential reviewers, other editorial advisers, and the publisher, as appropriate.

- If a journal editor receives a claim that a submitted article is under consideration elsewhere or has already been published, then he or she has a duty to investigate the matter with CS&P Editorial Board.
- An editor should take reasonably responsive measures when ethical complaints have been presented concerning a submitted manuscript or published paper. Such measures will generally include contacting the author of the manuscript or paper and giving due consideration of the respective complaint or claims made.
- Journal editors may reject a submitted manuscript without resort to formal peer review if they consider the manuscript to be inappropriate for the journal and outside its scope.
- Journal editors should make all reasonable effort to process submitted manuscripts in an efficient and timely manner.
- Journal editors should arrange for responsibility of the peer review of any original research article authored by themselves to be delegated to a member of the CS&P Editorial Board as appropriate.
- If a journal editor is presented with convincing evidence that the main substance or conclusions of an article published in the journal are erroneous, then, in consultation with CS&P Editorial Board, the journal editor should facilitate publication of an appropriate corrigendum or erratum.
- Editor should refrain herself (himself) (i.e. should ask a co-editor, associate editor or other member of the editorial board instead to review and consider) from considering manuscripts, in which they have conflicts of interest resulting from competitive, collaborative, or other relationships or connections with any of the authors, companies, or (possibly) institutions connected to the papers.
- Any data or analysis presented in a submitted manuscript should not be used in a journal editor's own research except with the consent of the author. Privileged information or ideas obtained through peer review must be kept confidential and not used for personal advantage.
- Editors should be alert to intellectual property issues and work with their publisher to handle potential breaches of intellectual property laws and conventions.
- Journal editors should make decisions on which articles to publish based on quality and suitability for the journal and without interference from the journal owner/publisher.

FOR AUTHORS

We expect all authors submitting to *Changing Societies & Personalities* journal to adhere to the following ethical code:

- All authors must warrant that their article is their own original work, which does not infringe the intellectual property rights of any other person or entity, and cannot be construed as plagiarizing any other published work, including their own previously published work. Plagiarism takes many forms, from 'passing off' another's paper as the author's own paper, to copying or paraphrasing substantial parts of another's paper (without attribution), to claiming results from research conducted by others. Plagiarism in all its forms constitutes unethical publishing behavior and is unacceptable.
- All authors named on the paper are equally held accountable for the content of a submitted manuscript or published paper. All persons who have made significant scientific or literary contributions to the work reported should be named as co-authors. The corresponding author must ensure all named co-authors consent to publication and to being named as a co-author. Where there are others who have participated in certain substantive aspects of the research project, they should be acknowledged or listed as contributors.
- Authors must not submit a manuscript to more than one journal simultaneously. An author should not in general publish manuscripts describing essentially the same research in more than one journal of primary publication. Authors should not submit previously published work, nor work, which is based in substance on previously published work, either in part or whole.
- Authors must appropriately cite all relevant publications. The authors should ensure that they have written entirely original works, and if the authors have used.
- the work and/or words of others, this has been appropriately cited or quoted. Information obtained privately, as in conversation, correspondence, or discussion with third parties, should not be used or reported in the author's work unless fully cited, and with the permission of that third party.
- If required, authors must facilitate access to data sets described in the article. a paper should contain sufficient detail and references to permit others to replicate the work.
- Authors must declare any potential conflict of interest – be it professional or financial – which could be held to arise with respect to the article. All authors should disclose in their manuscript any financial or other substantive conflict

of interest that might be construed to influence the results or interpretation of their manuscript.

- Authors must avoid making defamatory statements in submitted articles, which could be construed as impugning any person's reputation.

FOR PEER REVIEWERS

We ask all peer reviewers to make every reasonable effort to adhere to the following ethical code for *Changing Societies & Personalities* journal articles they have agreed to review:

- Reviewers must give unbiased consideration to each manuscript submitted for consideration for publication, and should judge each on its merits, without regard to race, religion, nationality, sex, seniority, or institutional affiliation of the author(s).
- Reviewers should declare any potential conflict of interest interests (which may, for example, be personal, financial, intellectual, professional, political or religious) prior to agreeing to review a manuscript including any relationship with the author that may potentially bias their review.
- Reviewers must keep the peer review process confidential; information or correspondence about a manuscript should not be shared with anyone outside of the peer review process.
- Reviewers should provide a constructive, comprehensive, evidenced, and appropriately substantial peer review report, and provide feedback that will help the authors to improve their manuscript. Reviewers should express their views clearly with supporting arguments and make clear, which suggested additional investigations are essential to support claims made in the manuscript under consideration, and which will just strengthen or extend the work. Reviewers must ensure that their comments and recommendations for the editor are consistent with their report for the authors.
- Reviewers must be objective in their reviews, refraining from being hostile or inflammatory. Reviewers must avoid making statements in their report, which might be construed as impugning any person's reputation. Personal criticism of the author is inappropriate.
- Reviewers must be aware of the sensitivities surrounding language issues that are due to the authors writing in a language that is not their own, and phrase the feedback appropriately and with due respect.
- Reviewer must not suggest that authors include citations to the reviewer's (or their associates') work merely to increase the reviewer's (or their associates') citation count or to enhance the visibility of their or their

associates' work; suggestions must be based on valid academic or technological reasons.

- Any selected reviewer who feels unqualified to review the research reported in a manuscript should notify the editor and excuse himself from the review process.
- Reviewers should make all reasonable effort to submit their report and recommendation in a timely manner, informing the editor if this is not possible.
- Reviewers should identify relevant published work that has not been cited by the authors. Any statement that an observation, derivation, or argument had been previously reported should be accompanied by the relevant citation. Reviewers should call to the journal editor's attention any significant similarity between the manuscript under consideration and any published paper or submitted manuscripts, of which they are aware.
- Unpublished materials disclosed in a submitted manuscript must not be used in a reviewer's own research without the express written consent of the author. Privileged information or ideas obtained through peer review must be kept confidential and not used for personal advantage.

Changing Societies & Personalities, 2019
Vol. 3, No. 3, pp. 281–292

INSTRUCTION FOR AUTHORS

Thank you for choosing to submit your paper to us. These instructions will ensure we have everything required so your paper can move through peer review, production and publication smoothly. Please take the time to read and follow them as closely as possible, as doing so will ensure your paper matches the journal's requirements.

Use these instructions if you are preparing a manuscript to submit to *Changing Societies & Personalities*. To explore our journal portfolio, visit https://changing-sp.com

Changing Societies & Personalities considers all manuscripts on the strict condition that:

1. the manuscript is your own original work, and does not duplicate any other previously published work, including your own previously published work;
2. the manuscript has been submitted only to *Changing Societies & Personalities*; it is not under consideration or peer review or accepted for publication or in press or published elsewhere;
3. the manuscript contains nothing that is abusive, defamatory, libelous, obscene, fraudulent, or illegal.

By submitting your manuscript to *Changing Societies & Personalities* you are agreeing to any necessary originality checks your manuscript may have to undergo during the peer-review and production processes.

Manuscript preparation

1. General guidelines

Description of the journal's reference style

All authors must submit articles written in good English using correct grammar, punctuation and vocabulary. If authors are non-native English speakers or writers, may, if possible to have their submissions proofread by a native English speaker before submitting their article for consideration.

Please use double quotation marks, except where "a quotation is 'within' a quotation". Long quotations of words or more should be indented with quotation marks.

A typical manuscript is from 6000 to 8000 words including tables, references, captions, footnotes and endnotes. Review articles will not exceed

4000 words, and book reviews – 1500 words. Manuscripts that greatly exceed this will be critically reviewed with respect to length.

Manuscripts should be compiled in the following order: title page (including Acknowledgements as well as Funding and grant-awarding bodies); abstract; keywords; main text; acknowledgements; references; appendices (as appropriate); table(s) with caption(s) (on individual pages); figure caption(s) (as a list).

Abstracts of 150–200 words are required for all manuscripts submitted.

Each manuscript should have 5 to 10 keywords.

Section headings should be concise.

All authors of a manuscript should include their full names, affiliations, postal addresses, telephone numbers and email addresses on the cover page of the manuscript. One author should be identified as the corresponding author. Please give the affiliation where the research was conducted. If any of the named co-authors moves affiliation during the peer review process, the new affiliation can be given as a footnote. Please note that no changes to affiliation can be made after the manuscript is accepted. Please note that the email address of the corresponding author will normally be displayed in the published article and the online version.

All persons who have a reasonable claim to authorship must be named in the manuscript as co-authors; the corresponding author must be authorized by all co-authors to act as an agent on their behalf in all matters pertaining to publication of the manuscript, and the order of names should be agreed by all authors.

Please supply a short biographical note for each author.

Please supply all details required by any funding and grant-awarding bodies as an Acknowledgement on the title page of the manuscript, in a separate paragraph, as follows:

For single agency grants: “This work was supported by the [Funding Agency] under Grant [number xxxx].”

For multiple agency grants: “This work was supported by the [Funding Agency 1] under Grant [number xxxx]; [Funding Agency 2] under Grant [number xxxx]; and [Funding Agency 3] under Grant [number xxxx].”

For all manuscripts non-discriminatory language is mandatory. Sexist or racist terms must not be used.

2. Style guidelines

Font:	Helvetica, “Helvetica Neue” or Calibri, Sans-Serif, 12 point. Use margins of at least 2.5 cm (1 inch).
Title:	Use bold for your article title, with an initial capital letter for any proper nouns.
Authors’ names:	Give the names of all contributing authors on the title page exactly as you wish them to appear in the published article.

Affiliations:	List the affiliation of each author (department, university, city, country).
Correspondence details:	Please provide an institutional email address for the corresponding author. Full postal details are also needed by the publisher, but will not necessarily be published.
Anonymity for peer review:	Ensure your identity and that of your co-authors is not revealed in the text of your article or in your manuscript files when submitting the manuscript for review.
Abstract:	Indicate the abstract paragraph with a heading or by reducing the font size.
Keywords:	Please provide five to ten keywords to help readers find your article.
Headings:	Please indicate the level of the section headings in your article: • First-level headings (e.g. Introduction, Conclusion) should be in bold, with an initial capital letter for any proper nouns. • Second-level headings should be in bold italics, with an initial capital letter for any proper nouns. • Third-level headings should be in italics, with an initial capital letter for any proper nouns. • Fourth-level headings should also be in italics, at the beginning of a paragraph. The text follows immediately after a full stop (full point) or other punctuation mark.
Tables and figures:	Indicate in the text where the tables and figures should appear, or example by inserting [Table 1 near here]. The actual tables and figures should be supplied either at the end of the text or in a separate file as requested by the Editor.

If your article is accepted for publication, it will be copy-edited and typeset in the correct style for the journal.

Foreign words and all titles of books or plays appearing within the text should be italicized. Non-Anglophone or transliterated words should also appear with translations provided in square brackets the first time they appear (e. g. weltanschauung [world-view]).

If acronyms are employed (e. g. the BUF), the full name should also be given the first time they appear.

If you have any queries, please contact us at https://changing-sp.com/ojs/index.php/csp/about/contact

Description of the journal's reference style

CHANGING SOCIETIES & PERSONALITIES STANDARD REFERENCE STYLE: ***APA***

APA (*American Psychological Association*) references are widely used in the social sciences, education, engineering and business. For detailed information, please see the *Publication Manual of the American Psychological Association*, 6th edition, http://www.apastyle.org/ and http://blog.apastyle.org/

In the text:	
Placement	References are cited in the text by the author's surname, the publication date of the work cited, and a page number if necessary. Full details are given in the reference list. Place them at the appropriate point in the text. If they appear within parenthetical material, put the year within commas: (see Table 3 of National Institute of Mental Health, 2012, for more details)
Within the same Parentheses	Order alphabetically and then by year for repeated authors, with in-press citations last. Separate references by different authors with a semi-colon.
Repeat mentions in the same paragraph	If name and year are in parentheses, include the year in subsequent citations.
With a quotation	This is the text, and Smith (2012) says "quoted text" (p. 1), which supports my argument. This is the text, and this is supported by "quoted text" (Smith, 2012, p. 1). This is a displayed quotation. (Smith, 2012, p. 1)
Page number	(Smith, 2012, p. 6)
One author	Smith (2012) or (Smith, 2012)
Two authors	Smith and Jones (2012) or (Smith & Jones, 2012)
Three to five authors	At first mention: Smith, Jones, Khan, Patel, and Chen (2012) or (Smith, Jones, Khan, Patel, & Chen, 2012) At subsequent mentions: Smith et al. (2012) or (Smith et al., 2012) In cases where two or more references would shorten to the same form, retain all three names.
Six or more authors	Smith et al. (2012) (Smith et al., 2012)
Authors with same surname	G. Smith (2012) and F. Smith (2008) G. Smith (2012) and F. Smith (2012)

No author	Cite first few words of title (in quotation marks or italics depending on journal style for that type of work), plus the year: (“Study Finds”, 2007) If anonymous, put (Anonymous, 2012).
Groups of authors that would shorten to the same form	Cite the surnames of the first author and as many others as necessary to distinguish the two references, followed by comma and et al.
Organization as author	The name of an organization can be spelled out each time it appears in the text or you can spell it out only the first time and abbreviate it after that. The guiding rule is that the reader should be able to find it in the reference list easily. National Institute of Mental Health (NIMH, 2012) or (National Institute of Mental Health [NIMH], 2012) University of Oxford (2012) or (University of Oxford, 2012)
Author with two works in the same year	Put a, b, c after the year (Chen, 2011a, 2011b, in press-a)
Secondary source	When it is not possible to see an original document, cite the source of your information on it; do not cite the original assuming that the secondary source is correct. Smith's diary (as cited in Khan, 2012)
Classical work	References to classical works such as the Bible and the Qur’an are cited only in the text. Reference list entry is not required. Cite year of translation (Aristotle, trans. 1931) or the version you read: Bible (King James Version).
Personal communication	References to personal communications are cited only in the text: A. Colleague (personal communication, April 12, 2011)
Unknown date	(Author, n.d.)
Two dates	(Author, 1959–1963) Author (1890/1983)
Notes	Endnotes should be kept to a minimum. Any references cited in notes should be included in the reference list.
Tables and figures	Put reference in the footnote or legend

Reference list	
Order	Your reference list should appear at the end of your paper. It provides the information necessary for a reader to locate and retrieve any source you cite in the body of the paper. Each source you cite in the paper must appear in your reference list; likewise, each entry in the reference list must be cited in your text. Alphabetical letter by letter, by surname of first author followed by initials. References by the same single author are ordered by date, from oldest to most recent. References by more than one author with the same first author are ordered after all references by the first author alone, by surname of second author, or if they are the same, the third author, and so on. References by the same author with the same date are arranged alphabetically by title excluding 'A' or 'The', unless they are parts of a series, in which case order them by part number. Put a lower-case letter after the year: Smith, J. (2012a). Smith, J. (2012b). For organizations or groups, alphabetize by the first significant word of their name. If there is no author, put the title in the author position and alphabetize by the first significant word.
Form of author name	Use the authors' surnames and initials unless you have two authors with the same surname and initial, in which case the full name can be given: Smith, J. [Jane]. (2012). Smith, J. [Joel]. (2012). If a first name includes a hyphen, add a full stop (period) after each letter: Jones, J.-P.
Book	
One author	Author, A. A. (2012). *This is a Book Title: and Subtitle*. Abingdon: Routledge.
Two authors	Author, A. A., & Author, B. B. (2012). *This is a Book Title: and Subtitle*. Abingdon: Routledge
Three authors	Author, A. A., Author, B. B., & Author, C. C. (2012). *This is a Book Title: and Subtitle*. Abingdon: Routledge.

More authors	Include all names up to seven. If there are more than seven authors, list the first six with an ellipsis before the last. Author, M., Author, B., Author, E., Author, G., Author, D., Author, R., … Author, P. (2001).
Organization as author	American Psychological Association. (2003). *Book Title: and Subtitle*. Abingdon: Routledge.
No author	*Merriam Webster's Collegiate Dictionary* (10th ed.). (1993). Springfield, MA: Merriam-Webster.
Chapter	Author, A. A. (2012). This is a chapter. In J. J. Editor (Ed.), *Book Title: And Subtitle* (pp. 300–316). Abingdon: Routledge. Author, A. A. (2012). This is a chapter. In J. J. Editor & B. B. Editor (Eds.), *Book Title: and Subtitle* (pp. 300–316). Abingdon: Routledge. Author, A. A. (2012). This is a chapter. In J.J. Editor, P. P. Editor, & B. B. Editor (Eds.), *Book Title: And Subtitle* (pp. 300–316). Abingdon: Routledge.
Edited	Editor, J. J. (Ed.). (2012). *Book Title: And Subtitle*. Abingdon: Routledge. Editor, J. J., Editor, A. A., & Editor, P. P. (Eds.). (2012). *Book Title: And Subtitle*. Abingdon: Routledge. Editor, J. J., & Editor, P. P. (Eds.). (2012). *Edited Online Book: And Subtitle*. Retrieved from https://www.w3.org
Edition	Author, A. A. (2012). *Book Title: And Subtitle* (4th ed.). Abingdon: Routledge.
Translated	Author, J. J. (2012). *Book Title: And Subtitle*. (L. Khan, Trans.). Abingdon: Routledge.
Not in English	Piaget, J., & Inhelder, B. (1951). *La Genèse de L'idée de Hasard Chez L'enfant* [The origin of the idea of chance in the child]. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France. For transliteration of Cyrillic letters please use the links: ALA-LC Romanization Tables at the web-site of The Library of Congress http://www.loc.gov/catdir/cpso/roman.html
Online	Author, A. A. (2012). *Title of Work: Subtitle* [Adobe Digital Editions version]. Retrieved from https://www.w3.org

Place of publication	Always list the city, and include the two-letter state abbreviation for US publishers. There is no need to include the country name: New York, NY: McGraw-Hill Washington, DC: Author Newbury Park, CA: Sage Pretoria: Unisa Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press Abingdon: Routledge If the publisher is a university and the name of the state is included in the name of the university, do not repeat the state in the publisher location: Santa Cruz: University of California Press Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press
Publisher	Give the name in as brief a form as possible. Omit terms such as 'Publishers', 'Co.', 'Inc.', but retain the words 'Books' and 'Press'. If two or more publishers are given, give the location listed first or the location of the publisher's home office. When the author and publisher are identical, use the word Author as the name of the publisher.
Multivolume works	
Multiple volumes from a multivolume work	Levison, D., & Ember, M. (Eds). (1996). *Encyclopedia of Cultural Anthropology* (Vols. 1–4). New York, NY: Henry Holt. Use Vol. for a single volume and Vols. for multiple volumes. In text, use (Levison & Ember, 1996).
A single volume from a multivolume work	Nash, M. (1993). Malay. In P. Hockings (Ed.), *Encyclopedia of World Cultures* (Vol. 5, pp. 174–176). New York, NY: G.K. Hall. In text, use (Nash, 1993).
Journal	
One author	Author, A. A. (2011). Title of Article. *Title of Journal*, 22, 123–231. doi:xx.xxxxxxxxxx Provide the issue number ONLY if each issue of the journal begins on page 1. In such cases it goes in parentheses: Journal, 8(1), pp–pp. Page numbers should always be provided.

	If there is no DOI and the reference was retrieved from an online database, give the database name and accession number or the database URL (no retrieval date is needed): Author, A. A. (2011). Title of Article. *Title of Journal*, 22, 123–231. Retrieved from https://www.w3.org If there is no DOI and the reference was retrieved from a journal homepage, give the full URL or site's homepage URL: Author, A. A. (2011). Title of Article. *Title of Journal*, 22, 123–231. Retrieved from https://www.w3.org
Two authors	Author, A. A., & Author, B. B. (2004). Title of Article. *Title of Journal*, 22, 123–231. doi:xx.xxxxxxxxxx
Three authors	Author, A. A., Author, B. B., & Author, C. C. (1987). Title of Article. *Title of Journal*, 22, 123–231. doi:xx.xxxxxxxxxx
More authors	Include all names up to seven. If there are more than seven authors, list the first six with an ellipsis before the last. Author, M., Author, B., Author, E., Author, G., Author, D., Author, R., …, Author, P. (2001).
Organization as author	American Psychological Association. (2003). Title of Article: and subtitle. *Title of Journal*, 2, 12–23. doi:xx.xxxxxxxxxx
No author	Editorial: Title of editorial. [Editorial]. (2012). *Journal Title*, 14, 1–2.
Not in English	If the original version is used as the source, cite the original version. Use diacritical marks and capital letters for the original language if needed. If the English translation is used as the source, cite the English translation. Give the English title without brackets. Titles not in English must be translated into English and put in square brackets. Author, M. (2000). Title in German: Subtitle of Article [Title in English: Subtitle of Article]. *Journal in German*, 21, 208–217. doi:xx.xxxxxxxxxx Author, P. (2000). Title in French [Title in English: Subtitle of Article]. *Journal in French*, 21, 208–217. doi:xx.xxxxxxxxxx For transliteration of Cyrillic letters please use the links: ALA-LC Romanization Tables at the web-site of The Library of Congress http://www.loc.gov/catdir/cpso/roman.html

Peer-reviewed article published online ahead of the issue	Author, A. A., & Author, B. B. (2012). Article title. *Title of Journal*. Advance online publication. doi:xx.xxxxxxxxx If you can update the reference before publication, do so.
Supplemental material	If you are citing supplemental material, which is only available online, include a description of the contents in brackets following the title. [Audio podcast] [Letter to the editor]
Other article types	Editorial: Title of editorial. [Editorial]. (2012). *Title of Journal*, 14, 1–2. Author, A. A. (2010). Title of review. [Review of the book Title of book, by B. Book Author]. *Title of Journal*, 22, 123–231. doi:xx.xxxxxxxxxx
Article in journal supplement	Author, A. A. (2004). Article title. *Title of Journal*, 42(Suppl. 2), xx–xx. doi:xx.xxxxxxxxxx
Conference	
Proceedings	To cite published proceedings from a book, use book format or chapter format. To cite regularly published proceedings, use journal format.
Paper	Presenter, A. A. (2012, February). Title of paper. *Paper Presented at the Meeting of Organization Name*, Location.
Poster	Presenter, A. A. (2012, February). Title of poster. *Poster Session Presented at the Meeting of Organization Name*, Location
Thesis	Author, A. A. (2012). *Title of Thesis* (Unpublished doctoral dissertation or master's thesis). Name of Institution, Location.
Unpublished work	
Manuscript	Author, A. A., Author, B. B., & Author, C. C. (2008). *Title of Manuscript*. Unpublished manuscript. Author, A. A., Author, B. B., & Author, C. C. (2012). *Title of Manuscript*. Manuscript submitted for publication.
Forthcoming article	Author, A. A., Author, B. B., & Author, C. C. (in press). Title of article. *Title of Journal*. doi:xx.xxxxxxxxx
Forthcoming book	Author, A. A. (in press). *Book Title: Subtitle*.
Internet	
Website	When citing an entire website, it is sufficient just to give the address of the site in the text. *The BBC* (https://www.bbc.co.uk).
Web page	If the format is out of the ordinary (e.g. lecture notes), add a description in brackets. Author, A. (2011). Title of document [Format description]. Retrieved from http://URL

Newspaper or magazine	Author, A. (2012, January 12). Title of Article. *The Sunday Times*, p. 1. Author, A. (2012, January 12). Title of Article. *The Sunday Times*. Retrieved from http://www.sundaytimes.com Title of Article. (2012, January 12). *The Sunday Times*. Retrieved from http://www.sundaytimes.com/xxxx.html
Reports	
May or may not be peer-reviewed; may or may not be published. Format as a book reference.	Author, A. A. (2012). *Title of work* (Report No. 123). Location: Publisher. Author, A. A. (2012). Title of work (Report No. 123). Retrieved from *Name website*: https://www.w3.org
Working paper	Author, A. A. (2012). *Title of work* (Working Paper No. 123). Location: Publisher. Author, A. A. (2012). Title of work (Working Paper No. 123). Retrieved from *Name website*: https://www.w3.org
Discussion paper	Author, A. A. (2012). *Title of work* (Discussion Paper No. 123). Location: Publisher. Author, A. A. (2012). Title of work (Discussion Paper No. 123). Retrieved from *Name website*: https://www.w3.org
Personal communication	Personal communication includes letters, emails, memos, messages from discussion groups and electronic bulletin boards, personal interviews. Cite these only in the text. Include references for archived material only.
Other reference types	
Patent	Cho, S. T. (2005). U.S. Patent No. 6,980,855. Washington, DC: U.S. Patent and Trademark Office.
Map	London Mapping Co. (Cartographer). (1960). Street map. [Map]. Retrieved from http://www.londonmapping.co.uk/maps/xxxxx.pdf
Act	*Mental Health Systems Act*, 41 U.S.C. § 9403 (1988).
Audio and visual media	Taupin, B. (1975). Someone saved my life tonight [Recorded by Elton John]. On Captain fantastic and the brown dirt cowboy [CD]. London: Big Pig Music Limited. Author, A. (Producer). (2009, December 2). *Title of Podcast* [Audio podcast]. Retrieved from *Name website*: https://www.w3.org Producer, P. P. (Producer), & Director, D. D. (Director). (Date of publication). *Title of Motion Picture* [Motion picture]. Country of origin: Studio or distributor. Smith, A. (Writer), & Miller, R. (Director). (1989). Title of episode [Television series episode]. In A. Green (Executive Producer), Series. New York, NY: WNET.

	Miller, R. (Producer). (1989). The mind [Television series]. New York, NY: WNET.
Database	Author, A. A., Author, B. B., & Author, A. A. (2002). A study of enjoyment of peas. *Journal Title*, 8(3). Retrieved February 20, 2003, from the PsycARTICLES database.
Dataset	Author. (2011). *National Statistics Office Monthly Means and other Derived Variables* [Data set]. Retrieved March 6, 2011, from *Name website*: https://www.w3.org If the dataset is updated regularly, use the year of retrieval in the reference, and using the retrieval date is also recommended.
Computer program	Rightsholder, A. A. (2010). *Title of Program* (Version number) [Description of form]. Location: Name of producer. Name of software (Version Number) [Computer software]. Location: Publisher. If the program can be downloaded or ordered from a website, give this information in place of the publication information.

3. Figures

Please provide the highest quality figure format possible. Please be sure that all imported scanned material is scanned at the appropriate resolution: 1200 dpi for line art, 600 dpi for grayscale and 300 dpi for color.

Figures must be saved separate to text. Please do not embed figures in the manuscript file.

Files should be saved as one of the following formats: TIFF (tagged image file format), PNG (portable network graphics) or JPEG (also JPG).

Each file should be no larger than 1 megabyte, the total size of all files attached to one article should not be more than 20 megabytes.

All figures must be numbered in the order, in which they appear in the manuscript (e.g. Figure 1, Figure 2). In multi-part figures, each part should be labelled (e.g. Figure 1(a), Figure 1(b)).

Figure captions must be saved separately, as part of the file containing the complete text of the manuscript, and numbered correspondingly.

The filename for a graphic should be descriptive of the graphic, e.g. Figure 1, Figure 2a.

ISSN онлайн-версии: 2587-8964
ISSN печатной версии: 2587-6104

Изменяющиеся общества и личности

2019. Том 3, № 3

Печатается ежеквартально

Основан в 2016 г.

Учредитель и издатель:
Федеральное государственное автономное образовательное учреждение высшего профессионального образования «Уральский федеральный университет имени первого Президента России Б. Н. Ельцина» (УрФУ)

Адрес:
Россия, Екатеринбург, 620002, ул. Мира, 19

Главный редактор:
Елена Алексеевна Степанова

Адрес редакции:
Россия, Екатеринбург, 620000, пр. Ленина, 51, к. 240.
Телефон: +7 (343) 389-9412
Электронная почта: editor@changing-sp.com
Сайт: https://changing-sp.com

Журнал зарегистрирован Федеральной службой по надзору в сфере связи, информационных технологий и массовых коммуникаций, Свидетельство о регистрации: ПИ № ФС77-65509 от 4 мая 2016 г.

Научное издание

Changing Societies & Personalities

Vol. 3, No. 3, 2019

Дизайн *А. Борбунов*
Технический редактор *Т. Лоскутова*
Компьютерная верстка *Т. Лоскутова*

Дата выхода в свет 05.10.2019.
Формат 70 × 100 100/16. Бумага офсетная.
Гарнитура Helvetica.
Уч.-изд. л. 7,0. Тираж 300 экз. Заказ № 369.

Publisher – Ural Federal University
Publishing Centre
4, Turgenev St., 620000 Yekaterinburg, Russia
Phone: +7 343 350 56 64, +7 343 350 90 13
Fax: +7 343 358 93 06
E-mail: press-urfu@mail.ru

Издательство Уральского университета
620000, г. Екатеринбург, ул. Тургенева, 4

Отпечатано в Издательско-полиграфическом центре УрФУ.
620000, г. Екатеринбург, ул. Тургенева, 4
Тел.: +7 (343) 389-94-76, 350-90-13
Факс: +7 (343) 358-93-06
E-mail: press-urfu@mail.ru
www.print.urfu.ru

Распространяется бесплатно